

**Mediating Performance through 3D Holography:
Performativity in Indian Electoral Campaigns**

**A THESIS SUBMITTED DURING THE YEAR 2019 TO THE UNIVERSITY OF
HYDERABAD FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY IN THE
DEPARTMENT OF THEATRE ARTS**

**BY
ABHEESH S S**



**Department of Theatre Arts
Sarojini Naidu School of Arts and Communication
University of Hyderabad
Hyderabad-500046
April 2019**



DEPARTMENT OF THEATRE ARTS
SAROJINI NAIDU SCHOOL OF ARTS AND COMMUNICATION
UNIVERSITY OF HYDERABAD
HYDERABAD - 500 046

.....

DECLARATION BY THE CANDIDATE

I hereby declare that the work embodied in the present thesis entitled “**Mediating Performance through 3D Holography: Performativity in Indian Electoral Campaigns**” is an original research work submitted by me under the supervision of Prof. B Ananthakrishnan for the award of Doctor of Philosophy in the Department of Theatre Arts from University of Hyderabad. I declare to the best of my knowledge that no part of this thesis is earlier submitted for award of any research degree in part or full to any for any other University or Institution, and that the thesis is plagiarism free. I hereby agree that my thesis can be deposited in Shodhganga/INFLIBNET.

A Report on plagiarism statistics from the Librarian of Indira Gandhi Memorial Library of UoH is enclosed.

Date: 29-04-2019

Place: Hyderabad

(Abheesh S S)

Reg. No. 12SNPT05



CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the thesis entitled “**Mediating Performance through 3D Holography: Performativity in Indian Electoral Campaigns**” submitted by Abheesh S S bearing registration number 12SNPT05 in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy in the Sarojini Naidu School of Arts and Communication, Department of Theatre Arts is a bonafide work carried out by him under my supervision and guidance.

This thesis is free from plagiarism and has not been submitted previously in part or in full to this or any other University or Institution for award of any degree or diploma. Further, the student has the following publication (s) before submission of the thesis/monograph for adjudication and has produced evidence for the same in the form of acceptance letter or the reprint in the relevant area of his research.

1. Entangled Performativity in 3D Holographic Electoral Campaign Spaces,(Forth coming 2019) Bodhi Tree Books and Publications Trivandrum.
2. Aesthetics of Forms: Puppetry and its Production Process in Kerala, ,(Forth coming 2019) Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts, North East Regional Centre (NERC), Ministry of Culture, India.

and

has made presentation in the following conferences:

1. Is It Theatre or Other? Looking at an Interactive Performance. IFTR 2015(International)
2. Authenticity in the Time of Digital Hybridity: Critical study on Indian Theatre Pedagogy. Theatre Practice-Changing Trends,2018 .(International)

Further, the student has passed the following courses towards fulfilment of coursework requirement for Ph.D/ was exempted from doing coursework (recommended by Doctoral Committee) on the basis of the following courses passed during his MPhil program and the MPhil degree was awarded:

Course Code	Name	Credits
Pass/Fail		
1. TA 801 Research Methodology		4.00 Pass
2. TA 802 Arts and the World – Literary/Visual/Cultural Theory		4.00 Pass
3. TA 811 Performance Theory and issues in Indian Theatre		4.00 Pass
4. TA 812 Mapping the question (Exploring the topic with supervisor)		4.00 Pass

Supervisor

Head of Department

Dean of School

Acknowledgements

It is an immense pleasure to express my profound respect and a deep sense of gratitude to Prof. B. Ananthakrishnan for his constant guidance, encouragement and support, with which it would not have been possible to come out with this thesis. His innovative thoughts and dedication towards the research are highly admirable. His ability to understand and appreciate my point of view, along with his friendly disposition and encouragement has inspired me to work hard and has made my learning experience an enriched one.

I would like to thank all the members and staff of the Department of Theatre Arts, University of Hyderabad, who helped me in my research particularly Prof. N. Jnaneshwara Bhikshu, Prof Satyabrata Rout, Mr Noushad Mohamed Kunju, Mr. Riken Ngomle and Mr. Kanhiya Lal Kaithwas .I must express my gratitude to Mr Rajiv Velicheti and Prof. Vineet C P Nair (School of Computer and Information Sciences) for their support during doctoral committee meetings. I wish to express my sincere thanks to Prof. D.S.N. Murthy, his research methodology classes, Sasheej Hegde for and Dr.Sarada Natarajan for their classes. I would like to acknowledge the help of non-teaching staff, Muppala Haribabu, Sureesh and Phulsingh. I would also like to thank Dr Sruti Bala and Prof. Gay Morris for triggering questions which opened my research journey with clarity and focus and also for sharing reading materials.

I would like to thank the libraries at the University of Hyderabad, National School of Drama, Sangeet Natak Akademi and Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi, Indira Gandhi National Center for Arts, New Delhi, Max Muller Bhawan- Goethe Institute ,New Delhi ,Freie University , Berlin, TU and UdK, Berlin and Janakeeya Vayanasala ,Ponkunnam which provided me information and spaces during this research

I express my thanks to 'UK-India Education and Research Initiative' (UKIERI) between University of Hyderabad and University of Arts, London for giving the support and opportunity to participate in the performance production process in digital realm during August to September, 2014 in London. I express my thanks to Prof. Jane Collins for the energetic engagement in the area of contemporary digital performance practices and theory. I also remember affectionately the travel with her to my dream place 'Charleston Farmhouse and Monk's House where Virginia Woolf spent her life. I also express my thanks to Prof .Simon Betts for the valuable discussion on art and technology.

I express my thanks to the International Research Center, “Interweaving Performance Culture” under Freie University, Berlin, Germany for giving one year doctoral fellowship and support from October 2016 to September 2017 which changed my critical and creative life. I express my sincere gratitude to Prof. Erika Fischer –Lichte, the Director of the Centre, who guided me during colloquiums, talks and personal discussions. Such interactions gave focus to my work and her critical inputs were valuable for a beginner like me in the field of performance. I thank Prof. Gabriele Brandstetter, Prof. Matthias Warstat, Dr Christel Weiler for their inputs and new perspectives on aesthetics and academic research. Thank You, Prof. Klaus-Peter Köpping, for colloquiums and discussions. I would like to express my thanks and love to Dr Torsten Jost , Astrid Schenka, Holger Hartung , Claudia Daseking, Saskya Jain, Stefan Donath, Milos Kotic, Antje Paul, Florian Thamer, Omid Soltani and Xin Wang for their support .

I would like to express my gratitude to the scholars in Berlin. I thank Prof Arjun Appaduri and family, Prof Chetana Nagavarjara, Prof James Harding, Prof. Khalid Amin, Koffi Koko, Navtej Johar and Dr Ameet Parameswaran. I express my love and regards to Dr Avishek Ganguly and family, Regina Eitner, Iris Rajanayagam, Kaiegratitude, for their hospitality and Prof. Santhosh Kumar for his companionship and valuable research inputs. Unavoidable thanks and love to dearest Berliners Kabi , Sagoriga, Rustam, Ting and Promona for sharing loveable moments at Berlin .

I salute and respect late Prof S Ramanaujam for guiding me through the basics of theatre and performance and showing the path to research, Prof Anuradha Kapur for being a mentor and motivating me with her artistic interventions, G Venu for his constant encouragement; Dr Abhilash Pillai for being the silent counsellor for me and Prof .M V Narayanan for directing me to research. I thank Prof. V Sanil for the enthusiastic discussions regarding art, research and philosophy. I thank Prof .Udaya Kumar for his loveable advices and patient listening and guiding me to cultivate my research approaches. I am grateful to Aniruddha Khutwad, Roshan NG, Alex Mathew, Dr. Sathya Prakash and Kirtana Thankavelu for their loveable support.

I thank Urmila Unnikrishnan, Sudha K.F for valuable notes, comments and suggestions for my thesis

I would like to thank my friends in the department, Gargi , Sujith, Shyam Prasad, Naresh, Siva, Murali, Suryam, Kajal, Chunchu Jampaiah, Rathidharan, Sai, Basheer, Rahamtulla, Rathod, Naveen, Usman, Ramamohan, and Abhimanyu for their love and support. I thank Chandu and Greeshma with adorable love, Stuart, Renny, Suresh and family for friendly

discussions, Neuiman, Jawahar, Dayal, Dheeraj, Sreelakshmi, Subin, Arpita, for sharing insights on academics, politics and culture.

I fondly remember Balagopalan, Daya Bai, Sandeep, Jijo, Dipjoyti, Abhinay, Varun, Lakshmi, Anil, Chirag, Bhaskar, Anirban and Prajeesh for sharing the creative moments.; Sooraj Nambiar , Pari, Moon Moon, Vishnu Prasad, Taniya , Bharathi Daniyella and Nagum , Abhijith, Alaka, Shijith, Afsal, Firos, Malavika, Arun Kumar , Clint, Jithin, Dr. Rajan, Jinu and Jayadevan for their love and support.

I thank Supriya and her mother for their love, support and heated discussions on performance, politics and cooking. I express my love to dearest Antz, for poking me at times with her pranks and being an academic, aesthetic and emotional companion during my journey.

I am grateful to my parents, late M S Sasidharan and S S Lakshmy, without whom, I would not have reached at this stage of my life. They have always proved to be a great source of encouragement throughout my life. I am mostly indebted to my brother Ajesh for his constant support. My sincere gratitude to my family, especially G Dileepan for his critical engagements, N M Indira for her affection and optimistic thoughts and Unnikrishnan for the support. It is impossible not to mention my second family, Madhu Master, A R Meena and my sister Ammalu .Their warmth and encouragement has been a constant strength during this period. Special thanks to my artistic family, Noushad, Nasreen, Nourin and Nameer for their beautiful love and care.

Finally, my better half and tutelage- Sreedevi, who knows my possibilities and limitations, who encouraged and supported me from the beginning, who moulded me as a critical being .Without her love and care I would not have completed this thesis.

Abheesh S S.

List of Abbreviations

OED: English Oxford Living Dictionaries

TPP: Fischer-Lichte, Erika. *Transformative Power of Performance*. Routledge, 2008.

PIPC: Fischer-Lichte, Erika., et al. *The Politics of Interweaving Performance Cultures*.
Routledge, 2014.

Performance: Carlson, Marvin. *Performance: A Critical Introduction*. Routledge, 2004.

SNA: *Sangeet Natak Academy*, New Delhi, India.

NSD: *National School of Drama*, New Delhi, India.

Contents

Introduction	01
Introduction	
Relevance of the study	
Aim	
Objectives of the study	
Research Methodology	
Primary source	
Review of the Existing Research	
Chapterisation	
Chapter One	23
3D Holographic Electoral Campaign: A Performance Analysis	
1.1: Engagement of Electoral Campaign	
1.1.1: The campaign	
1.2 : The Performance Event and its Analysis	
1.2.1: Concept and technology	
1.2.2: First phase: production.	
1.2.3: Second phase: distribution	
1.2.4: Third phase: consumption	
1.3: 3D Holography	
1.3.1: The History of Pepper’s Ghost	
1.3.2: Mapping the contradiction of ‘memory and Illusion’ in Holography.	
1.4: Conclusion	

Chapter Two

50

Materiality in Electoral Campaigns

2.1: Affect – Truth to meaning to experience

2.2: Materially

2.3: Simulation

2.4: Corporeality: Candidate body to Performance body

2.4.1: Corporeality aspects of Neo –Middle Class

2.4.2: Corporeality aspects of Hindutva

2.4.3: The corporeal aspects of Hindu Masculinity

2.5: Immaterial Labour

2.6: Scale and Value in 3D holographic electoral campaign

2.6.1: Scale in 3D holographic electoral campaign

2.6.2: Value in 3D holographic electoral campaign

2.7: Engagement of Materiality

2.8: Conclusion

Chapter Three

89

Performativity and Dramaturgy in Electoral Campaigns

3.1: Post dramatic structure in India

3.2: Performance and Performativity in public space

3.3: Dramaturgy of Collective intelligence in 3D Holography in 2012

3.3.1: Dramaturgy with Salesmanship and Branding

3.3.2: Dramaturgy with Agencies for campaign

3.3.3: Dramaturgy in visual populist time

3.4: Entertainment in 3D Holography campaigns

3.5: The Purpose Behind 2012 3D Holographic Electoral Campaign

3.6: Conclusion

Conclusion **129**

Bibliography **136**

Introduction

Through this PhD thesis, I attempt to examine the performance making process in 3D holographic electoral campaigns in India. In 2013, when I was developing the idea for research in performance in the time of globalisation, I had decided to take the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat on 10th December 2012 as my field of research. As a practitioner and researcher, it will be interesting and challenging for me to understand how the 3D holographic performance design process affects contemporary society. It was not only because the event was marked as the first simulative holographic campaign in 53 places but also because there is a need to engage with the signified use of performance and its technological aspects in the public domain. The 3D holographic electoral campaign and its later usages changed the structure of electoral campaigns thereafter.

3D holographic technology for electoral campaign was first used on 29th November 2012 in four spaces, on 3rd December 2012 in 26 spaces and on 10th December 2012 in 53 locations by the same designers' team, political party and candidate arguing it as different from the former campaigns using previous media like posters, radio, newspapers, magazines, pamphlets, telegram, telephone, television, tape recorder, channels, computer, internet, YouTube, social media, smartphones etc. The communication during 3D holographic electoral campaign in 2012 Gujarat was omnidirectional with mass circulation and viewers experienced the concepts and speech. The candidate appeared in every 53 places in 3D form and received the viewer's reaction through satellite technology. It was a high-tech holographic technique version of a nineteenth-century Victorian technique called 'Pepper's Ghost' which was used in theatre and scientific lecture performances. The usages of performance structures and contemporary version of Pepper's theatrical illusion techniques led to evolving the research questions for the thesis. The thesis goes through information,

debates and conceptual arguments on the event. This thesis examines the new ways of performance aspects of 3D holographic electoral campaign on 10th December 2012 as it points to new ways in the electoral campaigns.

The Relevance of the Study

The term performance has been articulated differently in its multiple contexts using various methods. Marvin Carlson writes on performance in his book, *Performance: A Critical Introduction*, thus; “It is a specific event with its liminoid nature foregrounded, almost invariably clearly separated from the rest of life, presented by performance and attended by audiences, both of whom regard the experience as made up material to be interpreted, to be reflected upon, to be engaged in – emotionally, mentally, and perhaps even physically” (216). Following Carlson’s argument on performance, the engagement of candidates, political campaign consultants, designers, and materials and spectators’ activities became an instance of performance and demand a detailed analysis of the event in terms of the performance concepts.

The 2012 Gujarat electoral campaign used the possibilities of high-tech mediation with the support of special technologies for a ‘successful campaign’. This thesis attempts to examine how those usages of special technologies produced a major shift in the nature of electoral campaigns in India. The study undertaken in this project is significantly different from how this would be studied within the framework of Political Science; it is done by focusing on the dimension of performance in these electoral campaigns and the ways of deployment of special technologies are read as a performance event in the history of electoral campaigns. Here, by the term performance event, I mean the particular instance of performance carried out using 3D holography in the electoral campaign as the incident. Erika Fischer-Lichte writes on ‘event’ in the book titled *Transformative Power of Performance* thus: “There no longer exists a work of art, independent of its creator and recipient; instead,

we are dealing with an *event* that involves everybody-albeit to different degrees and in different capacities” (18). Drawing from Fischer-Lichte’s idea of the event, there is the need to mark the campaign as a performance event with its invisible creators and spectators.

These technological interventions had an indirect impact on contemporary Indian performance cultures and are yet to be analysed or looked at in the disciplines of Theatre Arts and Performance Studies. Most of the scholarships argued that those campaigns produced ‘techno-hype’ in world politics and they have not addressed the performance aspects of the event. This project’s exploration is different from the Political Studies discipline. As Marvin Carlson says, that in the field of Performance Studies “many of its grounding theories, strategies and terms came from social sciences” (*Performance* 80). But there is a need to locate this using the theoretical concepts from Performance Studies and here the project looks at the performance aspects in those electoral campaigns. The influence was not analysed or studied in detail in Theatre Arts and Performance Studies. Therefore this project will analyse the performance aspects of the 2012 Gujarat 3D electoral holography campaign in detail. My research area will specifically look at the performance making processes involved in creating the event. By performance making process I mean mainly the preparatory works carried out before the final execution of 3D holographic electoral campaign which contains the theory and practice of conceptualisation, scenography, performativity and finally dramaturgy.

It is also important to note that this is not merely a technological transformation but had greater ramifications with regard to contemporary election campaign trends and on a more indirect level on Media Studies and Performance Theory and Practices. It deals with the transformation of the designing process in the contemporary electoral campaigns. The practice of designing got a major shift in the current holographic times with high-tech technology. Here the physicality of the designer and materials used are questionable because the presence of designers and technicians were invisible in the documents. This immaterial

labour produced a shift in the concept and practice of designer in the performance.

Introduction and intervention of 3D holography in the electoral campaign created new changes in contemporary electoral campaigns, media communications and in the discipline of Performance Studies and Practices.

Aim

In this PhD research project, I would like to examine the paradigm shift that happened in the dimension of performance in the Indian electoral campaign scenario. The main aim of this research is to analyse the public performances involved in electoral campaigns, with a specific focus on the performance making process of designing, thus reflecting on the impacts on contemporary performance practices and thereby contributing a new perspective to look at performance, theoretically. The key concepts that this analysis will rely on with regard to the modality of performance in these electoral campaigns are ‘engagement’, ‘materiality’, ‘immaterial labour’, ‘performativity’ and ‘dramaturgy’ in the context of the 3D holographic technology in performance. Analysis of public performance-based electoral campaigns and its designing process contribute to new perspectives on performance theory and practice. Therefore there is a need to find out ways of contradictions happened in contemporary Indian performance making process.

Objectives of the Study

The main objectives of this thesis are the following:

1. To trace the new manifestations of mediational practices involving performance and technology in Indian society.
2. To trace the transformation of collective identities to individual identity in performance making process.

3. To survey and evaluate how designers practice digital materiality in performance events.
4. To determine the performative and dramaturgical practices of 3D holographic design in Indian performance.

Research Methodology

This project employs an eclectic methodology for carrying out research, mainly drawing from archival material while using the cultural theory that looks at forms/process and dynamics of production and reception respectively. Drawing mainly from the works of Erika Fischer-Lichte, Marvin Carlson, Paolo Virno and Cathy Turner, this research project looks at the performance aspect of the electoral campaign as an event, rather than at the sociopolitical aspects of the electoral campaign.

Primary Source

- A. The documented materials of 2012 and 2014 holographic electoral campaigns.
- B. News reports and online sources.
- C. Books.

Review of the Existing Research

There are many studies related to election campaigns in Social Sciences and Media Studies. Since this research focuses on the performance aspects, the next section examines the existing literature which has significantly contributed to the area of research. This section will first trace the history of media and technology in performance from the early twentieth century to present times and then discuss the scholarships available in the area of research.

In ancient times, the transmission of knowledge occurred through different media like palm leaf, mud slate, cloth, metal, paper etc, in different parts of the world. The emergence of the printing press contributed to a democratisation of knowledge using technology, which was the monopoly of religious institutions in Europe during the Middle Ages (Kittler 244-

55). Theatre has a long and deep connection with technology since ancient times (Clifford 1999). Oxford English Dictionary defines the word ‘technology’ thus – “the application of scientific knowledge for practical purposes, especially in industry...The Greek word *tekhologia* means ‘systematic treatment’, and the word has its origin from *techne* which means ‘art, craft’ and *logia* which means ‘a subject of study or interest’”(“Technology”). From primitive times to the modernist period, artworks and performances were more connected to its ritualistic and religious aspects. In those periods the search for an idea of ‘truth’ was the prime objective of performance. Whereas in the modernist period the quest for ‘truth’ was replaced by ‘meaning’ (Tassi 185-193) and it was visible in art and performance also. In contemporary times the concept of meaning changed to engagement and experience. Theatre and Performance Studies scholar Andy Lavender has argued that when it comes to postmodernism, performances were restructured in a way to counter the notion of a fixed meaning. In his book, *Performance in the Twenty-First Century: Theatre of Engagement*, Lavender says on engagement thus: “truth turning is experienced as a feature of engagement” (Lavender 25). Twenty first-century performance goes beyond its conventional aesthetic concepts like Aristotelian poetics and the nineteenth- century realism and looks at ‘engagement’ as the main concept. Twenty first-century performance aesthetics changed with technology, politics and globalisation. Postmodernist performance critiqued the notion of meaning. ‘Being engaged’ or engagement became the main action in post-modernist performance aesthetic. The second chapter will explore more about the consequential shift from truth to meaning to experience in detail.

Before dwelling on the idea of ‘engagement’ in performance, it is essential to trace the history of the relationship between technology and performance. From early twentieth century onwards, artists, theatre directors and designers like Alfred Jarry, Adolphe Appia, Edward Gordon Craig, Filippo Tommaso Emilio Marinetti, Enrico Prampolini (Drain 11-24) ,

Allan Kaprow, Robert Wilson, Tadeusz Kantor (Drain 56-67) and Vsevolod Meyerhold (Drain 98-101) tried to explore the different possibilities of using technology and materiality in theatre. For instance, technological ways of invoking visual and sensorial experiences through film and slide projections were used by the German theatre director Erwin Piscator in Germany. His ideas of the political form of 'Epic Theatre' and politics relied on technological inventions created a new wave in theatre. His work titled *The Documentary Play* (1929) was one of the earliest works which used film projection for performance (Drain 102-107).

Berghaus writes that Eisenstein used film at *The Proletkult First Workers Theatre* and Piscator used film at theatres like *Theatre am Nollendorfplatz* in Berlin. Theatre directors like Bertolt Brecht (Drain 110-117) followed and reworked this concept of 'Epic Theatre' and Heiner Muller (Barnett 49-57), Claus Peyman (Fischer-Lichte TPP 20), Frank Castorf (Fischer-Lichte TPP 71) followed and reworked Brechtian concept of 'Epic Theatre' with different forms of technologies, bodies and texts. In 1931, Italian futurist Filippo Tommaso Marinetti used new electronic mass media based technological devices in performance. Marinetti used recorded telephonic communication for a poetry performance from London to Sprovieri Gallery, Naples on 17 May 1914. Berhaus also noted that Heyme Wolf with Hansgunther in 1979 did a production called *Hamlet* at Cologne Municipal Theatre in which film visuals were used for the first time in a way that aesthetically enhanced the experience of the theatre production (Berghaus188). Samuel Beckett's works developed new perspectives on theatre and performance in the twentieth century. Apart from theatre, Beckett's works for radio, television and film contributed to an aesthetic that relied on materiality based on technology (Connor 83).

The technological explosion happened at the beginning of the twentieth century led to innovative changes in electronic media technologies. Directly or indirectly, this development

shook the performing art forms. After the arrival of television in the twentieth century, the nineteenth century ideal of experiencing art with the masses transformed into an individuated experience in their respective homes through the new form of ‘mass communication’ and ‘broadcasting’. Raymond Williams critically writes on the transformation of viewers’ experience and its engagements with technology. Williams writes in the book, *Television Technology and Cultural Form*,

Sound, radio and television; for reasons we shall look at, were developed for transmission to *individual* homes, though there was nothing in the technology to make this inevitable. But then this new form of social communication-broadcasting – was obscured by its definition as ‘mass communication’; an abstraction to its most general characteristic, that it went to many people, ‘the masses’, which obscured the fact that the means chosen was the offer of individual sets, a method much better described by the earlier word ‘broadcasting’.(17)

This late modernistic change made a new revolt in the field of media and cultural productions. Subsequently, performance praxis also alerted its performer-spectator participation with broadcasting. OED defines ‘broadcasting’ as “The transmission of programmes or information by radio or television” (“Broadcasting”). Broadcasting invented a new form of materiality, which technologically transmitted immaterial signals in the form of electromagnetic waves. The subjects recorded or transmitted live through microphone or camera was technologically transformed to signals which were broadcasted into receiving devices like radio or television. Radio and television adapted theatre plays by capturing them with multiple microphone and cameras. Electronic media became a part and parcel of an average human being’s daily life.

In contemporary times, advanced versions of live streaming and mobile journalism (popularly known as MoJo) led to more innovations in the field of communication via broadcasting. This has created a shift with regard to the realm of theatre and performance. There are mainly two different frameworks. First one involves the performer using electronic/technological atmosphere for the staging of the performance. Second is the shift from the technologies to a search of the corporeal aspects of performer body. The structure of performance thus became hybrid with the emergence and use of advanced high-end technologies.

Theatre and performance art used media in multiple ways for experiments and those led to the formation of a new medium/language subsequently. Performance artist and Fluxus artist Nam June Paik used television, video and satellite technologies intermeshed with body, material and space for his art. In 1965, he created the first video artwork titled *Portapak* which was released by Sony Company. Nam June Paik in his show used an electronic video recorder at the Café a Go Go in New York (Berghaus 184). This was the first gallery exhibition which used a videotape for art exhibitions. Sook-Kyung Lee and Susanne Rennert archived his writings and artworks in the book edited by them titled *Nam June Paik*. In the same work, Paik's interaction with American artist and music philosopher John Cage gave him a new perspective to move into the Neo-Dada movement and to contribute Fluxus Manifesto. In 1950, Cage made *New Music* which was one of the experimental forms taken by media art. In 1951, he made *Imaginary Landscape No.4* with twelve radios (Lee and Rennert 113). Paik writes on Cage's contribution to media art with reference to *Imaginary Landscape*, thus:

The first big media art break was your "Imaginary Landscape" about Radio—it was 1952 ... John did many things, but he also discovered the beauty of short wave ... that is the beauty of destruction of technology, because it is unwanted

noise ... Until the 1952 “Imaginary Landscape”, there was electronic music, like Schaeffer, Stockhausen or even Paul Hindemith. They made electronic art music by turning turntable records fast and slow. Still that is not media art, whereas your radio piece “Imaginary Landscape” is some kind of quantum leap. You could call this media art from then ... You recognized the existence of radio waves, which existed anyway, and of the hardware called radios ... and those ephemeral things like software, not just splicing tapes...(Quoted Lee and Rennert 113)

Paik tries to show the mediated performance between borders. The performance art was technologically connected with two geographical continents. Sook-Kyung Lee writes, “Paik’s first satellite project was *Good Morning Mr. Orwell* (1984). His intention of achieving a simultaneous two-way broadcast that resembles a phone call ... For Paik, the ‘ultimate goal’ of video revolution is the establishment of space to space, or plain to plain communication without confusion and interference” (33- 34). Paik rooted for video art which is evident in his discussion on French-American artist Marcel Duchamp and video art. Paik used satellite technology for his own artworks. Paik argues how to go beyond Marcel Duchamp’s conceptual art model with the use of video art thus: “Marcel Duchamp had already done everything –except video ... only through video art can we go beyond Marcel Duchamp” (Lee and Rennert 108). This shows Paik’s passion and research on mediated performance. Paik’s artistic works became a foundational base for new media art and digital performances. Paik used reproductive media for more sensitive and creative productions. Lee and Rennert write about Paik’s thoughts on quantity and quality in the arts. He focused on creating not only beauty with television; for him, beauty was limited to quantity instead he focused on quality (115-125)

Performances which relied on electronic devices transitioned into digital technological spaces by the 1960s with more innovations in technology. Gunter Berghaus writing on video and multi-media performance notes that with the coming of electronic technology, the cost of production had become very low, thus making it more accessible than film (Berghaus 228). Computer technology was used for the first time in a solo dance performance with the support of IBM 7070, in 1964 by Paul Le Vasseur collaborated with Jeanne Hays Beaman at University of Pittsburg (Berghaus 229). Performance arts, theatre, dance and many disciplines used computer technology for aesthetic representation. In the 1980s, theatre groups like the American performance company, Wooster Group, used video for their experimental performance productions (Berghaus 188).

After video and cassette tapes, art and performance practices underwent a major shift with the arrival of the digital. OED defines the word ‘digital’ thus: “Of signals or data expressed as series of the digits 0 and 1, typically represented by values of a physical quantity such as voltage or magnetic polarization” (“Digital”). Technological encoding and decoding media like computer, music player, camera, CD-ROM, internet, database and holography started to be used for communication. From these ‘technologically reproducible’ systems, the concept of the ‘real’ shifted to the ‘hyperreal’. Berghaus discusses the virtual body in cyberspace as, “Cyberspace’s inherent immateriality promises redemption from the shackles of mundane everyday existence...When we became players in cyber space, the flesh body, our ‘home’ in the material world, is ‘parked’ in front of the computer” (243).

The material value was altered after the emergence of the virtual body in digital cyberspace, and similarly, during this period, the use of this technology in art and performance opened up enquiries on to the materialistic familiarity of the discipline. The interaction with computer generated atmosphere that changed the existence of space and performer’s body for the spectator. Performance Studies scholar Philip Auslander examines

this question of ontological existence of the 'live and mediatized' in his article, "Against Ontology: Making Distinctions between the Live and the Mediatized" (Auslander 50-55).

In this 'wearable computing' period, mechanical practices transformed to digital practices such as images, graphics, projections, new signified design formations, and equipment like LED, usages of software and holography all came into play. The 3D holographic usages marked a departure to a new aesthetic expression converged and mingled with the live, corporeal and animated body and atmosphere. From 2013 onwards Indian theatre institutions began to discuss the possibility of digital discipline. Next section looks at the discussions about theatre pedagogy in the digital age which was an important moment in the Post-colonial academic and pedagogical arena of Theatre Arts.

Under the UK-India Education Research Initiative (UKIERI) a thematic partnership happened between S N School of Arts and Communication, the University of Hyderabad and Wimbledon Arts College, the University of Art, London in September 2013. The two years long partnership discussed new and interdisciplinary approaches and practices in Indian performance pedagogy related to digital. The first section held at London titled "Scenography in a Digital Age: A Comparative Study of the Impact of New Media on Contemporary Indian and British Performance Practice" conducted a workshop and discussion on the digital realm. The second section titled "The Means of Performance in a Digital Age" held at Hyderabad in March 2014 examined the usages of digital in the discipline of Fine Arts and Theatre Arts. The section contained paper presentations from scholars and practitioners and a workshop with advanced digital technologies and their demonstrations. B. Anthakrishnan and Jane Collins write in the article, "Against a Hierarchy of Expressive Means; Arguments for New Pedagogies in Performer Education in India and the UK", about the UKIERI thematic workshop happened at the University of Hyderabad. The article discussed how the hierarchical spectrum in Performance and Visual Arts is giving way to the new perspectives

on the use of digital technologies. The fourth section happened at Hyderabad and London simultaneously in August to September 2014 focussing on a performance making process with the use of digital broadcasting technology and the concept of the process was “Cooking Apple Pie and Dal through Digital Media”. The project brought out the possibilities and limitations of two contextual approaches with digital technology in the contemporary times. This led to an open discussion on hybridity and authenticity in the digital age.

The final section titled “Theatre Pedagogy in a Digital Age: Methods, Models and Practices –A Roundtable Discussion”, from 21 to 22 March 2015 was held at IIC, New Delhi. Project co-coordinator Jane Collins started with a brief introduction and the project co-coordinator B Ananthkrishnan gave the keynote address about the theatre pedagogy in the digital age. Rajeev Velicheti discussed the concept behind the digital pedagogical approaches in the roundtable discussion.

Jonathan Pitches conversed about the area of actor training in the contemporary training systems. He described how a model called ‘performance perspective’ works in the training systems. He concluded with the suggestion that ‘we’ need to clarify our position in the history of training/practice/and product which is the performance form. His talks generated enthusiastic discussions on the body of knowledge in the digital time. Simon Betts and Kirtana Thankavelu presented one of the key observations of UKIERI workshop based on a drawing workshop done by Fine Arts students at Hyderabad in 2014. The workshop explored the experience of drawing the subject using digital technology and argued that the process of drawing was situated in the realm of haptic. The workshop raised the questions like how the overstrained and over privileged students of MFA change their natural ways of drawing to conceptual ways. Chris Blame started with the question that ‘What will happen if there is no gathering?’ His presentation focused on the area of scenic design, acting training, dramaturgy in the contemporary pedagogy. He historically analysed theatre and knowledge

systems in the nineteenth century especially the influence of ‘Stanislavskian’ ideas worked as an acting technology. M K Raina’s talks were based on his practical experiences in the academic and public activities of theatre. He argued that for making a new pedagogy for Indian subcontinent we need to study theory and practice of life and theatre of India. He underlines that possibility of digital works happen only in the classrooms. This point raised several questions in the discussion. Andy Lavender described the study programmes of University of Surrey (2011-2016) focusing on the hybrid creativity in the performing arts environment of the university, the university’s module and vibrant syllabus system and how they help to work with the capitalist systems.

On the second day, Jane Collin chaired the section which focused on how to build digital theatre pedagogy in India. Abhilash Pillai presented a paper on the changes of visual experience in the last two decades through his personal experience and analysis as a migrant living in a different parts of India, the academic study of theatre in Kerala, Delhi and London, and his work as a lecturer and theatre director at National School of Drama. The concept of ‘self-study’ in NSD created many vibrant moods in students’ exploration in the institution. He presented one of his scene works with his students, and how they designed Kashmir in the work. The assistance of digital technology changes the notion of materials in theatre from the traditional, colonial, and postcolonial times of Indian theatre. Ameet Parameswaran described the academic study program of School of Art and Aesthetics JNU, New Delhi which comprises a Performance Studies program inclusive of Anthropology, Performance Theory and Body Art. There is no common ground to an MA in Theatre Arts. In India, language departments have compartmentalised their programs; but in Theatre Arts it not structured and the pedagogy needs revisions according to the context. He raised the question of how the inequalities like ocularcentric approaches can be addressed in Theatre Arts and Pedagogy.

Sophie Jump presented a video of her work, *Like a Fish Out of Water* (2012). The video presented a new concept that blended site-specific performance and handheld video technology. From the point of view of visiting lecturer and practitioner, Sophie Jump argued that the digital is working only as vehicle to her. David Zinder started with the possibility of digital media and the massive knowledge production developing in the area of digital learning.

The concluding session raised some general points about digital pedagogy. Simon Betts argued that digital is a tool for the experiment in theatre. Chris Blame raised questions about the pedagogy of Theatre Studies in India and the role of NSD in formulating the curriculum. Ananthkrishnan presented a historiography of the postcolonial Indian theatre and its different pedagogical systems. He described the concept of 'reason and practice' in India. Zinder added that knowledge systems and digital technology are binary. The second point of discussion was the concept of 'practice as research' and its possibility in India and abroad. Zinder added that some artistic methods can only be understood via practice. In the concluding session, Raina pointed out that the pedagogy in a third world country like India need a socio-political understanding. Pillai critically analysed how the policies of the country make drastic changes in academic institutions and the focus of most of the art institutions are on funds and festivals. Lavender argued for a need for critical knowledge production in the discipline of Theatre Arts and Performance. Ananthkrishnan concluded the round table discussion with the observation that during this era of digital intervention there is a need for a South Asian pedagogical system.

All these discussions on digital realm focused only on the institutional art practices. But these discussions did not incorporate the use of digital in performance practices in the public domain, especially in the realms of campaigns and popular stage shows, which was massively used in India. Next section will look at the works which deal with the history of

concepts with regard to performance, of innovations in technology and other media in Performance and Theatre Studies and of electoral campaign.

Theatre Performance and Technology by Christopher Bauge is a study based on the development of scenography from the nineteenth century to the twentieth century. It covers the history of ‘scenery’ systems in the nineteenth century and the wide influence of the modernist atmosphere on theatre. The book looked at the foundational influence of scenography on performance. The book analyses some of the important modern theatre designers and their works. The book discusses the rejection of technology in theatre, in ritual forms and in non-theatrical performances and concludes with writing on the presence of new technologies in contemporary theatre.

Scenic Design and Lighting Techniques by Chuck Gloman and Rob Napoli is a basic guide for theatre design and lighting in craft level. This book also traces the evolution of the concept of design and presentation on perspective oriented theatre.

Stage Lighting for Theatre Designers by Nigel Morgan covers the idea of light and the analytical approach to the proscenium theatre aesthetics. It explains the light instruments and stage systems, along with light design elements, the performance making process along with certain performance case studies.

The Potentials of Spaces: The Theory and Practice of Scenography & Performance by Alison Oddey and Christine White is another book that looks at the practice and research in contemporary scenography & performance. It has three parts: Part one starts with the various routes of design and direction and there is a detailed review of directors’ work. The book examines the performance by video artist Bill Viola in St. George’s Cathedral. The main focus of the study is the scenographic practice and its reflections. Part two is titled ‘Performance Potentials’ and deal with redesigning, virtual theatre project and the scenographical change, experimentation and interactions between technology and

performance. Part three which is titled 'Scenographic avant-gardes in Canada' discusses the scenography of Richard Foreman, spatial practices by Wooster group, physicality and virtuality, and an actor in the mediated stage.

Guide to Stage Lighting by G.N.Das Gupta is the first book on stage lighting in modern Indian theatre. The book is a basic collection of information consisting nature of lighting, scientific properties of light, objectives of lighting, electricity, sources and equipment, controllable factors of lighting, method of lighting and some data about the modern Indian plays' lighting practices with the layout.

Digital Performance: A History of New Media in Theatre, Dance, Performance Art, and Installation by Steve Dixon. This book has a critical approach to digital performance histories. The book mainly focuses on the practices of digital performances, on new media in contemporary performance and visual arts. Dixon's research work deals with digital and technological aesthetics as a chronological development of the avant-garde traditions. The book discusses the history of an avant-garde aesthetics with reference to the genealogy of digital performances, futurism and early twentieth-century avant-garde, multimedia theatre from 1911-1959 and performance and technology since 1960. The second chapter deals with liveness during the digital revolution. In the section on 'body', he discusses virtual bodies, the digital double, robots and cyborgs. The 'space' section involves an analysis of uses of digital media theatre and scenic spectacle. Section on 'time' is divided into two chapters which are 'time' and 'memory'. The last section on 'interactivity' deals with the performance interactivity, videogames, CD-ROMs, and the conclusion.

The Wooster Group Work Book by Andrew Quick with photographs by Paulan Court and Mary Gearhart is a collection of contemporary American performance company Wooster Group's rehearsal methods and source materials. The artistic collaboration with the director Elizabeth Le Compte and her viewpoints on art are expressed here. Their main five

performances' performance making processes and production methods are described here.

The archival data of Frankn Dell's *The Temptation of Antony* (1987), *Brace UP!* (1991), *Fish Story* (1994), *House/Light* (1999) and *To You, the Birdie!* (Phedre,2002) are discussed in this book. Beyond writing, the vivid use of drawings, sketching, production notes, plotting, photos, cue charts, marks and remarks make an authoritative study of performance atmosphere. All the six interviews and production scripts open artists' inner creative thoughts to the public.

The Democracy of Objects by Levi R Bryant looks at the relationship between 'object' and 'subject'. This book looks at the epistemological realism of objects and the concept of 'representation' in detail. It examines the object without its subject identity and proposes an ontological thesis beyond political relations, about the object.

Theatre and Performance in Digital Culture: From Simulation to Embeddedness, by Matthew Causey has been divided into two parts. Part one centres on simulation and Part two around embeddedness. The book covers the historical area of medical innovation, new media, virtual environments, weapons systems, advanced technologies, theatre and performances.

Design: The Key Concepts by Catherine McDermott is a glossary of the key concepts on design for practice and research in the twenty first century. This book carries history, context, analysis and a study of contributions of concepts along with interdisciplinary ways of designing, notes on modern and postmodern movements of art and craft etc.

The Politics of the New Media Theatre by Gabriella Giannachi has three parts, which are 'global', 'city' and 'body'. The book presents the site specificities of art practices in contemporary times. The book researches the concept of nature and the position of ecology in postmodern cultural history with hybridity. It also looks at the impact of war in the area of economic performance and artist performance.

The Victory Lab: The Secret Science of Winning Campaigns Crown by Sasha

Issenberg has discussed how an unknown person can become a minister using ultra-modern strategic campaigns and the tactic and strategic campaign used for research, information data collection; psychological moves to influence voters to vote for the candidate. The pre-planned campaigns marketed human and artificial skill, design, finance, manifestation, manipulation of the thoughts of voters which made twenty first century's political decision. Taking the case study of a businessman Michael Farrand Bennet who won the 2010 election at Colorado, the United State of America with the usages of strategies and social media campaign marks the major example for the tactics behind the electoral campaign history. Issenberg also discusses behind the curtain activities of Obama's presidential electoral campaign and its public effect. The evolution of new kingmakers in politics changed the democratic structure of America. The candidate's charisma, rhetoric quality, the goodwill of identity, populist approaches, and manifesto for development were designed from the secret campaign. Issenberg points to the new wave of the campaign using political science possibilities to a paid consultants invisible new kingmaker who operates the electoral campaign.

The Modi Effect: Inside Narendra Modi's Campaign to Transform India by Lance

Price draw the transformation of Modi's political career from a tea maker to Prime Minister. The book narrates his position from Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh (RSS), BJP member, M.L.A., Chief Minister in Gujarat before becoming the Prime Minister. His connection with L.K.Advani, Atal Bihari Vajpayee, incidents of 1991 Ayodhya and 2002 Godhra were put forward to examine the ways he sustained in Indian politics. In 2001, Modi used the possibility of public relations communication apart from the election campaign. His campaign team included designers, advertising consultants, and public relation groups and film makers who worked behind the campaign. They remained invisible during the process,

and here in this book the writer mentions them with their previous affiliations. any of the His electoral campaigns structures were reported and documented from 2010 onwards. Modi and his articulations and rhetoric speeches against the opposition in media gained more support from new nationalists in India. Usages of websites, TV channel, YouTube channel, Facebook, Twitter, Google+ Hangout in the pre-campaign and campaign made a new wave in India. The book also discusses the usages of 3D holography in the electoral campaign with its historical and contextual reference. The book discusses also the event organised after the election which was connected with post-campaign activities. The book narrates the heroic journey of the candidate from a common man to a Prime Minister.

War Room: The People, Tactics and Technology Behind Narendra Modi's 2014 Win by Ullekh NP examines on how the strategies on BJP's electoral campaign manifested in 2014 electoral campaign. The book is more focused on Modi's campaign activities in North India mainly Uttar Pradesh with the combination of Amit Shah. Book draws on the usages of social media in a massive way for the first time in the general election. Making brands and spectacle ways of elaboration in the campaign shows the important kingmakers and collaborators of 2014 BJP campaign. The *Chai pe Charcha*, 3D rallies, usages of FB pages were used for the new collective mob in the campaign time. In the fourth chapter, there is a section describing Modi's 3D holographic electoral campaign with reference of 2012 campaign. The main limitation of the book is the lack of reference on the information and arguments.

All these books have introduced and studied the major conceptual and analytical tools necessary to understand and research contemporary performance practices in relation to technology and also in relation to election campaigns. This research in continuity also aims to look at the influence of digital technology and it's interaction with contemporary

performance practices. This project also unpacks the nature of performance with relation to technology by particularly engaging with a specific event which is the electoral campaign.

Chapterisation

The thesis has three chapters apart from the introduction and conclusion.

First chapter- ‘3D Holographic Electoral Campaign: A Performance Analysis’ mainly focuses on the analysis of the 2012 electoral campaign from the vantage point of performance making processes. Campaign designers’ process was parallel to the technological transformations and those performance aspects were never archived. The chapter contains mainly three sections. The first section titled, ‘Engagement of Electoral Campaign’ unravels the performance and structure of holography and its relation to the nature of such campaigns from the nineteenth century in detail. The second section titled ‘The Performance Event and its Analysis’ examines the event of the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat that took place on 10th December 2012, its performance aspects and concepts in detail. The final section looks at the history and the use of ‘3D Holography’.

Second Chapter- ‘Materiality in Electoral Campaign’ analyses in detail the concept of materiality in 3D holographic practices in electoral campaign that unfolded in Gujarat, 2012 is analysed. The focus of this research is limited to the performance making process of the event of 10th December 2012 in Gujarat. This chapter mainly looks at the materiality and immateriality of the holographic practice, shifts with technology and the result and effects in public spaces, during the same time period.

Third chapter- ‘Performativity and Dramaturgy in Electoral Campaigns’ analyses the main performance aspects of ‘performativity’ and ‘dramaturgy’ for the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat in 2012. The concept and practice of new performativity and dramaturgy in Indian 3D holographic electoral campaign and it’s the context of globalisation

also discussed in the chapter. Concepts of performativity and dramaturgy were never used in similar ways before in India. For analysing the concept of performativity the chapter will use the analytical structure of post dramatic structure, the concept of performance and structure of public spaces. For understanding the 'dramaturgy' in the event, the project examines the idea of collective intelligence, salesmanship and branding, agencies and entertainment used for executing the performance event.

The conclusion will conclude the main arguments with discussions of the thesis followed by a bibliography. The research tries to understand the new populist ways in which 3D holographic practices were implemented in the 2012 electoral campaigns in India.

The research on the 3D holographic electoral campaign will help to establish new perspectives for Performance Studies. Understanding the possibilities and limitations of the research will further help develop conceptual clarity and discussion on Performance theory and Practice in India.

Chapter One

3D Holographic Electoral Campaign: A Performance Analysis

The classical notion on the performance making process from a written dramatic text to a performing text in the Indian theatre evolved in the second half of the twentieth century. The liberation from text and questioning author and director created collective ways of creating a performance aesthetic in performance making process. In theatre, the performance making process is connected with its structure of casting, rehearsals with actors, designers, technicians, scenographers, dramaturge and several run throughs. All those elements have their own hierarchical connection with the director, stage manager and producer in theatre. Various theatre movements adopted various methodologies for its aesthetic formulations. The performance making process in any discipline needs a methodology. First, the concepts need to be conceived and then move to construction which needs a structural process because a contextual economy was incorporated. The contextual economy was interlinked with finance, time, labour, public relation etc. The evolution from the modernistic *mise-en-scene* and hermeneutic approaches to postmodern approaches like hyper reality, kinesics, virtual reality and proxemics were examples of new ways of devising performance making process. The composition, collaboration and key methods in performance are convoluted from new ways of multi skilled and interdisciplinary approaches. The new performance making process from the 1960s' performative turn transformed the concept of production and reception with "different degrees and in different capacities" (Fischer-Lichte in *TPP* 18). Here in 2012 event the preparation was pre-designed and used the performance making concepts with multi-skilled and interdisciplinary approaches. All those preparations contribute to the creation of an aesthetic atmosphere with the body, materials, text/concepts and technology with the

designers, cinematographer and volunteers. The campaign preparations were similar to a performance production's preparation, which is called a performance making process in the context of performance practices.

The main focus of this chapter is to look at the event of the 3D holographic electoral campaign in 2012 through the study of its performance making process. This chapter contains three sections: the first titled, 'Engagement of Electoral Campaign'. Second, titled 'The Performance Event and its Analysis and 3D Holography' will examine the dimension of performance and concepts related to the the3D holographic electoral campaign that was hosted on 10th December 2012 in Gujarat. The chapter will also deal with the designer's performance making process. The final section looks at the history and the use of '3D Holography'. Both examine the performance in the background of holography and electoral campaigns.

1.1: Engagement of Electoral Campaign

The 3D holographic electoral event became an advanced performance event in the history of the electoral campaigns in India. The Election Studies as a discipline examine the election process in academic ways with different methods. Stephanie Tawa Lama-Rewal in the article titled "Studying Election in India: Scientific and Political Debates" writes that there are three main phases with Election Studies and they are "the campaign, the vote, the announcement of results and subsequent government formation" (01). This section will examine the history of campaigns and 3D holography.

1.1.1: The Electoral Campaign in India

India became independent on 15th August 1947 and became a Republic on 26th January 1950 when the constitution came into effect. Indian election became the largest election practice in the world from the first national election in 1952 onwards. India follows secular democratic systems for its governance. OED defines 'democracy' as "A system of

government by the whole population or all the eligible members of a state, typically through elected representatives” (“Democracy”). India follows a constitution which is based on Democracy. Dr B.R. Ambedkar was the chief draftsman of the constitution. It took three years for drafting the Indian constitution and it contains 448 articles, 12 schedules, 5 appendices and 101 amendments. The Constitution of India envisions the Indian State to be a “Sovereign Democratic Republic” (“The Constitution”). The Constitution guarantees the States and Union Territories democratic and republic structure. There is a General election for electing members to the Parliament and a Legislative election for electing members to Legislative Assembly in every state. The elected candidate to the parliament is called Member of Parliament (M.P.) and Legislative assembly called Member of Legislative Assembly (M.L.A.). OED defines ‘election’ as “A formal and organized choice by vote of a person for a political office or other position” (“Election”). The history of Indian election has its own identity with democracy from independence. Ornit Shani writes in the book, *How India Became Democratic: Citizenship and the Making of the Universal Franchise*, about the history of India’s elections from 25 October 1951 to 21 February 1952 and the preparatory works for the election which started from September 1947 (04). The committee for the election was constituted from 1950 onwards with the Chief Election Commissioner and a Constituent Assembly Secretariat (ibid). The electoral processes mainly have three phases; those are campaign, voting and result. The people do vote in India as an amalgamation of secret and sacred purposes. “Election has thus come to be considered sacrosanct in much the same way as rituals in Indian social life... To call them sacred therefore is not imply that there is anything ‘religious’ about them, but to signify inviolability” (Banerjee 1561).

OED defines ‘campaign’ as, “An organized course of action to achieve a goal” (“Campaign”). In an electoral campaign, the ‘goal’ is to achieve maximum vote from voters to form a government. The Election Commission of India notes that “The campaign is the

period when the political parties and candidates put forward their arguments with which they hope to persuade people to vote for their candidates and parties. Candidates are given a week to put forward their nominations. The official campaign lasts for above two weeks from the drawing up of the list of nominated candidates, and officially ends 48 hours before polling closes” (“Nomination and Campaign”). An Indian adult citizen who has the age of minimum eighteen in India has the constitutional rights for voting in the election. Public spaces are the collective area for the campaign. The public gathering is an important aspect of connecting different individuals to form a mob or mass, during the campaign. From the Greek republican times onwards, the public spaces were the area for gathering and campaigning.

Agoras, forum, piazza were the public spaces in ancient Greece and Italy. From the eighteenth century BC, the *Agora* was one of the major public spaces in Greece. OED defines ‘agora’ as “(in ancient Greece) a public open space used for assemblies and markets” (“Agora”). There were different types of *agoras*, and among them, two were significant for the development of democracy. Those are *Ancient Agora* and *Roman Agora*, down to the premises of Acropolis, Athens. Campaigns were held to select candidates for voting, and election was conducted which can also exclude the deviants or rebels from the system. From the fifth century BC, Greece developed a democratic system of governance. Athens was the first city to give voting rights to its citizen except for slaves, other country residents and women. The broken pottery was used for voting. The broken ceramic pottery used for voting to exclude any person from the city was called ‘Ostrakon’. In the Ancient Agora Museum the Athenian democracy’s objects and materials are exhibited (“Ostrakon”). Aristotle’s *The Athenian Constitution* mentions these voting activities. Ancient Rome and Pompeii also had the public space called ‘*forum*’ to gather public for religious, economic and political activities. The Roman *forum* was situated between Capitoline and Palatine hills. The OED

defines the 'forum' as "(in an ancient Roman city) a public square or marketplace used for judicial and other business" ("Forum").

The materials used for voting and campaign transformed over the years with the evolution of different technologies. Godrej archive documented in *Bombay Chronicle* published a newspaper article on 15 December 1951 on the first usages of ballot boxes in independent India. The first Indian election in 1952 used the ballot boxes which were manufactured by Godrej steel company. Sixteen lakhs boxes were used for 1952 and 1957 elections ("Document"). In India, the voting using ballot boxes changed to Electronic voting machine (EVM) in 1999. The project for EVM started in early 1982, 2000, 2004 and 2006 from first to the third generation under the Electronics Corporation of India and Bharat Electronics ("Electronic Voting"). Similarly, the materials and medium used for the campaign also evolved with the coming of new technology.

The gathering spaces for campaign are the spaces of political mobilisation from the early days of democracy and now these are being prepared in multiple ways. Communication through print media, public speeches, street plays, songs, film and video were used commonly for campaigns. Multiple communication methods are used in the campaign to connect candidates with voters. The campaign time changes society in unconscious ways. With the majoritarian influence, the individual voter's opinion gets manipulated during the time of campaign.

Lance Price writes about the important kingmakers of the campaign. The collaborators of 2014 BJP campaign were professional consultants, administrative and creative heads. The strategies and their inputs with social media and BJP Information Technology head Arvind Gupta, Hiren Joshi, Nirav Sha, Parag Shah, Parindu Bhagat, Manish Bardia, Kuniyal Kailasanathan, were part of professional public relation. Most of them worked with Modi for the Gujarat government. The campaign advertising made branding and

marketing with the campaign. Prashant Kishor with ‘Citizens for Accountable Governance’ (87), Piyush Panday and his ‘Ogilvy and Mather’ (182), Piyush Goyal with ‘Election Information Campaign Committee’ (91,183), Samrat Bedi (183), Andrew Lloyd Webber(188), Prasoon Joshi (189) were the kingmakers who designed and implemented strategy for election campaign. Prasanth Kishor and his team were the major campaign strategists in 2014 and they brought together the use of “tea stalls and 3D rallies” (Price 136) in the campaign.

Ullekh N P writes specifically underlining the campaign activities done by Prashant Kishor and his team ‘Citizens for Accountable Governance’, Piyush Pandey and his company ‘Ogilvy and Mather India’, Suoojit Sircar for short film, Manish Sherawat for animation, Mukhtar Abbas Naqvi for the logistic like sky travel and rallies, Aravind Gupta for Information Technology section, Rishi Raj Sing in UP, Rajesh Jain and his Netcore Solutions for giving database for BJP which his team collected on Anna Hazare’s India Against Corruption (IAC) in 2011, Dr.Vijay Chauthaiwale for NaMo number campaign (36-82). Robert Huckfeldt and John Sprague write that the campaign contributes to a “social process that produces greater homogeneity within social groups, and greater diversity between social groups” (83). The state assembly election held in Gujarat, a state in western India, witnessed a rapid change in 2012 with the usages of 3D Holographic technology. The “360- degree campaign” (Price 213, 267) made new publicity marketing and engagements in India with the support of diaspora finance.

1.2: The Performance Event and its Analysis

This part will contain the analysis of the 3D holographic electoral campaign event hosted by Narendra Damodardas Modi on 10th December 2012 at Gujarat. The primary data was collected from the newspapers, books, online sources and news videos of the campaign.

In November-December 2012, the north-western Indian state of Gujarat was busy with legislative election campaigns. On 10th December (Monday) evening, the Bharathiya Janatha Party's (BJP) Chief Ministerial candidate Narendra Damodardas Modi delivered a 3D holographic live speech. The 55 minutes long speech was broadcasted simultaneously in the 25 districts of the state at 53 places. In all 53 places, the candidate presented his speech in a 3D (three dimensional) manner. He received people's reactions from the 53 spaces, with the help of cameras and other advanced satellite technologies. This research examines how electoral speech used performance aspects with 3D holographic projection technology as a significant component. From the way it has been organised and executed, it is evident that the event itself has been structured like a performance and the 3D holographic projection technology used "a very twenty-first-century version of" (Price 63) the Victorian theatre trick called 'Pepper's Ghost'. Pepper's Ghost was an illusionistic technique used for theatrical performances.

The news on Guinness World Records certified that 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat, the western state of India, on 10th December 2012, as the "The most simultaneous broadcasts of a Pepper's ghost Illusion is 53, achieved by Raj Kasu Reddy and Mani Shankar of Nchant 3D (India) who brought a live 55-minute electoral speech by Narendra Damodardas Modi to 53 locations across 26 cities in Gujarat, India, on 10 December 2012" ("Modi's 3D Interaction").

London based 3D holography company *Musion* and its Indian counterpart *Nchant 3D Pvt Ltd* based in Bangalore and Hyderabad, designed and organized the event. From the studio in Gujarat, the candidate delivered the electoral speech which was shown to the public. Advanced technologies, satellite communications and vehicles were deployed along with the necessary holographic equipment for the event. The entire event was structured and designed with an advanced level of conceptualisation and research and meticulous implementation.

The data about the event were mainly collected from newspapers like The Indian Express, The Hindu, The Guardian, Rediff.com, Telegraph, International Business Time, video clips from India TV, and books. The analysis, as mentioned before, is mainly based on the new performance dimension present in the event and the processes of design associated with it. This section of the chapter has focused on the performance making process and is divided into four sections: 1. concept and technology, 2. production, 3. distribution and 4. consumption of the event. Concept and technology explore the conceptualisation that has been carried out for the event. The production section looks at the first phase which took place at the studio. The second phase comprises of the computer generated activities inside designers' wareroom and the generation of 3D works for satellite broadcast. And finally, the third phase that deals with the structure and implementation of 3D holographic projections took place in 53 areas of Gujarat and this part also explores viewer' experiences. This analysis will be the base of conceptual engagements in further chapters.

1.2.1: Concept and Technology

Hyderabad based *Nchat* 3D Pvt Ltd, founded by Kasu Rajagopal Reddy and his business partner BITS Pilani graduate Mani Shankar, who worked in the film and advertisement industry, were the main think-tanks for the 2012 3D Holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat. The 3D holographic company *Musion* writes about Reddy, a businessman who experienced *Musion*' 3D holographic projection technology from London and interested in its license in India and worked for its marketing with "combining *Musion*'s expertise with his own knowledge of the region" ("Kasu Rajagopal Reddy"). For them, the conceptualisation and execution is pure "business" and Mani Shankar followed it as his "passion" (Nair). The blend of entertainment and business became the key factors in the 3D holographic electoral campaign in India. Nair writes about Shankar's entertainment and political background thus: "Hyderabad-based Shankar brings to his job the experience of five

Bollywood films and nearly 1,500 ad films, not to talk of the technical know how he might have picked up during his BITS Pilani graduation days. While he claims to have worked with late Prime Minister P V Narasimha Rao, former Andhra Pradesh chief ministers Chandrababu Naidu and Y S Rajasekhara Reddy...For them, it's a show with 'magic'"(Nair).

South Indian Cinematographer U K Senthil Kumar was part of the video shooting in 2012 (Price 64). He also worked with BJP in 2014, in Telangana for Chandrasekara Rao and in Andhra Pradesh for Kiran Kumar Reddy. He has planned to work for Tamil politician Jayalalitha in Tamil Nadu and film-related holography shows (Menon). Shobha Warriar for website rediff.com interviewed cinematographer Senthil Kumar about 2012 Gujarat and 2014 general election 3D holographic campaign process. The Chennai Adayar film Institute alumni Senthil Kumar got special training for holographic technology from *Musion* at London and he became the first trained expert from Asia (Warriar).

Nair interviewed the concept creators of 3D holography in 2012 and they told him: "The concept started as a religious-themed project around a popular Andhra Pradesh deity. When that got shelved, Shankar and Reddy signed up with the UK-based Musion Systems Ltd, that has patented the technology, in May and ended up in Gujarat. 'Before this, Musion has beamed pop singer Mariah Carey five times simultaneously,' said Reddy. As he took care to underline, 'that was pre-recorded'" (Nair). The 'shelved' concept was materialised with *Musion's* technological support for the campaign. From Nair's interview, it shows that concept and its application are connected through their illusions. Here the digital 3D holographic technology and its simulation get used as a form which gave a new dimension to the history of electoral campaigns. Video channel NMF News writes on 'India TV' video on the 2012 election campaign in Gujarat and how it became the new wave in the campaign thus; it "marked a paradigm shift in the way technology was perceived and utilized in any election campaign in the history of India"(NMF News). From the report on 'real game

changer', the usages of high-tech technology by the candidate on 2012 creating a binary discussion on real and unreal. This research would look at this "paradigm shift" (ibid) and its use in Indian performance practices, as both are connected with technology and manifests itself in its aesthetic application in performance cultures.

1.2.2: First Phase: Production.

The candidates did the live shooting for 3D holography at a shooting studio in Gujarat under the supervision of Reddy, Shankar and Kumar with the assistance of designers from UK and India in 2012 in three schedules. It was scheduled on 29th November 2012, on 3rd December 2012 and on 10th December 2012. India TV video on the preparation of 2014 general elections says that in the first phase, a 3D ware room was arranged within the studio. A stage was set inside the studio with lights and furniture, plants, camera set up, satellite room, technical group and arrangement for feedback from every location. Nair writes on the process:

citing a non-disclosure agreement with the BJP, except that "28 imported projectors were used in a 3,000 sqft studio supported by multiple 4K(resolution) cameras" to project Modi via satellite. Both the sides also refused to say how much the project was costing, though some reports have mentioned a figure of around Rs 150 crore. (*Indian Express*)

Nair's writing reveals the information on studio arrangements, high-tech technology and cost of the event. There is a need to critically analyse the high-tech aspects of production because it will bring light upon the cultural industry and economies of 3D holography, with respect to its performance elements. International Business Time published photographs of cinematographer Senthil Kumar taking the light measurement with a light meter in candidate's body for the 3D Holography shooting in the black painted studio with artificial lights which clearly shows the preparation for shooting ("Cinematographer"). It gives the

accurate light measuring for shooting with the candidate for real 3D effect (ibid). The photos and 3D holographic projections show that the material arrangements like a table, water were arranged by other volunteers. In the last photograph, a group of people who worked for the shooting was visible. Similar to theatrical spatial arrangements a stage, black curtain, fan type lighting, properties were used in the performance making process. The candidate, Kumar, Shankar, the designers and other volunteers were there with instruction in the group photos. Kumar discussed that the technological difference between shooting for holography and film or photograph lies mainly with lighting and image making. In the studio, they used 4K resolution with Cannon C 500 camera for shooting. He says, “We had to make mathematical calculations and light the image accordingly so that his image looked natural, so that the viewers felt the 3D effect. It takes a minimum of six hours to light the image. Once the calculations are made and lights are placed correctly, shooting the video is like shooting any other object” (Warrier). Here from Kumar’s words, it is clear how much precision was needed for the shooting that involved high-tech equipment in the performance making process. Such a process in executing the event needed supportive designers and technicians and their collective labour, who worked as the backstage crew. The mainstream media or academic writings never recognised and never documented or credited designers creative and skilled contribution to the 2012 event. Not much was written or documented on their contributions in this electoral campaign performance making process. Under the cover of technology, it is important to recognise the designers’ creative inputs which contributed to the aesthetics of the performance making process. The thesis will examine in the upcoming chapter of this invisible collectiveness or individual backstage work, their labour in the time of high-tech technologies.

The candidate’s body was disciplined and costumes were selected carefully and rehearsed well in the first phase. Regarding the preparation for the holographic speech by the

candidate, Nair writes on Mani Shankar's description of the candidate and his space awareness like an actor: "He is a born communicator and understands spatial orientations," (Nair). The preparation was similar like rehearsals in theatre. There was a preview demo show which took place for the candidate. Previously Shankar and Kumar did a sample "holographic speech" with minimum space arrangements like the use of mike and a chair which they called "The set resembled a dais" (Warrier). According to them, the candidate did extra work as a speech on the hologram and he did a short promo performance which was not planned. The candidate first saw the 25 minutes hologram, only then he approved to use it for assembly election (ibid). It was like an improvisation in performance which allows space to analyse candidate's performance ability like a performer in performance and awareness of the circumstances. Here the performance ability was connected with the 'performative' ways of the candidate which was designed. The 'performative' aspects of the event will be analysed in the third chapter in detail. The hidden and invisible labour of the performance making process in the electoral campaign created a value of illusion to it.

In 2012, before shooting a meeting was held in the candidate's house in which cinematographer Kumar was also part of. The high technology used in the event created an experience which was like proscenium theatre's 'fourth wall' proximity line because the people could only see the candidate body but they cannot interact with the candidate. Within the stipulated time that the Election Commission had given, the candidate had to make his presence felt in all the constituencies. The candidate's body could reach 53 places at the same time using 3D holography. Using technological simulation, the candidate reached people and the candidate could get the viewer's reactions like a 'pinhole' view, with the help of cameras, but the people could not reach the candidate directly. But at the same time, it made the audience feel that the candidate is within their reach. The campaign technology created a performer 'aura' on the candidate, which is against the argument put forward by philosopher

Walter Benjamin in his 1936 essay titled “The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction” (14-15). Benjamin argued that with the coming of technologically reproducible art, the aura is lost. With performer ‘aura’ the candidate’s 3D body reached quite close to the viewer, unlike other electoral campaigns. The candidate’s body language, rhetoric and costumes were carefully designed and choreographed to go together with.

In the 3D holographic performance speech on 29th November 2012, in Gujarat, the candidate used one key hand gesture- which is the sign of ‘V’ for victory made with two fingers- and changed its meaning. He translates this as “Victory to *Vikas*”. English word ‘Victory’ was replaced with the Hindi word “*Vikas*”, the word for development coming to signify ‘Victory’ to ‘Development’, totally different from its commonly accepted meaning (Namo Gujarat 01:05:07-08). This action demonstrates how the candidate has engaged in the meaning of gestures and text in order to create popular rhetoric. The careful selection of words illustrates the populist approach in the candidate’s rhetoric.

Kumar remarked on the candidates’ sense of style and colours he preferred for his costume. The candidate had selected four to five clothes and from that Kumar chose the colour suitable for 3D Holographic shooting (Warrior). It is adding a new point with Kumar’s arguments on the candidate’s colour sense because of the reference from Lance Price written on Modi's specification on his selection of style and colour with his clothing (179). The candidate’s sense of style and selection of colour for his costume and fashion will be discussed in the third chapter. Also, this discussion will bring into light the connection between consumerism and branding with performance aesthetics.

The studio became a rehearsal and performance space like a theatre space. The direct physical and indirect virtual presence was the other interactive spaces there. The candidate’s body became a performer’s body in the production process. The electoral candidate became a performer in front of technology. The team involved in the performance making process has

carefully transformed the candidate's body into a performer's body. But their identity and labour in the creative process were erased and made invisible in order to make it a live performance. The next chapter will examine the shift of the candidate's body to a performer's body and its uniqueness, candidate's communicative skills and spatial orientation in the studio and outside. It will also examine the uses of popular actions and how its visibility increased with the high-tech campaign.

1.2.3: Second Phase: Distribution

The interviews and reports documenting the first phase comprising of shooting and the third phase which involved the consumption of the image are many because of the interaction with the public. But the documentation of the second phase which is distribution is almost absent because it was private and undisclosed. This phase was carried out under the supervision of *Musion*, Nchat and BJP volunteers. Because of patent issues, it was a conscious decision that the performance making process need not be exposed. In the studio, there was immense collective creative and technical works executed by conceptualists, digital designers, 3D designers, audio and video data of performer body etc. It shows the presence of a 'collective' in 3D holographic electoral performance making processes which will be explored in the third chapter with more details. India TV video on the preparation of 2014 general election says that for the second phase, a similar sized holography output was arranged in the 3D wareroom. The reporter says in the video about designers/ technicians in Hindi as "*Modi ke hi-tech munch ke peeche kam karnevalonka*" (NMF News 00.08:16-19) which can be translated as: 'The backstage workers in Modi's hi-tech stage'. The word '*munch*' in the Hindi language means stage and invokes the invisible backstage workers in theatre.

From 2014 onwards, political party BJP owned a studio for the works related to electoral campaigns. 5000 people were working in that studio at Gandhinagar. Digital

designing groups with the help of social media platforms like WhatsApp did testing for feedback from locations. In 2012, Gujarat 3D holographic electoral campaign used a big team that included 40 prominent contemporary technologists, 120 people and 4000 extra camera-like equipment (NMF News 00.10:18-34). There were cameras used for feedback from the multiple venues.

In 2014, for the campaign preceding general assembly elections, 3D holographic electoral campaign speech was given by the candidate in Hindi and he spoke about time and space during electoral campaign as, “Brothers and sisters, I thought of coming to a place near to you and I wanted to interact with you, but due to the limitations of time, space, I thought of making use of technology as a medium through which I can come to you and reach out to you” (NMF News 00.11:47- 12:16). Here candidate specifically underlines how technology became a medium for his campaigns and for making him ‘present’. Upcoming chapter will explore the idea of ‘presence’ in detail. Nair writes “...the CM can see the crowd gathered before him and at the various venues” (*Indian Express*). The candidate’s body was broadcasted in 53 places simultaneously deploying designed immaterial beams and usage of advanced camera and satellite technology, to project him like a live stage performer.

1.2.4: Third Phase: Consumption

The 3D holographic speech was projected in 53 places in Gujarat on 10th December 2012 and the experience of the public was significantly different from the previous electoral campaigns. Nelson in the newspaper *The Telegraph* writes about the team of technicians who worked behind this event as “a team of up to 40 technologists and more than 400 camera and sound staff in 120 truck based teams” (Nelson). Nelson’s discussions have generated the questions related to the entity of members duty in the third phase of the 3D holographic production process. The duty means creative and technical engagements and it was invisible

without acknowledging their identity. The team member of technologists, drivers, communication volunteers and AV staffs was invisible with creative activities behind this event. In *The Hindu* newspaper, Kolappan reported that Kumar says the team used “gigantic screens behind containers” across Gujarat for broadcasting live 3D holography (Kolappan). And this was projected and broadcasted across Gujarat during the campaign. Narendra Damodardas Modi used the same structure of the campaign and technology for 2014 Lok Sabha elections as well (Warrier). The use of advanced broadcasting satellite technology helped the candidate’s omniscient simulative presence in the electoral campaigns. Concepts like presence, atmosphere, simulation and technology will be explored in the Second Chapter.

The holographic installations were mathematically and technically arranged in all the 53 places during 2012 assembly elections in Gujarat. In 2014 general elections, using the same technology, the 3D holographic container received satellite signals and those signals were converted into beams at Gandhinagar, Gujarat. Stanley Pinto writes in *The Times of India* on pan Indian 3D holographic usages in 2014 that, “A projector is placed high above the stage to stream visuals to the stage floor, which is then reflected on the stage background. This background is made of special, almost transparent material that provides a 3D illusion” (Pinto). In 2012 and 2014 electoral campaigns, the speech was projected via upper projection to a bounce screen to get a 2D live speech which is reflected on special foil screen called *Musion Eyeliner* and it created a 3D effect for the public (NMF News). For ‘erecting’ projections, the Indian version of cubes was used in 2014 in Indian general elections.

In any conventional performance, the engagement and experience of the viewers are communicated to the performers through direct interaction. Such interactions produce materiality which contributes an experiential transformation for the performance or art. Here by materiality means the tangible entity of material which produces an experience for performance aesthetic. With the arrival of film, video and digital technologies, the tangible

engagement and experience of materiality were shifted to intangible materiality. Through the materials, technological and mediated engagements would contribute tangible materiality which is also palpable with the five senses. In 3D holography, there is an engagement of illusion and experience through new materiality. Here the materiality of stream visuals and sound as 3D went through a questionable shift with new materiality. The research will look at this shift with new materiality aspects in the second chapter.

In Europe, the holographic technique presented the ‘image’ to different places simultaneously, as 3D light sources. Pinto writes that it was offered in India as “an unparalleled live-view experience without 3D glasses” (*The Times of India*). Pinto’s words on high-tech-mediated performance “experience” (*ibid*) as live brings out the ideas of a new type of 3D experience in the 3D holographic electoral campaign in India. The spectacle work as an illusion without the help of any equipment like VR glasses, 3D glasses or even seating arrangements like that in Dolby theatre systems. The live speech was projected on to a moveable container and to a screen onstage which was similar to a stage performance structure in India. Nair writes on the usages of technology in the 3D holographic electoral campaign thus:

Describing the technology as a ‘game-changer’ and ‘an illusion of the mind’, Shankar said it was very close to teleportation. “It is so surreal that one can make out the body hair... Our entire business runs on the business of ‘wow’”... Asked if Modi really took breaks for water etc, Shankar smiled. “This is to heighten the illusion created by the hologram”. (Nair)

From the interview, it is evident that the holographic illusion made the spectators believe in the ‘reality’ on stage effectively. The ‘beamed’ illusion technology brought in a ‘wow’ to the surprised viewers. Here the mesmerizing effect was created or manifested. Those contributed a virtual experience. There is a need to explore what type of ‘materiality’ and ‘experience’

were used for this sensory illusion and how the materiality of the body affected the 'experience' in the 3D holographic electoral campaign. The Second Chapter will look at this in detail, the concepts of 'experience' and 'materiality' in relation to the body and technology in the holographic campaign.

Nair writes on the viewer's reception of the magical event:

"Please don't flash lights on the stage", Kasu Rajagopal Reddy warned the impatient crowd collected near the BJP office in Dholka town of Ahmedabad district, last Thursday. He had reasons to be anxious. The crowd was waiting to watch Narendra Modi magically materialize on a big screen. Reddy and his business partner Mani Shankar needn't have held their breath. As the Gujarat CM appeared in full if flickering detail at 26 different locations simultaneously, the verdict on the state's latest 3D release, produced by the two childhood friends, was almost unanimous: it's a hit. (Nair)

At Dholka, usages of lighting or flickering to the *Eyeliners* foil glass was banned because it will create a reflection which will ruin the design of 3D holographic projection. Beyond materialising the body, the candidate's body is simulated to multiple places simultaneously. This makes one of the major shifts from previous 3D holographic musicals, interactive meetings and product launchings. The idea of reaching multiple places at a time was the major shift in the electoral campaign which will be explored further in the campaign. It was different from previous 3D holographic usages for product launching because here the candidate used holography for communicating to maximum people as a part of the electoral campaign. The process was connected with the product-oriented consumerist hierarchy but the event has its own unique specificity with the campaign.

Being a part of the entertainment industry, the 3D holographic projection has also made use of consumer-oriented beauty ideal likes 'being slim'. Nair writes on how the

candidate's body became a 'slim' version for the public as an experience. He writes on the candidate, "He has lauded the technology in his speeches; even as the audiences have been marvelling at how 'slim' his holographic version looks. Shankar is diplomatic. 'We are in the business of entertainment, we make everyone look good', he said. 'I am not saying that we made Mr Modi look slimmer. The hologram has complimented Mr Modi'" (*The Indian Express*). The market and business oriented entertainment approach create a manipulated reality with performance. The question on reality will be examined in Chapter Two and the influence of 'entertainment' and consumerism in the techno-electoral campaign will be examined in Chapter Three. Nelson for *The Telegraph* interviewed Nirmala Sitharaman who was the BJP spokeswoman of 2014 general elections; she spoke about how people were mesmerised with holography, like a performance on stage. Sitharaman says,

When the lights are switched on and the public sees the stage is bare, the whole set has gone away, it creates a sense of awe. The illiterate in India's villages are used to films but this is better ... They think he has probably gone to the green room. They wait for the experience to sink in and ask where he is. Is he behind [the stage]? Their faces are so surprised. They say 'This happened and I saw it'. (Nelson)

The use of performance-related concepts like 'stage' and 'green room' in public discourse points to the use of performance-related aspects in the electoral campaign. This leads to looking at the 3D holographic electoral campaign as a performance and the stunned reaction in the campaign inaugurates a new atmosphere or aesthetic process in the public sphere. Those designed and planned engagements with 3D holographic technology in the electoral campaign can be considered as a dramaturgy of the event. Here the dramaturgy became a structural tool for manifesting party ideology and agenda for the election. Therefore there is a need to explore the dramaturgy in relation to performativity. The performativity

section in Chapter Three will explore in a wider way beyond performance and the dramaturgy section will look at how it works in the culture industry. Nair reported on 3rd December 2012: “The crowd was waiting to watch Narendra Modi magically materialise on a big screen... ‘Is this real?’ asked Ajit Deviputra, a 22-year-old resident of Dholka, as Modi’s hologram emerged on the specially erected stage in the semi-rural town located 40- odd km from Ahmedabad, and attacked the Congress in his usual style. ‘Seems he is sitting right in front of us’... When the virtual Modi took ‘breaks’ to wipe the sweat from his brow, or sip water, many tittered... Ketan Trivedi, a farmer from Dholka says: ‘I have seen several 3D movies in Ahmedabad; this is the first time I am seeing a 3D show without wearing glasses’” (qtd in Nair). About an influence on 2014 general elections, a trader points to the 3D holographic rallies as real experiences. He says, “People were screaming, shouting. I could hardly doubt his presence on the stage, it certainly looked it was him personally addressing us” (Nelson). Kumar says that Modi was conscious of the latest technology and “is impressed with its effectiveness” (Kolappan). The interaction happened at a sensory level which marked an ‘affective’ quality with technology. Nelson reports the words of Swapan Dasgupta, the senior journalist and Member of Parliament, that the 3D holographic electoral campaign “is supplementary to his main program of ‘real’ rallies” (qtd in Nelson) with candidate’s “obsession with technology” (ibid). The technological innovation with mass media changed the political parties’ communication structures. The “obsession with technology” (ibid) worked out as a populist tactic in contemporary electoral campaigns. The candidate used technological ways of communication through, television, radio and followers in social media have pointed on his fascination with technology. In the last half-century, technology and its evolution created a new approach for populist parties (Albertazzi and McDonnell 38). Here candidate’s interest in technology worked as supportive rather than complementary because it

has its own rhetoric individuality creating a new example in the history of the electoral campaign.

1.3: 3D Holography

3D Holography is a multimedia technology used to render an experience of the subject's body in 3 dimensions to its viewer. According to the OED, the word 'hologram' means "a three-dimensional image formed by the interference of light beams from a laser or other coherent light source" ("Hologram"). The hologram is used in print media like magazines, logos, currencies, money cards like credit and debate cards and graphic arts. There are differences between hologram and holography. Fundamentally the hologram is an image that is not movable and holography has movement. Holography uses the 'reference beam' with the visual experience. Hologram and holography are structurally diverse. Benton and Bove Jr write on holography "Unlike photography (and painting, drawing, printing etc.), holography enables 'streaming' light in a way that reconstructs the directions of light rays coming from a 3-D scene" (03). Holography technique is used in performance, film, videos, game, fine arts, musicals and political campaigns.

Hungarian born British physicist Dennis Gabor who won the Nobel Prize for holography (1948- 1971) states, "Holography is based on the wave nature of light, and this was demonstrated convincingly for the first time in 1801 by Thomas Young" (Gabor). Later Emmett Norman Leith and Juris Upantnieks developed an advanced version of "off-axis hologram" (Benton and BoveJr 103) and those inventions paved the way for the development of three dimensional holography. The history of holography techniques and usages has been interlinked with fifteenth-century illusion techniques. The visual experience of illusion was connected to the development of technology and science. Italian scientist Giambattista della Porta invented the *camera obscura* in 1584. Later in 1859 an English engineer Henry Dricks invented an illusion trick based on *camera obscura*. Dricks used glass in a 45-degree angle in

front of a light source and placed an object in between them. When the light was lit in a dark room, the bounced images of the object were seen on the glass and it was called 'Dricksian Phantasmagoria'. British scientist and inventor Dr John Henry Pepper modified 'Dricksian Phantasmagoria effect' and used it to create an illusion in performance of Charles Dicken's adaptation of *The Haunted Man and The Ghost Bargain* (1848) at the Royal Polytechnic Institution, London, in 1862. Dr Pepper used the effect to show a ghost's entry to the stage. It became a new illusionistic experience in those times and it created a shift in illusion technique and aesthetics. Dr Pepper got a patent for this technique of the illusion of the ghost's entry via the glass technique and was called 'Pepper's Ghost'. Later it was showcased around the world with performances and techniques used by theatre performers and magicians.

In the last decade, with the coming of digital and 3D technologies, new forms of illusion techniques became popular. Those became more viable with travel and communication. The technology of shooting, editing, broadcasting and projecting changed with digitalization. The digital art innovator Uwe Maass invented 'Eyeliner' technology for musical performances and corporate companies. The 3D holography installations were used primarily for product launching like that of TATA's Nano car, and for private meetings and discussions like a talk by Al Gore, Prince Charles etc. 3D holography was also used for entertainment purposes such as music and dance performances by Madonna. Another instance was Michael Jackson's performance recreated after his death (Uwe Maass). 'Musion's 'Eyeliner', the new technology was a part of the 2012 Gujarat campaign. For the election campaign 'Musion's 'Eyeliner' technology utilized the technique of 'Pepper's Ghost' with 4K resolution camera, live shooting, satellite broadcasting and digital projections.

The 3D holography in Gujarat used an advanced version of ‘entertainment’. In 2014 the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Delhi facilitated interactive participation of voters with a candidate using live camera feedback inputs. Later in other Indian states like in Telangana (V6 TV), AP (Somasekhar) in 2014 and Tamil Nadu (Menon) in 2016, political parties and candidates used 3D holography for electoral campaigns. In Turkey, Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdogan on 26th January 2014 used holography in a party meeting at Izmir (Ford) and in France in 18th April 2017 the politician Jean-Luc Melenchon speech was broadcasted simultaneously in 7 places using holography (“French Politician”).

1.3.1: The History of Pepper’s Ghost

John Henry Pepper’s book titled *The True History of the Ghost and All About Metempsychosis* (1980) discusses the invention of holography as the ‘Pepper’s Ghost’. Pepper described the spatial arrangements in holographic performance in the nineteenth century. Two stages were used for creating a holographic effect. First one is the “ordinary visible stage” and another is the “hidden stage at a lower level” (Pepper 12). For every technique of illusion, Pepper created a sketch of the ground plan of the chamber (43). The book also writes about the glass structure used for technology (Pepper 39). For Pepper’s Ghost, a silver painted glass was used with two types of chemical preparation. In 1863, the Prince and Princess of Wales and suite visited the Pepper’s Ghost performance and in the demonstration, the princess became the ghost. The Times magazine had published a detailed report about it on 20th May 1863 (Pepper 17-18). The show received promotion in all the newspapers. On 20th January, *The Times* advertised Pepper’s “The Strange Lecture”. Pepper in his book documented these advertisements of the performance.

In the section ‘Patent Ghost’, Pepper is making a dialogue with modern spiritualist researchers in the context of holographic performance and discusses the idea of real and unreal in the nineteenth century. Pepper also writes about the concept of spiritual *deception*

and revival of ghost ideas in that time period (Pepper 46). In the 1860s, with Pepper's works, the public notion on rational thoughts got a strong encouragement at London Polytechnic. Theatre productions titled 'The Widow and Orphans – Faith, Hope, and Charity' at Britannia Theatre London made use of this technique (Pepper 23). Apart from the theatre production, Pepper arranged a ghost exhibition at *Theatre du Chatelet* in Paris. It shows how the technique of holography was popular in nineteenth-century theatre. The Pepper's Ghost was used in lecture performances, exhibitions and in magic shows also. Pepper initiated the discussion of the illusion in performance and use of 'medium' in it. Richard Cruin writes about the usages of glass techniques by the magician Marie de' Medicis in "The Lady of Last Minstrel" (Pepper 22-26). There are two major performance types which used the Ghost technique. The first one was "Strange Lecture", a short performance with a duration running only to a few minutes, at the London Polytechnic. And the second one was a series of performances like the "Haunted Man", "Cupid and the Love Letter" which were performed in a large theatre for fifteen months (Pepper 29-30).

In 1879, Shakespeare's ghost characters like Banquo's ghost and King Hamlet's ghost were performed with the help of Pepper's Ghost effect in London Polytechnic (Pepper 37- 38). Also in another instance, the character of Mephistopheles in Faust appeared as an illusion from the costume (Pepper 45). Pepper also looked at possibilities for using the technique in the future, to design and create miniature lady Lilliput, Dance of Silver waiter Napoleon I, Alexander the Great etc (Pepper 46). This technique of creating illusion was later used by *Musion* in the 21st century. The 3D holographic campaign in Gujarat followed the same structure, with a ware room, a visible moveable container stage in all 53 places.

1.3.2: Mapping the Contradiction of 'Memory and Illusion' in Holography.

Helen Groth in her article, "Reading Victorian Illusions: Dickens's Haunted Man and Dr Pepper's 'Ghost', describes John Henry Pepper's performance of the adaption of Charles

Dickens's *The Haunted Man and The Ghost Bargain* (1848) in 1862 at Royal Polytechnic Institute London (43). She has written about the performance and its spectacle of Pepper's Ghost and traced the relationship between performance text and Dickens's written text. The main argument of the article was the concept of 'memory and illusion'. Groth comments on how in the Victorian era, the concept of 'eye and mind' influenced the vernacular culture (Groth 44). The idea of illusion connected with mind, memory and eyes in a 'pre cinematic' time marked a new wave with regard to remembrance or recollecting of memory (Groth 53). The audience's memory of the written text and illustrations helped to understand and experience the performing text. She clearly discusses from Dr Pepper's lecture, the notion of ghost and memory and writes about Pepper's 'anti-spiritualist' position (Groth 55). The nineteenth-century notion of science and Pepper's Ghost were rational in the Royal Polytechnic lecture-performance in 1863 and it gave a strong foundation to his 'anti-spiritual' ideas. Groth writes on the notion of ghost and memory that Pepper considers "Redlaw's spectre to be a perceptual aberration induced by a diseased memory", (56) and the anti-spiritualist ideas in Pepper's lecture can be trace this awareness.

Pepper conducted a series of public lectures titled "A STRANGE LECTURE" (qtd in Groth 61) in 1863. In order to convey philosophical ideas like rationality and scientific truth, Pepper made use of entertainment and performance as a pedagogical tool. He states in the lecture that "optical illusion ever placed before the public" (ibid). Pepper read Dickens's adaptations and illustrated three scenes using the 'Pepper's Ghost'. It was quite effective in experiencing the illusion of text rather than reading and teaching the text. 'Reason' as an ideal was reinforced through technology and science, with the medium of entertainment and performances, contributing to a clear understanding of illusion in the nineteenth century at London Polytechnic Institute. The illustrated text of 'The Haunted Man and The Ghost Bargain' created memory among the readers, which made the experience of Pepper's Ghost

performance more powerful. The culture of reading and public discussion of the ghost created a collective memory of fear, and the metaphysical notions of illusion and wonderment were materialised with the ‘Pepper’s Ghost’.

Modi’s 3D holography simulative speech has strong associations with Pepper’s “Strange Lecture”. It is interesting to see how religious superstitions are used to contest scientific modes in the twenty first century, which is a complete reversal of Pepper’s phenomena. In Gujarat 2012, BJP and the candidate used the same advanced technologies and the digital form to make ‘Hindu spirituality’, a mobilising tool for attaining power. In a way completely contrary to the Pepper’s Ghost, the candidate’s 3D body articulated a memory of a religious-spiritual body, to forge a strong political identity. The body of the candidate was embedded in spiritual values which were already familiar to the viewers, from their collective religious memory.

1.4: Conclusion

The virtual body of the candidate became/transformed into the performative-body, through the usage of an advanced version of a Victorian theatrical trick. The use of a modified Victorian theatrical illusion, the designers’ invisible performance making process and the candidates’ execution of it make it important to analyse the entire event and preparatory works. From the event analysis, the thesis will further engage with selected/relevant aspects of performance theory. Those are materiality, corporeality, immateriality, performativity and dramaturgy. Chapter Two titled ‘Materiality in Electoral Campaign’ will explore areas like experience, materiality, corporeality, immaterial labour and engagement of materiality in relation to the public. Chapter Three titled ‘Performativity and Dramaturgy in Electoral Campaign’ will discuss the concepts, performativity,

dramaturgy and visual populism with respect to the event. Along with it, the event will be analysed in terms of its rhetoric, political, and populist aspects in relation to the performance.

Chapter Two

Materiality in Electoral Campaigns

This chapter looks at the concept of materiality in the context of the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat, in 2012. The focus of this chapter will be on the concept of materiality and immateriality as mentioned in Chapter One, its shift with the mediation of technology and its influence in public spaces during electoral campaigns in 2012. The chapter will examine in detail the nature of materiality used in the 3D holographic electoral campaign. The chapter's scope and focus are limited to the 3D holographic electoral campaign held in Gujarat in 2012 and the analyses of the materialistic structure of the performance.

In *TPP*, Fischer-Lichte points out on the materiality in performance from the 1960s performance turn. "Much like a scientific research laboratory, these performance events have made it their aim to stress and isolate various crucial factors and experimental processes that partake in the act of generating materiality on stage. Here, artists experiment with a wide range of aspects, including the performance's corporeality, spatiality, and tonality" (76). Fischer-Lichte's analysis becomes a contemporary aesthetic tool for performance analysis, with its emphasis on "performance's corporeality, spatiality, and tonality" (ibid). For examining the materiality in the campaign, the chapter will follow an eclectic method because of the candidate's body and performer's body is the same and simulated.

2.1: Affect -Truth to Meaning to Experience.

Aesthetic experiences evolved through an engagement with spectators' reception which in turn influences the performance making process as well. Both have undergone transformations from time to time. In the process of reception, the discipline of art and

performance has its own engagement with multiple sensibility and hierarchy. The institutional sovereignty produces certain manifestations in aesthetics which will be the truth, meaning, experience etc. In the discipline of art and aesthetic history, seeing work of art of Leonardo da Vinci's *Mona Lisa* in the Louvre Museum (1797) at Paris or Michelangelo's *David* (1504) at Galleria Academia, Florence will generate an idea of 'truth' in the spectator's mind. Here the idea of 'truth' is related to its 'origin' and 'authenticity'. In this work of art the subject also plays an inevitable role in formulating the experience of truth. The truth of the subject depicted in the work of art is associated with its narrative, and its connections to epics and Christianity. The created beauty leads to thinking the 'truth' behind the work of art. Seeing 1854 realistic artwork by French artist Gustave Courbet titled *The Meeting* led to think about its truth because of its origin and the artist's deliberate attempts to conceptualise it against of the idea of 'beauty' in terms of metaphor or in any hermenetic modes. 'Reasoning' got transformed from 'truth' to 'meaning' in the nineteenth century. The nineteenth-century notion of the construction of 'meaning' has influenced art, theatre, architecture, and literature. In theatre and performance, material transformations like usages of stage props, stage techniques, proscenium stage, and electricity worked around this concept of construction of meaning. The 'anthropocentric' notion of this 'meaning' also received transformation in the twentieth century. The viewer who sees the photograph titled *Self Portrait of Mona Lisa* by Photographer Philippe Halsman and Salvador Dali in 1954 (Halsman) or installation artwork titled *Fountain* by Marcel Duchamp ("Fountain") created a critique of the idea of meaning to experience. Technological reproduction in the second half of the twentieth century contributed to the development of a critique of reason leading to a critique of 'truth' and 'meaning'. The ontological search pertaining to the concept of 'meaning' was contradictory to that of 'truth'. The shift from 'meaning' to 'experience' happened through the 'medium of exchange' in the age of postmodernism.

The manifestation and collective organisation of values engaged unprecedented ways of aesthetic experience in urban spaces. Aldo Tassi's essay titled, "Modernity as the Transformation of Truth into Meaning" discussed the transformation of 'meaning' in postmodern times based on two prevailing philosophies. They are 'language philosophy and hermeneutical phenomenology'. Tassi writes on 'truth': "The concept of truth found in modern philosophy is one that is clearly subservient to the concept of meaning and accordingly conforms to the rules which govern the search for meaning" (191). After modernity, the anthropocentric ways of approaching the resources and utilitarian ways of approaching nature for human existence were questioned. Francis Bacon's idea of 'New Science', the eighteenth-century discussion of Kant and Hume, contributed to new dimensions on the concept of 'meaning' (Tassi 191). Tassi writes on 'meaning' that "The modern mode of representing our situation, then, is exhibited in ways of acting and understanding which are primarily concerned with the question of meaning"(191). Concluding 'science of ecology in postmodern world view', Tassi writes thus:

The concern for truth will require us to make ourselves adequate not simply to the nature of things but also to what they can be in reference to man. It is difficult to see what the shape of this new world will be. But it will necessarily be one in which the artificial will be on an equal footing with the natural. Perhaps the science of ecology is the first tentative step toward an emerging "new science" which will exhibit the features that will dominate the postmodern world view. (193)

Here Tassi underlines the idea of 'new science' shifting from 'anthropocentric views to 'ecology' with the transformation of time. The necessity of finding 'artificial' along with 'natural' is highlighted in Tassi's essay. The 'experience and engagement became one of the

later conceptual areas which art and performance practices explored after the critique of ‘truth’ and ‘meaning’. Contemporary American new media video artist Bill Viola’s works engaged the concept of experiences. His 1996 video art titled *The crossing* was an example of art through ‘experience’.

The generation of ‘experience’ through a performance without ‘truth’ or ‘meaning’ was one of the radical shifts that happened with the post-dramatic movement. From Greek to Elizabethan times, textual language and rhetoric constituted the main aesthetic in dramas. In theatre, the linear narratives of binaries create conflicts and thus lead to ‘dramatic’ moments in it. The structure of dramatics has been followed from the time of classical Greek, the Aristotelian poetics or the Indian dramatics, the *Pancha Sandhi* (five segments) in *Natyasastra* or in European dramatic aesthetics contributed by Eugene Scribe’s ‘well-made play’ in nineteenth century and till the Henrik Ibsen’s ‘Problem Play’. After the modernity onwards, dramatic texts and their theatrical versions began to materialise through scenographic ways to create the aesthetic experience of affect among the public. The concept of *Affekt* in German is used mainly to address the aesthetic experience in performance disciplines like theatre, dance, and music. The affective process of experience is mainly an individual process. In theatre and drama training for actor body to pass experience can trace from the late nineteenth century onwards. Different from the Russian actor-director Konstantin Sergeievich Stanislavski’s acting system, Russian actor and director Vsevolod Emilevich Meyerhold created a new body training for acting and it leads to the formulation of a new imagination of dramatics. Fischer –Lichte writes on Meyerhold’s concept: “an explicit antithesis to the embodiment concept” (81). It was not translating meaning from text to body. Meyerhold works were leading the spectators to ‘generate new meaning themselves’. The literary based theatre shifted to visual and experience based theatre in the twentieth century. Fischer-Lichte writes on the transformation of translating the meaning to ‘affective potential’

thus: “Previously the actor’s movements were designed to translate meaning laid down in the literary text. Now they served as a stimulus to induce excitement in the spectators and/or motivate them to generate new meaning themselves. While the first enlisted performativity in the service of expressivity, it was now seen to possess an energetic, affective potential” (81-82). The new meaning is created through an actor-audience direct relationship which is based on the potential to affect with actor’s “corporeality” (Fischer-Lichte 81). Here the referential meaning got a shift to performative experience which was not followed the rational thoughts with the eye.

Bertolt Brecht used ‘doing theatre’ as a critical and political activity for the public to think seriously generating a judgmental view of the performance. Alfred Jarry’s works were critical to the European classical aesthetic of ‘dramatics’. Samuel Beckett used modes of producing experience at an absurd level and it radically broke the concept of dramatics and theatricality. At the beginning of the twentieth century, parallel to the Performance Art, Conceptual Art, Body Art and Video Art put together, a new wave was created with regard to ‘experience’. Avant-garde, Dada, Futurist and Fluxus movement made new manifestations for it. Artistic works of Marcel Duchamp, John Cage, Nam June Paik, Carolee Schneemann, and Marina Abramovic explored ‘experience’ in performance. It also theorised an antithesis to dramatics and theatricality. This is even reflected in Fischer –Lichte’s *TPP* and she argued that performance is transformative and that transformation contributes to its aesthetics and it is not homogenous. The ‘experience’ is affective and never follows a narrative or linear structure like the beginning middle and end. Sometime it will be a ‘moment’, a concept, a sensation, noise or sound, rapture, suffocation, boredom, a fraction of emotion, impulse etc. The above experiences are not related to the ‘critical’ or ‘truth’ and ‘meaning’ based rational ability of the mind. It will first create an affect, and then the critical faculties work for it. Those experiences never worked with hermeneutic practices.

In the 2012 event, the production of ‘experience’ did not follow the linear structure and they were not dramatic but rhetorical. At the beginning of the event in 2012, the announcer said the candidate arrives like an omnipresent body, like a God. In the simulative electoral campaign, the designers’ team utilised the misinterpreted Hindu ritualistic logic of ‘truth’. The performance making process used ‘meaning’ with ‘technology aided’ advertising techniques for the illusionistic presence of performer/candidate body. The engagement of materiality produced an ‘experience’ which used illusion and rhetoric motive. The 3D holographic performance manifested virtual and wonder ‘experience’ and here the referential ideas of ‘truth’ and ‘meaning’ were used for ‘experience’. Here the candidate’s performer-body became a product for the team and their ultimate goal was to sell it and make the maximum reach for the companies. The advertising companies mix the ideas of ‘truth’ and ‘meaning’ with the products. The candidate’s performer body is covered with traditional/mythical-techno materiality. The design team conceptualises and campaign-strategists advertise the election manifesto through the candidate’s performer-body. The designer mainly used technology to create this mythical atmosphere for the launching of this product. The designers’ usages of the atmosphere through experience were totally different from the dramatic compositions.

In the 3D holographic electoral campaign performance making process, the use of performance experience has the utilisation quality which influenced the public. The designer Shankar said about the candidate-body and proximity with the public in 2012 Gujarat election “... there is no Z plus security, so people feel the proximity to him. Sitting at 200ft in a regular public meeting, Modi is unreachable” (Nair). The aesthetic experience of ‘unreachability’ with touch, smell and taste and ‘reachability’ with sound and seeing was a shift in the field of live experience in Indian performance. Through the audio and visual 3D aesthetics, the new aspects of corporeality and spatial aspects of space were experienced in a

‘live virtual’ way in Gujarat in 2012. The real experience of the body and its identity was connected with its proximity. Gopal Guru and Sundar Sarukkai quote the words from Merleau –Ponty in their book thus: “Although there is no identity of the touching and touched hand, this process’ opens’ the body in two. Merleau –Ponty uses this analysis to argue for the notion of ‘identity –within difference’ in the sense that the touching hand is different from the touched hand (although both ‘belong’ to the same body)” (qtd in 175). 3D holography used for the electoral campaign helps the candidate to protect his body for security reasons as well as making the body split ‘into two’. Here the performer’s aura on the candidate-body splits the body ‘into two’. Apart from the simultaneous appearances in 53 places, the presence creates an atmosphere of otherness. Media called it illusion but it can be termed usages of contextual values to experience in the neoliberalised technological time. Here the team tried to make the event homogenous rather than ‘democratising’ (Benjamin 14-15) the experience. The event used the vernacular and urban Indian material values alongside the London based company’s technology. Pepper’s Ghost in the nineteenth century at London Polytechnic was not meant to be a simulative performance. His lecture demonstration and illusionistic theatre shows were aimed at clarifying and explaining science and reason to people, beyond notions of the divine. Dr Pepper used illusion for his theatrical performance as a ‘cultural form for knowledge’, within the structure of ‘entertainment’ aesthetics. In the event in Gujarat, the designers mystified reason to create an illusion using technology and designed it as a performance which foregrounds the concept of the divine for reaching voters in the electoral campaign. With the advanced technological capital, the identity and experience of the vernacular culture and political party’s agenda produced a candidate ‘body mass’ which was sustained via 3D holography to voters in different spaces.

Maximum spaces and maximum people in a limited time with the designer’s presence of the candidate’s 3D body were the main technical transformative points of the event. The

designer's team announced before the event on 29 November 2012: "We bring to you the first of this kind technology aided election campaign" (Namo Gujarat 00:00:53-58). In Gujarat state, the candidate at a time gives a speech to thousands of people in 26 different locations in different districts. Here in the campaign, the candidate-body/performer-body carried an aura through 'strategic materiality' rather than being invested with 'meaning' with his simulative immaterial 'presence'. Fischer-Lichte's writes on four strategies in performance, in the book, *TPP*, regarding performative 'generation of materiality' thus: "first, reversing the relationship between the performer and their role; second, emphasizing and exhibiting the individual performer (-body); third, highlighting the performer (-body)'s fragility, vulnerability, and shortcomings; and fourth, cross-casting" (08). Drawing from Fischer-Lichte's words, the candidate-body/ performer-body in 3D holography technique used in the campaign is "emphasizing and exhibiting the individual performer (body)" (Fischer-Lichte 82) to make it productive. In the electoral campaigns' performance making process, the election party and campaign worked to build this strategy oriented performance practice. In his rhetoric speech, the candidate directly asked the public to vote for him in the coming elections. Here the 'strategy' of voting was influenced by preplanned performance making process and its engagement of materiality. The electoral campaign 'strategy' was engaged with the performer body and used a materialistic atmosphere in the 3D holography electoral campaign. In the 2012 November – December performance event, the 3D simulative designs were used as an effective way to design an 'experience' of the 'real' and of 'illusion' for a political agenda, rather than conveying 'truth' or 'meaning'. Here the event performance making process has a 'cultural industry' structure and the 'experience' of it became an 'end product'.

2.2: Materiality

The theorisation of 'materiality' and its opposition on metaphysical terms happened widely in the twentieth century from Marxist writings. The arguments about materiality in the

disciplines of Medical Science, Finance, Pure Science, Trade, Theology, Cognition, Art and Architecture generated a wide range of discussions. This section will focus on the unique nature of materiality at the time of globalisation mediated through digital technology. OED defines ‘materiality’ thus: “The quality of being composed of matter” (“Materiality”). In Modernist times, the concept of materiality changed to its contextual value. The pre-modern thought of ‘authenticity of materiality’ and its signifier varies here. The Marxist materialist and philosopher Walter Benjamin writes about the democratisation of art in film and photography, he argued in *The Work of Art in the Age of Its Technological Reproducibility, and Other Writings on Media*’ that,

In even the most perfect reproduction, one thing is lacking: the here and now of the work of art-its unique existence in a particular place. It is this unique existence- and nothing else- that bears the mark of the history to which the work has been subject ... The here and now of the original underlies the concept of its authenticity, and on the latter in turn is founded the idea of a tradition which has passed the object down as the same, identical thing to the present day. (21)

Benjamin’s arguments on authenticity with ‘here and now’ leading to the concept of ‘lack of aura’ and it builds a similar new wave in the world of art, media and performance disciplines. The emergence of digital technology developed a new dimension in the knowledge and artistic practice systems. In Performance Studies, Philip Auslander questions the entity of the embodiment of the body after the evolution of digital performance. Auslander argued in his book, *Liveness: Performance in a Mediatized Culture* that digital performance is live and it has a quality that is more advanced than conventional ‘live performance’, because of its ability to reach maximum people at a time. Performance Studies scholar Peggy Phelan wrote questioning and critiquing Auslander’s arguments on ‘Liveness’. Phelan explains that the

performance cannot transfer to any other medium because the live performance has a momentary quality and it cannot be archived. Phelan argues in the book titled *Unmarked: Politics of Performance* that the live performance resists the reproduced versions of performance, to stay true to its ontological nature of 'ephemeral'. Phelan states,

Performance's only life is in the present. Performance cannot be saved, recorded, documented, or otherwise participate in the circulation: once it does so, it becomes something other than performance. To the degree, that performance attempts to enter the economy of reproduction it betrays and lessens the promise of its own ontology. (146)

Philip Auslander counter-argued to Phelan's arguments on ontology and economy of repetition in his article titled "Against Ontology: Making Distinctions between the Live and the Mediatized". Auslander says, "Economy may be a more significantly oppositional gesture than asserting the value of live" (51) and he concluded the article as "very concept of live performance presupposes that of reproduction, that the live can exist only within an economy of reproduction"(55). Disagreeing to both to Phelan's and Auslander's arguments, Fischer--Lichte argued that the documentation will lead to creating open discussions on its dated environment via media like video, photographs, and writings. And it projects the "fundamental ephemerality and uniqueness characteristic of performance" (75). Drawing from Fischer-Lichte's argument, this section will analyse the performance making process and the documentation of the event. The question of materiality is examined in relation to the performance making process of the holographic campaign. The 2012 performance event has introduced a new concept of materiality which was not implemented in the Indian electoral campaign before.

The question of the materiality of the event has to be addressed at two levels. First, the presence of holographic equipment, trucks, mechanisms, and manpower which constitute

the visible concrete material for the event and the second is the broadcasting team and techniques of 3D holography which belong to an immaterial realm in terms of their physical presence at the event. In the event, the concept and practice of materiality functioned in three areas of the performance making process. First, at the studio, for live shooting. Second, at the level of computer-generated editing in the design ware lab, 3D works for holography for broadcasting and third at the level of the execution of 3D holographic projection in 53 event centres. From the previous analysis in Chapter One about the three phases, there is a need to examine the concept of scale, value, and experience of candidate performer body and atmosphere to understand its materiality. Shooting the real 'performer-body' and transferring it to 3D holographic data and then broadcasting to the 53 areas transformed the materiality of candidate-body and atmosphere. The data was transformed via satellite technology and presented in the real scale of the performer-body, creating an illusion to the viewer and oppositional political parties. Here materiality of candidate-body and studio atmosphere was transferred to 3D data and projected as a 3D holographic projection.

Fischer- Lichte writes, "The performance's specific materiality, however, eludes one's grasp. The performance brings forth its materiality exclusively in the present and immediately destroys it again the moment it is created, setting in motion a continuous cycle of generating materiality" (76). The materiality, in this case, functioned with a structure to create an atmosphere in performance. The structural form and atmosphere of the event were designed with simulative formations. There is a need to examine the design of the simulation in the electoral campaign.

2.3: Simulation

With technological development mainly the computer and the internet, the concept of simulation became an important area in media, education, entertainment, product launchings, and visual arts. Television and Media Studies developed the major philosophies on

simulation. OED defines ‘simulation’ as “Simulate – imitate the appearance or character” (“Simulate”). The presence of television and media during the Gulf War has created a greater impact and affected public sustainability. French philosopher Jean Baudrillard writes on Disneyland in America in his book, *Simulacra and Simulation*, thus: “Disneyland exists in order to hide that it is the ‘real’ country, all of ‘real’ America that is Disneyland ... Disneyland is presented as imaginary in order to make us believe that the rest is real, whereas all of Los Angeles and America that surrounds it are no longer real, but belong to the hyperreal order and to the order of simulation” (12). Baudrillard’s arguments directed a wide range of dialogues on simulation and contributed ‘real’ and ‘unreal’ in the realm of the mediated world. Baudrillard’s work on the Gulf War titled *The Gulf War Did Not Take Place* (1995) opened up the discussion on how State and military used media for promoting war. And politically and diplomatically the United States of America used media for creating trauma with the Gulf War. This chapter does not follow Baudrillard’s idea of simulation because the section critically engages with the performance aspects of different forms as mentioned in the chapter and will now draw from Performance Studies discipline to understand simulation.

The ideas and practices of simulation in theatre and performance have transformed radically after the technological revolution in the twentieth century. In the history of performances, being other or double, making otherness through materials and atmosphere and believing it as real was prevalent from primitive times. But from the digital era onwards, the concept of simulation and its embodiment has undergone a shift and created a new wave of concept and practice. American theatre academic and practitioner Matthew Causey discusses simulation in theatre in his work titled *Theatre and Performance in Digital Culture: From Simulation to Embeddedness* (2006), Causey points out how the performance and telepresence functions in a three dimensional way. Causey has worked on the innovative

works of American performance group Wooster group and Italian theatre group, *Societas Raffaello Sanzio*'s works. Causey has written on director Romeo Castellucci and Frank Dell's *Temptation of St Anton*. Causey writes on how materiality and aesthetics are structured and about it's working in contemporary times. The main arguments are the experience of the subject as being in a virtual environment simultaneously, the contradictions on materiality and embodiment. This book marked the arrival of major discussions on Castellucci's post-human design and its aesthetics.

The video and internet games and commodity version of 'Avatar' and their social media usages created an interactive relationship with the spectator and medium. OED defines 'avatar' as "An icon or figure representing a particular person in a video game, Internet forum, etc" ("Avatar"). The possibility to create a simulation of Avatar in games and 'Alter Ego' websites like 'Second Life' marked innovations of an identity of the body and its corporeality in social media. In 2003 an American company called the 'Linden Lab' created the online virtual world called 'Second Life' which was used by millions of users ("About Linden"). It was affected in the performance structure too. The user's graphical representation in the virtual world gave a new version to the technological reproduction simultaneously with role play interactivity. The contradiction between the identity of the user in the virtual world and corporeal aspects in the real world created posthuman ways of enquiring about real and virtual identity. In the virtual world, the multimedia online interactivity like games and 'Second Life' versions contributed new arguments on the concept of simulation regarding its ethics vs. aesthetics.

The performance histories of simulation in India can be seen in the fields of ritualistic, religious and entertainment. The aesthetics of simulation in India was interlinked with the idea of double or illusion. From the nineteenth century onwards, a popular entertainment theatre *Surabhi* theatre in Andhra Pradesh used illusionistic technologies for popular theatre

performance. In 1885 Chinna Ramayyah founder member of the *Surabhi* theatre who invented ‘gimmicks and trick’ scenes in *Surabhi* theatre used “Lord Vishnu materialising on the stage... Narada traversing the air” (“Introducing gimmicks”) which was based on illusionistic techniques. The techniques used were, mechanical technologies, lights and sounds, fireworks and perspective manipulations. The idea of simulation until the time of colonialism was materialistic and used different forms of magic. From 1896 onwards the ‘Bioscope’ was used at Calcutta (Dwivedi and Showkat Khan) and its reproductions popularised a simulative awareness in local areas about urban spaces and monuments in India. The simulative ‘moving images’ of ‘Taj Mahal’ in Agra, ‘The Gateway of India’ in Mumbai, ‘Red Fort’ in Delhi etc became a visual experience in those times made possible through the bioscope. It created an imaginary vision on urban monuments in Indian villages. Parsi theatre’s ‘perspective’ oriented performance also used mechanical technologies. The company theatre and Parsi theatre created a perspective oriented commercial theatre in modern India. Its hybrid forms and melodramatic textual performance slowly changed ‘social realistic’ drama in India. Some groups like Natyamanvantar Ltd in Bombay, Maharashtra tried to create a design-oriented materialistic entity to Indian theatre in a naturalistic structure. Photography and film contributed to the reproduction of aesthetic practices and democratising ‘emotional histories’ in colonial India.

The uses of virtual concepts changed the corporeal and spatial ways in 3D holographic simulative representations. From 2011 onwards the event management groups and social networking teams became a part of the electoral campaign. The Indian version of the American APCO company models changed the structure of electoral campaign spaces in India. In those events, the candidate’s performance speech became an illusionistic ‘real’ experience to the public. The illusion of creating a performance like magic shows, laser shows, video projections was mainly performed at night time for its effective use of darkness and to hide the performance making equipment. But 3D holographic campaigns were done

during the day time. The Hindu newspaper reported on April 2014 about the Andhra Pradesh and Telangana election thus: “The most significant differentiator from earlier campaigns is that devices can be used during day time also. This means political leaders can reach out to more people, creating maximum impact...” (Somasekhar).

The 3D Holographic electoral campaigns were scheduled during the day and night times intended for ‘creating maximum impact’ to interact and influence voters. Here the simulative event questions the method of conventional aesthetics of ‘time, space and body’ in performance. Those manifested a new form of aesthetic that can broadcast the corporeal and spatial aspects of materiality in performance. Here the designer’s team targeted the simulative presence with new design concepts of materiality.

2.4: Corporeality: Candidate Body to Performance Body.

In the 2012 Gujarat election, the limited period for campaign directly or indirectly contributed to a public performance-based campaign in which the candidate interacted with voters. The body of the candidate-body presented as a larger than life body through the 3D holographic performances and technological intervention. The body of the candidate is designed and given a certain value via 3D technology. The given performance value is carried out by ‘showing’ or ‘presenting’ the candidate body to the public. For contributing more viability for the body with communication the high tech broadcasting media support used. Here the body of the candidate has undergone transformation with its high tech performance aspects. Lance Price states how it was different from other electoral campaigns around the globe by showcasing the ‘body’ in public events through high technology in his book. Price wrote:

Political parties in Britain, Australia, and North America pride themselves on the sophistication of their election strategies, but Modi’s campaign was a master-class in modern electioneering. His team created an election Machine

that broke new ground in the use of social media, the internet, mobile phones, and digital technologies. Modi took part in thousands of public events, but in such a vast country it was impossible to visit every town and village. The solution? A ‘virtual Modi’ –a life-size 3D hologram –beamed to parts he could not reach in person. (Price)

Here in that designed situation, the candidate's body has broken conventional problems or limitations of ‘impossible to visit’ maximum constituencies during this short period. The life-sized 3D hologram made it possible to reach in person and made the omnipresent situation of the candidate. The ‘Virtual Modi’ concept and its implementation pushed the campaign to reach to more voters without his ‘flesh’ body in person and that became a new strategy in the history of electoral campaigns. This has to be considered as a new point in performance practices. The technological broadcasting with holography contributed a virtual tangibility to the body. Here the conventional notion of body and its tangible and ephemeral aspects underwent a major shift. The shift was based on the ‘embodiment’ of performance body with technology. Fischer-Lichte writes on embodiment as: “emphasizing the bodily being-in-the-world of humans, embodiment creates the possibility for the body to function as the object, subject, material, and source of symbolic constructions, as well as the product of cultural inscriptions” (89). In the electoral campaign, the virtual body became a site for ‘cultural inscriptions’ that is more layered with performance aspects. Those performance aspects using 3D holographic technology strategies were totally different from the body-centred performance seen in the theatre. The 2012 event performance was never recognised as a theatrical performance and not followed conventional actor to character process in the electoral campaigns.

In political performance art and body art, the performer’s body becomes the manifested body in its practices. In theatre, European Avant-garde theatre philosopher,

director, and actor Antoine Artaud developed the understanding of the body in metaphysical terms. In his book, *Theatre and its Double*, he writes on structures beyond the ‘occident paradigms’ like Balinese theatre thus: “body in ‘trance’ and ‘cosmic forces’”(65). Beyond the nineteenth century, anthropological and social science aspects of flesh, the revival of ritual based ‘holy body’ created a contradiction in the creative process. The body-centred actor and performer-related theatre concepts and spiritual practices were constituted with the influence of Polish theatre director and philosopher Jerzy Grotowski. Grotowski writes in the book titled *Towards a Poor Theatre*, about Artaud’s concept of “cosmic signs” and “gestures evoking superior powers” from the context of ‘Balinese performance’(121). He states that they become “creative possibilities” and discuss how it became knowledge and original sources for an acting discipline. Grotowski underlines that Stanislavski and Brecht did not understand this acting discipline because of their attention on “natural impulses” and “construction of role” (*ibid*) respectively.

Comparing Grotowski’s theatre with philosopher Merleau-Ponty’s concepts on ‘sensual’ and ‘flesh’ with ‘embodiment’ Fischer-Lichte states, “Merleau-Ponty thus cleared the path for a new application of the term ‘embodiment’ as it is used today in cultural anthropology, cognitive sciences, and theatre studies. Merleau –Ponty’s contribution to philosophy is comparable to Grotowski’s to theatre” (83). In the 3D holographic electoral campaign, the engagement of body is ‘flesh’ related; but those experiences became ‘virtual’, ‘sensual’ and ‘embodied’ and the voters experience it as ‘real’. The conventional nineteenth-century Freudian ‘mind’ based acting aspects and Grotowski’s ‘body’ based acting underwent significant changes. During broadcasting, the high tech performance is never connected with ‘mind’ and ‘body’ centric acting and it added a ‘virtual performance value’. Those structures counter the ‘well made’ and ‘realistic’ acting and promote the corporeal aspects of the body rather than ‘acting’. From technological reproduction and digital age, the

possibility of presence or absence of a performer body contributed to a new approach on corporeal aspects. Ted Toadvine and Leonard Lawlor edited a book titled *Merleau-Ponty Reader*, on the shift of body to corporeal and in the chapter “Man and Adversity” states,

Our century has erased the dividing line between “body” and “mind”, and sees human life as through and through and corporeal, always based upon the body and always (even in its most carnal modes) interested in the relationship between persons. For many thinkers at the close of the nineteenth century, the body was a bit of matter, a network of the mechanism. The twentieth century has restored and deepened the notion of flesh, that is, of animate body. (191)

From these arguments, it can be seen that a special corporeal aspect was manifested via techno-socio-political and consumer strategies irrespective of the candidate's physical presence. The candidate's 3D holographic body presence has a new embodiment. With high-tech technology and PR supervisions, the campaign was addressed and influenced maximum voters via candidate virtual corporeality. Here the transformation of ‘embodiment’ was visible. When one critically analyse the aesthetics of those performance events with the notion of embodiment and corporeality, the section draws from Fischer-Lichte’s writing in *TPP* thus: “Performances mark corporeality as fundamental to the processes of embodiment, regardless of whether they simultaneously bring forth a fictive character...or not, as is often the case with action and performance art” (90). In The 2012 Gujarat 3D electoral campaign, the body of the candidate had mixed corporeality with class, ideology and masculinity. The corporeal aspects contributed to the engagement of materiality and the aesthetic experience to the event which will be examined in detail in the following section.

2.4.1: Corporeal Aspects of Neo –Middle Class

Academic scholar Christopher Jaffrelot writes on Modi's 2012 elections high tech campaign titled "Gujarat Elections: The Sub-Text of Modi's 'Hatrick' –High Tech Populism and the 'Neo –middle Class'". Jaffrelot writes, "During the previous state elections, he had resorted to the internet and mobile phones networks; five years later he made one step further while initiating a TV channel, NaMo channel-that replaced the 'Vande Mataram' he had started in 2007-and a series of virtual meetings"(81). Candidate Modi used technology in his previous elections but the first time used 3D technology in the 2012 election. The public relation agency and political affiliation contributed to the extra ability to using high tech technology. The interaction with the voters can be termed as 'electoral virtual participation' which was limited to campaign period only. Interestingly the 'electoral virtual participation' doesn't appear as tangible to the candidate and voters. The voters' experiences of the campaign and the interaction with the candidate happened in a virtual realm. And those interactive sections with agencies helped to reach the candidate-body to the maximum public in a limited time. Along with the candidate, the campaign supporters, designers, corporate and party volunteers worked for making a campaign based on consumerist structures. BJP organisation and the candidate received the response of audiences from all the places with the help of camera and feedback mechanisms. The candidate's body became visible in a 3D way without glass, and viewers experienced 'real' body mass of candidates. This created an experience of the body in 'supernatural means' or 'high-tech means'.

The structure of those electoral campaigns was influenced by the model of the US presidential elections. Jaffrelot states how the US presidential election has influenced the high tech campaign organised in Gujarat. The election campaign was strategised, organised and managed by the American agency company called APCO Worldwide firm and their Indian team. It is an 'independent global public affairs and strategic communication

consultancy' commissioned by BJP. Jaffrelot discussed how APCO has marketed the candidate in public spaces, "so much so that he addressed 125 rallies in the first 15 days of December, that is ten meetings a day (Dave, K.2012B). Even more than in 2007, Modi saturated the public space as a marketing genius –well advised by an American, APCO Worldwide firm which had already worked for him during the previous election"(81). Here Jaffrelot argued Modi modified his candidate-body and constructed it to address the 'neo-middle-class Hindu body'.

2.4.2: Corporeal Aspects of Hindutva

The concept of 'hyper image – conscious' was the main mesmerising illusionistic experience of the event. Jaffrelot writes, "Modi's hologram appeared on stage in 3D simultaneously in different locations (26 on December 2, for instance) to deliver his speeches to massive audiences which were mesmerized (some of his supporters even wondered: 'Is this real?') A hyper image-conscious Modi was capitalizing on the exceptional power of images in the Indian (Hindu?) civilization" (81). The arguments of Jaffrelot's 'Indian (Hindu?) civilization' can be compared with Indian right-wing nationalist politician and author Vinayak Damodar Savarkar's "a common civilization (Sanskriti)" in the book *Hindutva* (Damodar Savarkar 116).

Savarkar described the concept of 'Hindutva' in his book titled '*Hindutva*' and it became the formal manifesto for the Indian Hindu right-wing movements. His concepts like '*Hindutva*', '*Hinduness*' and '*Hindudom*' raised an argument on race-based homogenous socio-cultural and political formations in India. In the Preface, the publisher S.S. Savarkar quotes from "Who is a Hindu" (02). He writes that Hindu is a person who stays at the land near to the Indus river and to the seas and shares "the identity of the Fatherland with the Holyland" (04). The irony is that the argument on Father –Land became Mother –Land in later movements. Father –Land was a model of the patriarchal structure and drawn from

German and Italian fascist movements. The Indian magazine called 'Open Magazine' published an issue on 'Narendra Modi's election campaign in 2014. It was titled *Triumph of the Will*, referencing to Leni Riefenstahl's Nazi propaganda documentary in the same name ('Narendra Modi'). Savarkar's concept on "a Common nation, race and civilization" (Damodar Savarkar 116) and its altered versions became the fascist motives for the right wing in India.

Academic scholar Eswaran Sridharan in his article titled "Behind Modi's Victory" describes the BJP and its Hindu nationalism in India and how the majoritarian Hindu identity became a threat to the democratic system in India. On majoritarianism in the 2014 General elections in India, Sridharan writes, "The emerging situation combines the promise of faster growth and poverty reduction (in a more market-oriented economy) with the danger of Hindu majoritarianism" (31). In the 2014 election, the majoritarian Hindu identity was used as a wall against poverty. The structure of the 2012 Gujarat electoral campaign's updated version was used for the 2014 general election: A new party system in contemporary India manifested with the idea of majoritarian identity. Here the candidate and his body connected and manifested with the political affiliation of the 'Hindutva body' was mobilised for achieving success. The 'candidate-body' was working as a signifier for 'Hindutva' in the campaign. The BJP's political manifestation is based on the idea of 'Hindutva' which is propagated by its parent organisation *Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh* (RSS), the Indian right-wing organisation.

Anthropologist and academic scholar Shiv Visvanathan in his work "The Remaking of Narendra Modi" argues that Modi started his political career as an RSS full-time volunteer called *pracharak*, then step by step achieved the position of Chief Minister. By working on the fascist agenda of Hindutva and RSS, Modi redesigned his body and lifestyle. Visvanathan writes that Modi's connection with film, corporate and technologies is huge in the times of

neo-liberalisation. He states on the Hindutva influence in Modi thus: “He (or I guess his PROs) disaggregated elements of his Hindutva to create a new image. Hindutva or the RSS training evoked the state as the God of society, organisational skill, asceticism, a cultural embedding of ideas, a sense of competence as machismo, a clear idea of history. Modi presented himself as the Vivekananda in politics” (03). Here the new image through socio-religious- political - and cultural identity contributed an extra *machismo* body to the candidate. His diplomatic and double stands inside India and abroad were like melodramatic Bollywood emotional scenes. The campaign was a typical example of Hindutva working with the aid of high tech technology. The financial support for the campaign came from the diasporas and Hindutva sympathisers and implemented the charisma of “technocracy” (Visvanathan 10). The Hindutva empathy created affection to the candidate and that affection amassed vote to the candidate. For these ways, the candidate received more votes and became Chief Minister for the third time. The affection created by the candidate is not for his mental or intellectual process but it's manifested through the manifested corporeal aspects body. In the campaign, what is displayed is the Hindutva masculine identity using sophisticated technology, and it is received virtually by the Indian neo middle class.

2.4.3: The Corporeal Aspects of Hindu Masculinity

In Indian patriarchal society, Hindu masculinity and Hindutva notions were committed to forceful supremacy after the demolition of Babri Masjid in 1992. Savarkar's, “Father –Land” (Damodar Savarkar) arguments and its political alternatives received a neoliberal form with globalisation in the 2012 electoral period. Academic scholar Sanjay Srivastava writes on Modi's masculinity in the background of 2014 general election in his article titled “Modi –Masculinity: Media, Manhood, and ‘Traditions’ in a Time of Consumerism”. Srivastava writes that Modi's public relationship was manifested with his “forceful masculinity” of leadership and the structure of it was borrowed from U.S.

“presidential” campaign (334). Those were remaking the ‘traditional masculinity’ with territories of nationalism in electoral campaigns. Srivastava writes,

Notwithstanding the “traditionalist” casting of the discussion –including invocations of family-life and virility –Modi –masculinity should, in fact, be seen as a specific effect in the times of consumerist modernity. While borrowing from pre-national and nationalist ideas, Modi –masculinity's peculiar characteristic lies in its judicious presentation of Indian manhood as both deeply national (and hence territorialized) as well as global (and de-territorialized).(335)

Srivastava points out, how the body of the candidate was designed with “consumerist modernity” in a “territorialized and de-territorialized” (ibid) situation during the electoral campaign (ibid). The candidates’ special characteristic of body language, gestures, speeches, costume, presentation, and images produced that designed masculinity. Here the post-1991 Hindu traditional masculinity became the reference to create a Hindu ‘candidate-body’ in 2012 and 2014. The ‘candidate-body’ embodied the personal, branded, manifested, high-tech and corporeal aspects. It has an embodiment of performance aspects.

In the event, the high-tech technology, PR agencies, the Neo middle class, masculine structure, Hindutva ideas, and consumerist culture together produced the candidate’s performance body. Those were crossing the periphery of a ‘flesh’ body because the ‘3D virtual body’ can reach the voters in real time with high-tech broadcasting technological support. The manifested embodiments of corporeal aspects changed the candidate-body to performer-body and here the corporeality technologically created a ‘virtual body’ for getting the maximum vote.

2.5: Immaterial Labour

New discussions on immateriality, immaterial labour, and digital labour developed in the last decades of the twentieth century. OED defines ‘immaterial’ originated from Latin “which means from im- ‘not’ + materialis ‘relating to matter’ (“Immaterial”). There are much information and studies on the viewers’ experience on the 3D holography events but there is a lack of data and study on the designers who worked for the event. The designers became invisible and immaterial labour. Here in this section will explore the concept of immateriality with those designers labour.

The Marxist discussion on labour in ‘General Labour’ and ‘Intellectual Labour’ created critical approaches to the study of labour. Adorno and Horkheimer’s essay “Dialectic of Enlightenment” examines the materiality of labour in factories. Critical analysis of Marxian ‘labour’ and new theorisation on labour materiality has marked new philosophical knowledge on the characteristics of labour and materiality. Italian Marxist philosopher Paolo Virno writes on the production process with machines rather than living labour in the book, *A Grammar of the Multitude*. Virno writes,

Where an extrinsic ‘end product’ is lacking, there lies the ground for political action. I should clarify: in the culture industry (as is the case, after all, today in the post-Ford era for industry in general) the finished products which can be sold at the end of the productive process are surely not scarce. The crucial point is, though, that while the material production of objects is the delegated to an automated system of machines, the services rendered by living labor, instead, resemble linguistic –virtuosic services more and more.(58)

The post-Fordian era contributed to a major shift in the socio economic conditions of labour with the introduction of technology in automobile industry which affected the

labour system worldwide in the last decades of the twentieth century. In Henry Ford's factories, the manual labour system which produced automotive products transformed into "automated system of machines" (ibid). Here the new information technologies produce "virtuosic services" (ibid). Similarly, when culture also becomes an industry, like the post-Fordian era, the production of 'end product' also transformed with the use of information technologies. Here the notion of creative labour also underwent transformations. In the case of the 2012 event, the designers worked as creative labour which was not visible during the time of campaign and after. The living designer's labour and his/her skilled aesthetics were used for the client for producing a commodity. The uses of the campaign followed an industry-work model. It was working as a 'culture industry' with the engagement of design labour. The immaterial labour for the electoral campaign process used an industrial management system. The labour of designers' team who conceptualised and executed these events and others was immaterial. Apart from 3D holography, the total election conceptualising team for materialising campaign like Piyush Pandey (Price 183), Prasoon Joshi, Sam Balsara (qtd in Pal 384) were working for governing and making a more effective structure for the electoral campaign.

The design team, the shooting teams, the editing and VFX team, the broadcasting team, the technical execution team, the event management team, container truck team, the feedback camera team and the data collecting team were invisible in the 3D Holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat on 2012. This massive number of Indian and foreign designers worked without their identities. The performance making process of the campaign was under the hierarchy of capital. The invisible designers who worked for the design were shown as immaterial labour drawing from Arjun Appadurai's arguments on hierarchical connection with 'remote' (Appadurai). Their designer identity became immaterial labour and they became 'creative labour' for the event.

Italian sociologist philosopher Maurizio Lazzarato wrote an article titled “Immaterial Labour” in the book, *Radical Thought in Italy: A Potential Politics*. In relation to labour and computer technology for consumer tastes, Lazzarato writes on the commodity with two variations. They are “informational content” (Lazzarato 133) and “cultural content” (ibid). The first one is computer generated and the second one is manually created. The cultural content has direct engagement with consumer tastes like fashion. Lazzarato argues that in a further stage of transition from ‘informal’ to ‘interface’ the concept of labour became ‘interface’. In the digital era with the uses of technological tools, the concept of ‘collective’ and ‘participation’ became immaterial. The structure of ‘immaterial production’ in post-industrial society has been producing its own ‘classical’ forms which question the ‘classical definitions of ‘work and workforce’ and includes “audiovisual production, advertising, fashion, the production of software, photography, cultural activities, and so forth” (137). Lazzarato points out that this happens because of the multiplicity of work skills that include “intellectual skills, as regards the cultural-informational content; manual skills for the ability to combine creativity, imagination, and technical and manual labour; and entrepreneurial skills in the management of social relations and the structuring of that social cooperation of which they are a part”(137). This post-industrial transformation of a commodity from the previous ideological positions happened in the digital era. In that era, the labour product became virtual with immateriality.

In the case of the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat, the labour and the process of experience were immaterial. Lazzarato examines the “subjective process” of labour engagements and how it became a tool and generates the “immaterial production” for the “management, communication, and creativity for ‘production for production’s sake’” (135). In the 2012 campaign, uses of 3D holography became

commodity activity. The ‘informal’ and ‘interface’ became immaterial production of performance making process in that event. 3D holography's performance making process was working as an industry for commodity purposes. Here commodity is votes and the process and receptions have the specificity of immateriality. The computer-generated ultra-technological ‘performance making process’ were immaterialised and the creative design labour also produced immaterial-virtual-illusion -materiality.

2.6: Scales and Values in 3D Holography Campaign

Line, shape, colour, and texture are the fundamental elements of scenography in the performance making process. The elements like shape are connected with structure, form and colour and form ways of expression in design. Here the approach on the material decision with shape, the colour etc was designed specially, scenographically for the electoral campaign. This section explores how the scenographic processes affected the concept of scales and values in the public domain.

2.6.1: Scales in 3D Holography Campaign

During the event, the candidate’s body/performer body was simulated through the immaterial digital process and created a ‘scale’ for the ‘presence’ of body and atmosphere. The public experienced it in 3-dimensional ways on the same scale and they experienced this holographic presence as real. Here real and the simulation work with immaterialistic representations and holography. In the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat in 2012, the design team used 3D technology to broadcast the candidate’s body in its actual scale. This scale system is also connected with the standardisation of measurements and values. Usages of scale in mathematics, geology, trade, and music have a common understanding of making material equality with something ‘other’. The ‘other’ will be money, ratio, real space or object, frequency etc. Here both the material transactions use a ‘medium of exchange’ system.

The standardisation of scale across the world happened with knowledge exchanges, through trade and scientific intervention. Scientific exploration and innovation changed the philosophy of 'reason' from time to time. Colonialism altered the total concept of scale in its colonies. After 1620s, at the beginning of the scientific revolution, the Europeans influenced the scale systems and it created new perspectives in India. It was a slow transformation from Arabian scale system to Europeans scale systems through trade and colonialism. Dutch, French, Italian, Portuguese, German and English influences can be seen. The vernacular measuring units and systems underwent a transformation of standardisation and colonial standardised scale system was introduced. Scholar A. Finocchiaro Maurice edited and translated a book titled *The Essential Galileo* describing the way how the world was influenced by the scientific invention of Galileo Galilei (1564-1642). The measuring equipment like telescope, globe, compass, clock, and calendar brought the diverse local scale systems under an umbrella. For instance, the Indian vernacular measuring ways of 'time' duration with sun and shadow shifted to the use of the clock. Lunar and solar based time units were standardised with the arrival of the clock in India. In the case of cardinal directions, the East and the West directions were the main directorial point. With the technological innovations of the compass, the sun and stars (astronomy) based on, for the East, was replaced with side changed to the North Pole. The innovation of compass gave a new direction for land and sea trade. Those changed the vernacular reason of Indian indigenous practices.

Interestingly in Europe, mainly in Italian Art, there is an initial resistance to such scientific types of equipment due to the Catholic religious values. The Italian artistic works before Galileo has the Catholic iconography of the shape of Earth and Moon as a plate and not the globe. Following the model of the solar system by Copernicus, Galileo invented the telescope. After the innovation of 'Galileo's telescope', Catholic iconography of the shape of

Earth and Moon got radically changed. The artist *Ludovico Cigoli's* fresco work after the radical innovation on the moon by Galileo called the *Assumption of the Virgin* (1612) in *Pauline Chapel* at Rome, Italy iconises the moon as the globe and it is under Virgin Mary's leg. It was created with the approval of Vatican Pope. This can be seen as a transformation in the church's position which was ironical after the death of Galileo. The influence of rational thoughts from Galileo, usages of map and globe for navigation initiated a critique against religion and God on the global level. The vernacular scales in different geographical areas were mixed with rational scales on those times. The scientific reasoning transformed the conventional mode of understanding and led to the democratisation of knowledge. With the process of scientific reasoning, the subjective affect was hybridised with the objective entity. The vernacular scale became standardised with the global scales and the vernacular scale practices later became 'myths' to contemporary generations in India. Therefore vernacular scales became vanished or lost.

Negotiation and revolt with scales created hierarchical positions in human history in terms of knowledge. This hierarchical structure has its own politics parallel to its own period. The scales in the Renaissance period in Europe, colonial and post-colonial period in India have shown its own socio-political and economic hierarchy. Examining the scale in the 3D holographic electoral campaign at Gujarat in 2012 will give important data for materiality. In the period of globalisation, the scale and its hierarchy are interlinked with neoliberal policies in India. Catherine McDermott writes on the on 'adaptation on a global scale' and transformation of scale in globalisation in the book *Design: The Key Concepts*, Mc Dermott states,

There is a widespread and shared feeling that we are living in an era of globalization, of multinational business and an increasing homogenization of culture. Globalisation is the process by which companies operate on an

international level and socioeconomic patterns become adopted on a global scale. High profile global brands include Coca-Cola, McDonald's, Pepsi-Cola, Nestle, Mercedes, Disney, Sony, IBM, Toyota, and Kodak. This spread of Western companies to new markets, particularly those in developing countries, began in earnest with the worldwide recession of 1979. (119)

The adaptation of a “global scale” (ibid) in design and its “socioeconomic patterns” (ibid) changed the concept of materiality and performativity with the performance making process. The global scale is different from the concept of “global village” (McLuhan). The scale, size, and proportion are the essential principles of design practice. In the performance making process, these principles make the line and shape of the object. The scale is associated with the size of the object and the proportion of the object is always compared with two objects.

The materiality in 3D Holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat in 2012 used the design aspects of scale. The aspects of scale were used to create an illusionistic material existence with designing, shooting, editing and 3D broadcasting to multiple simulative places and executing it on the same scale to the public. Interestingly those electoral campaigns never used technological reason apart from its illusionistic aspects, because covering distance and data transformation were the main points for technology rather than ‘reason’. The power of capital functions as a catalyst for the materiality in performance design in the electoral campaign. Using European technology behind the Hindutva agenda, the political party of the candidate adapted the scales of his body and space to the voters via broadcasting. The slow transformation of vernacular scale to the global scale happened with the intervention of capitalism. Here the transformation of scale happened through affective virtual ways and data transmissions. The experience from the broadcasted 3D audiovisuals was immaterial. Anthropologist and contemporary scholar Arjun Appadurai discussed the transformation of scale in the time of globalisation in a talk titled *Design Failure and the Globalisation of Risk*.

Appadurai points out that scale in design is connected to the time and space with the hierarchy. The hierarchical connection of 3D holography event can be examined using “space, data access, and remote mental honor control” (Appadurai). The scale became an entity with the quality of plasticity of broadcasting.

2.6.2: Values in 3D Holography Campaign

The history with values was connected with the transformation of ‘medium of exchange’. This section examines how diverse material values are affecting vernacular cultures and materiality. From the time of ‘barter’ system, the value of labour or transaction of material received economic transformation and standardisations. The contradiction between ethics and economical process created frictions on the evolution of values.

In the 3D holographic electoral campaign, the value was bound with physical aspects of body and imitation of the ‘icon’. The ‘icon’ received a contextual shift from private to public in the postcolonial era in India. Here ‘icon’ refers to the candidateship for the Chief Minister position. The concept of ‘icon’ in the electoral campaign has a history starting from the Greek republic. Standing in a market place on a higher stage and rhetoric presentation and getting public attraction was common in Greece. The icon, similarity to it and the projected values generated an influence in public gathering. The icon has a history of public function from primitive to contemporary times. The value of icons became stronger because of its materialistic entity. Whether it is a monarchic, ritualistic or republican society, icons were the major part of the public events. In India, the icon is part of ritualistic practices. The value with the icon got transformed from time to time. Some of the vernacular events received a transformation of values of the icon in the nineteenth and twentieth century with colonial influence.

During the nationalist struggle, the nationalist parties tried to bring together the people of India under the umbrella of a nation with many public activities. Mahatma

Gandhi's Dandi March or Salt March and Swadeshi movements tried to iconise the materials of salt, the spinning wheel called *charkha*, cotton and his stick with the body for nationalistic movements. The usages of indigenous domestic spinning instrument *charkha* became the non-violent ideal and political symbol for the freedom movement in India.

In the 2012 Gujarat election campaign, the candidate used the ideology of Hindu nationalism with his illusionistic holographic performance. The campaign in Gujarat drew from the RSS Hindu nationalism. The ideology of Hindu nationalism holds majoritarian emotional cultural value in India. Along with the use of other media, the campaign team used holographic technology to execute the majoritarian Hindu nationalism. Brita Ohm states on Modi and Media that in 2014 parliamentary election, the mainstream media played a major role in projecting Modi and his political transformations in limelight by keeping aside previous accusations on him (370-377).

The performance shift from private to public sphere became a model for the electoral campaigns in India. The model easily diverts the public collective to vote bank politics through the structures of 'empathy, sympathy and joy'. There is a shift/transformation of technological reason to designed organisational value.

The public gathering like *Ganesh Chaturthi* at Mumbai, Maharashtra (Bhosale 2009) and *Durga Puja* in Kolkata, West Bengal (Thakurta 2015) was part of the social movements. *Ganesh Pujas* or *Chaturthi* became public function after the nineteenth century (Boehmer and Chaudhuri). And those events had a close association with the nationalistic movement in India. From 1893 onwards under the influence of Bal Gangadhar Tilak, *Ganesh Chaturthi* became a public event from the previously privately held household rituals in Mumbai and later to other parts of the country and abroad. In those public events, the scale of the event became transformed with its socialisation and it was one of the important parts of the value of the icon. For *Durga Puja*, the large scale idol of the

Hindu Goddess *Durga* was designed with organic materials in preparations that lasted up to days. From the Ganges, the material suppliers have collected the straws and clays. The main structure was built by using bamboo, mud, and straw. For the body, the sculptors add colour, costumes, and ornaments to the deity. On the *Puja* day, the mud based beautiful deity become the Goddess to devotees. Devotees perform rituals and care the idol like a human being. On the last day of *Puja*, the immersion of Goddess called *Visarjan /Nimanjan* happens in the river. Massive groups of people take the deity to the river Hooghly with dance and percussions. Now for the design, they use plastic, iron, and metallic materials. In some areas, they are using simulative designed idols of Durga. From the nineteenth century onwards, these ways of simulative ways of worshipping and celebrating performance events received transformation. Scholar Tapati Guha Thakurta in her edited work *In the Name of Goddess: Durga Pujas of Contemporary Kolkata* describes the evolution of *Durga Puja* becoming permanent material and ‘work of art’ (Thakurta 2015). Thakurta describes how the concept of aristocratic household *Puja* (*Banedi Bari Puja*) transformed into friends’ *Puja* (*Barowari Puja*) and a public *Puja* (*Sarbojanin Puja*) in Kolkata. Here the public events have contributed materiality with exchange value, surplus value, and transformation of a divine value to the commodity. Takurta’s arguments on the shift from ‘private to public’ has to be examined with Tassi’s arguments on the transformation of ‘truth’ to ‘meaning’ in the modern times (Tassi 185-193). The public gathering event became a work of art in contemporary Kolkata. Fisher –Lichte writes on the transformation of ‘work of art’ into to ‘event’ in contemporary times in *TPP* (Fischer-Lichte 2008). But here contemporary *Durga Puja* became more ‘work of art’ (Thakurta 2015) rather than ‘experience’.

The campaign in 2012 created a material value of the commodity as generating votes from the voters. The media compared the candidate’s presences in multiple places with Indian deities multiple mythological presences. The political agenda was based on religious

values and it used technological simulation, materiality, and mythologies for its articulation. The religious cultural values were signified through myth and the body. The material value was culturally imposed and it becomes an agenda of the candidate's party which was 'Hindutva' values to be executed through designed technological values. Here the embodiment devices were working to construct a performance of affective experience to the spectators. The vernacular/cultural contextual values on materiality with high technology were produced as a commodity materially in this process. This is a mixture of "cult value" and "exhibition value" (Benjamin 26) of the candidate. Thus the values in the campaign were a mixture of vernacular and mediated commodity value.

2.7: Engagement of Materiality

The material values were altered after the emergence of digital technology. Similarly, during the period of globalisation, the use of this technology in art and performance opened an inquiry into the materialistic aspects of the discipline. From the previous analysis, it can be seen that the materiality in the event was interlinked with the concept of immateriality.

The usages of the 3D holographic illusion technology with simulation in the election campaign created an affective experience for the public. Drawing from Lazzarato's statements on the public who 'became the model of the consumer (audience /client)', the reception which is 'a creative act' here transformed into the model of consumption. The end product became 'a commodity' (145). For the affective reception of that event through the designing process, the pan Indian designers' team and designers from abroad used in vernacular contextual values with advanced technologies. For creating those values, the uses of material and immaterial design helped to create a 'presence' of the candidate in a simulative way in 53 places. The designer labour also became part of the commodity here and it was immaterial labour. Designers transformed myth and memory to history which is a postcolonial exercise, and created an imaginary past with a political agenda. They designed

the ‘presence’ of the present with the ‘created past’. The designed illusion became one of the main aesthetic tools in the campaign. Fischer-Lichte writes on ‘presence’, in the book *TPP*,

The illusion created by the technical and electronic media is often even more successful than illusionistic theatre in triggering strong physiological, affective, energetic, and motor reactions in the spectators. Crucially, however, the illusion does not bring forth the performer’s phenomenal body as present. Yet, the effect and impression of presence rather fulfills the promise of happiness implicit in the civilizing process by immaterializing the performers’ actual physicality and disembodimenting them. Their presentness is to be experienced solely as an aesthetic appearance, lacking any real, material physicality. (100-101)

Drawing from Fischer –Lichte’s arguments on presence, it can be assumed that the chain of every “presence” (ibid) and its material entity in multiple times create its own values. The immateriality of performances, music and visual arts also affected the viewers’ receptions with new ‘aesthetic appearance’. Contemporary performance theorist Philip Auslander argued about immateriality in his article titled “Music as a Performance: Living in the Immaterial World” thus: “Such performances are constructed in the fans’ own mind, primarily from listening to sound recordings...Although such performances of popular music are immaterial, they are not truly disembodied” (263). The audiences’s reaction with the recorded immaterial music is visible in Auslander’s words. On the 2012 event, the spectators’ reactions were reported by news agencies using the words like ‘mesmerized’, ‘amazed’ and it is a good example of mediated experience. In *TPP*, Fischer –Lichte’s writing on the spectators’ technological mediation and their corporeality contributed to a process of civilising as described by Norbert Elias as “civilizing process” which happen through the interactive participation of performer and spectators thus:

the civilizing process as a constantly progressing process of abstraction in which the distance between human beings to their own bodies and to those of other human beings steadily increases (1978). This process of abstraction reached its zenith with the development of new media beginning with the invention of photography: bodies evaporate into media images, far away despite the ostensible proximity, precluding all physical contact. (92)

Here in the 2012 event, the performance aspects used were uninformed during the campaign and it created a counter to the “civilizing process” (92,100-101) with the interaction of performer and spectators because the process was a mixture of ‘aesthetic appearance’ and performer hierarchy. The arguments put forth by Fischer-Lichte, “ostensible proximity” (92) has been looked critically in theatre and performance discipline; it is accepted on the kinesthetic aspects of embodiment. Apart from all those performance aspects in the case of electoral campaigns, the materiality worked in a new way which was undefined in terms of performance aspects. Those were the candidate’s virtual performer-body’s material aspects and its experience was different from the conventional theatre or performance art’s engagement. Here the performance structures are hidden and used for strategy focused purpose. Because of this, the “civilizing process” (*TPP* 92,100-101) worked in dissimilar ways in electoral campaign spaces.

The ‘cultural industry’ of 3D holography produced an end product of illusionistic materiality. Here the use of ‘aesthetics’ became a commodity for the event. The consumerist technology tried to homogenise the 3D holographic experience. Here the homogenous event was an individual ‘innovative identity’. Creating a “homogeneous entity” (Fischer- Lichte *PIPC* 07) to a performance culture was limiting and creating ‘unreachable aura’ rather than the aesthetic progression of culture. The 3D holographic presence made an unreachable aura with technological illusion to the public. This is a counter contextual “civilizing process”

(*TPP* 92,100-101) in the era of globalisation. The affective ‘aesthetic appearance’ makes use of a mixed materiality in performance making process using technology. It produced an ‘end product’ of counter contextual “civilizing process” (ibid).

The performance making process of the event was a combination of materiality for the performance, which became an aesthetic shift in Indian performance aesthetic structures. In 2008 Fischer-Lichte founded an advanced studies institution called International Research Center, ‘Interweaving Performance Culture’ under Freie Universitat Berlin, Germany. The English words ‘Interweaving Performance Culture’ translated from the German word called *Verflechtungen von Theaterkulturen*. Fischer–Lichte writes on the multiple layers and functions of interweaving in the book titled *PIPC*, thus:

Many strands are piled into a thread; many such threads are then woven into a piece of cloth, which thus consists of diverse strands and threads... without necessarily remaining recognizable individually. They are dyed, plied and interwoven, forming particular patterns without allowing the viewer to trace each strand back to its origin. On the other hand, a process of interweaving does not necessarily result in the production of a whole. In it, mistakes, errors, failures, and even small disasters might occur when unintended knots appear in the cloth, when threads unravel or flow apart, when the proportion of the dyes is off, or cloth woven becomes stained. The process of weaving is not necessarily result in the production of a whole. (11)

Drawing from Fischer-Lichte’s concept, the performance making processes of the 2012 event was “interweaving” (ibid) with materiality and immateriality simultaneously. The materiality was not compound or underneath any binary concepts, but it was woven with the presence of material and immaterial performance making materials with labour and high tech technology. The engagement of materiality here is an *interweaving materiality*.

2.8: Conclusion

This chapter has summarised the concepts of materiality with its form of engagement and experience in performance. The electoral campaign structure focused on the ‘end product’. The *affective* ways to design ‘experience’ of real and illusion for political agenda became the ‘end product’ rather than passing of the ‘truth’ or ‘meaning’. The materiality section examined how the materiality was a mixture of ‘real’ and ‘virtual’ broadcasting activities and those formed an atmosphere for the ‘end product’ in the electoral campaign. In the simulation, the simulative broadcasting structures were ‘creating maximum impact’ to interact and influence voters and new design concepts of materiality emerged which included mediated corporeality and spatial aspects of materiality. The corporeality section analysed the transformation of candidate-body to performer-body with high-tech technologies and PR agencies. Those aspects were the embodiment of the ‘3D virtual body’ and contributed to performance corporeality. All were designed for vote focusing strategies with the use of ‘3D virtual body’. The electoral campaign was a combination of vernacular and mediated technologies and institutional commodity values.

The section dealt with the illusionistic experience and the performance event produced an end product of experience which was a counter contextual “civilizing process” (Fischer-Lichte in *TPP* 92,100-101) in the era of globalisation. Those techno electoral campaigns and the affective ‘aesthetic appearance’ used new materiality in the performance making process. The new materiality in the 3D holographic electoral campaign can be called *interweaving materiality*. The performance commodity and its politics the constituted of the aesthetic in the campaign. The combination of materiality and immateriality in the performance making processes produced as ‘end product’ which contributed commodity purposes. The linguistic, materialistic, temporal and spatial aspects of materiality got a new form in the 3D holographic electoral campaign through *interweaving materiality*. The

strategy based on *interweaving materiality* was the aesthetics of 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat in 2012.

Chapter: Three

Performativity and Dramaturgy in Electoral Campaigns

Concepts of performativity and dramaturgy were used in new ways in the electoral campaign processes and it was never used in a similar way before in India. The 3D holographic simulative electoral campaign in Gujarat in 2012 can be understood as a performance making process with its new performativity and dramaturgy. This chapter will examine how the concept and practice of new performance aspects, performativity and dramaturgy combined with populism emerged in the time of globalisation. For analysing the concept of ‘performativity’, the chapter will historically trace the post-dramatic structure of performances in India and performativity in public spaces. For understanding the concept of ‘dramaturgy’ in the event, the chapter will look at collective intelligence, salesmanship and branding along with agencies involved for conducting the event.

3.1: Post Dramatic Structure in India

The classical and modern dramatic structures shifted to post-dramatic structure from the beginning of the twentieth century. In the post-globalised era, diverse linguistic identities get visibility on stage. In Marvin Carlson’s essay on the cultural interweaving in theatre “Linguistic and Cultural Interweaving on Contemporarily English and American Stages” in *PIPC*, he writes,

The colonial era and the growing tendency toward globalisation that followed it brought an ever-increasing number of cultures and languages into contact and provided an even greater incentive for dramatists around the world to

explore the phenomenon of cultural interweaving and to employ multiple languages within their plays as a striking tool in such exploration. (223)

The “exploration” (ibid) in postcolonial India was different from other regions of the world. The variety of languages and cultural practices in India demonstrate a different structure. The postcolonial Indian performance practices adopted major theatre aesthetics from the colonial culture. For example, the British Dramatics Act created in 1876 is still followed in India as a law. The Indian theatre spaces still follow dramatic structures and while performance public spaces transformed to post-dramatic structures in a post-liberalised India. From the 1950s onwards, the structure of Indian theatre practices was moulded by Indian nationalistic policies. The formation of Sangeet Natak Akademi (SNA) for promoting music, dance and drama, the first dramatic training institution National School of Drama (NSD), and its festivals and seminars, and postcolonial discourses in theatre and performing arts formulated the contemporary structure of Indian theatre practice. Sangeet Natak Academy organised the first drama seminar in New Delhi, from 25th – 31st April 1956. The seminar focused on the revitalisation of ‘Indian’ performance tradition of India (“Annual Report” 27-38). Thereafter the majoritarian Hindu notion of identity evolved with a non-secular content and created the idea of ‘Modern Indian theatre’ concept. The seminar didn't address the different magnitudes of country's concurrent theatre cultures. In the seminar, the national policies and the revival movement called *Theatre of roots* were re-examined with regard to the embodied knowledge of traditional performing art forms. It tried to revive and reproduce false ‘authentic’ hybrid performance cultures in India and was to be showcased abroad. In the opening address to Indian academies, Late Maulana Abul Kalam Azad stated that,

It will be the aim of this Academy to preserve our traditions by offering them an institutional form... We have met today for the inauguration of the first of these Academies. A brief enumeration of some of the functions of the

Academy will give you an idea of what we expect it to do: To promote research in the fields of Indian dance, drama and music and for this purpose to establish a library and a museum, to encourage the exchange of ideas and enrichment of techniques, to promote cultural exchange in the fields of dance, drama and music with other countries. (“Annual Report” 2)

Azad underlined the need to preserve tradition and proposed the establishment of an institution to offer these traditional arts to ‘other countries’ too. Here Azad’s words signified a postcolonial/nationalist/ nation building intention which would influence policies. In this discourse, one can see the idea of ‘other’ and ‘our’ playing a primary role in nationalist policies. It is not clear what is meant by ‘our’ from ‘other’. In his lecture, Azad makes an argument where ‘our’ is greater without critical engagement on the nationalist arguments and created a ‘homogeneous’ approach to post independent Indian cultural policies. OED defines ‘homogeneous’ as “Of the same kind” (“Homogeneous”). Fischer-Lichte criticises the notion of “homogeneous entities” (07) in her edited work *PIPC* drawing from the reference of Peter Brook’s Intercultural Centre. The ‘intercultural theatre’ approaches contributed a new vision on performance in post- colonial aspects. The revival movement spearheaded by theatre director and pedagogue Peter Brook in France and its global financial support systems utilised this ‘other’ culture for ‘our’ performance cultures along with producing publications and termed it as ‘intercultural theatre’. The concept of his ‘intercultural theatre’ created a binary between ‘our’ and the ‘other’ culture drawing clear-cut boundaries between two cultures. But Fischer-Lichte’s arguments on ‘other’ and ‘our’ with ‘intercultural theatre’ and post-colonialism in the introduction of the book *PIPC*. The book takes a critical look at the Eurocentric notion of ‘other’ and ‘our’. Fischer-Lichte writes,

Cultures constantly undergo processes of change and exchange, which can become difficult to disentangle from each other. Yet, the aim is also not to

erase difference. Rather, the difference in and between cultures are dynamic and permanently shifting. They continuously reproduce themselves anew and must be recognized as such. (07)

Drawing from Fischer-Lichte, the “processes of change and exchange” is relevant in post-independent Indian theatre movement too. It is complicated to draw the European notion on ‘our’ and ‘other’ in India because India still follows the Eurocentric notions and is not yet free from the postcolonial entities. The ‘homogeneous entities’ in India were clearly proposing the uncontaminated puritan concept of culture. This pure concept was connected with the majoritarian traditional and religious values of Indian nationalistic movement. Later those values supported the cultural revival movements in India in the 1960s. Government agencies and private agencies financially supported this ‘our’ movement. But the performing arts and cultural institutions followed the Indian version of European aesthetic and training systems because of the lack of modern pedagogic systems, mainly in dramatic and theatre training in India.

During the Indian theatre revival movement, London Royal Academy of Dramatic Arts (RADA) models and Russian models played key roles in moulding the foundation of Indian dramatics structure. India’s formal theatre training school NSD was a part of SNA “as one of its constituent in 1959” (“About NSD”). NSD which was previously called as ‘Asian Theatre Institute’ funded by UNESCO. The faculty who offered in training in theatre and drama from abroad had taken the mentorship in ‘Asian Theatre Institute’. Theatre director, designer, pedagogue, and art collector Ebrahim Alkazi, who trained from RADA, was the pioneer of this training system to India. He did major theatre works in Mumbai and Delhi. SNA invited Alkazi to restructure a sustainable model for theatre training in NSD. Alkazi became the director of NSD (1962-1977) after Satu Sen (1959-61). Alkazi followed the

RADA pedagogical model to teach NSD students. He restructured the modernistic approaches and European models for dramatic training in NSD. The students followed, negotiated and were against those training practices which were culturally and linguistically alien to them. The Indian newspaper *The Hindu* article titled “Theatre is Revelation” notes Alkazian way of the ‘trauma’ based rogueries theatre training for students in his period at NSD (Ramnarayan). Alkazi’s contribution to Indian theatre was that he gave a structural base for ‘dramatic’ training. Pan Indian, Nepali, and Bangladeshi students were involved in this pedagogic structure in NSD. From B.V. Karnath as a director of NSD (1977-82), the search for the contemporary Indian way of theatre training system started following Alkazian pedagogic structure. It has to be observed critically that the Alkazian training system is still being followed in India but in RADA the training has developed and led to the implementation of new systems in the time of globalisation. The postcolonial aesthetic versions of melodramatics, concepts, structures, and pedagogy are still followed by Indian theatre institutions like an approach. They all come under the umbrella of dramatics. The focus of institutions, conferences (1956) and festivals (1989) manifested a “national theatre” concept in India (Bhargava Dharwadker 12). Thereafter the festival ‘selection committees/directors’ were comfortable with Indian melodramatic or ‘traditional Sanskrit’ theatre aesthetics.

Apart from NSD training, from the colonial period, the *Parsi* melodramatic aesthetics became ideal dramatics for film and theatre. It existed as a parallel form to institutionalised based aesthetic practice in India. The NSD’s and SNA’s national theatre workshops and regional pedagogues followed the melodramatic models. The global movements like avant-garde, absurd theatre, and performance art were not well received in Indian theatre practice. But revival movements and ‘Theatre of Roots’ were active in the 1970s. An institutional approach to build Nehruvian India with traditional elements of culture can be seen there. The

‘Progressive Writers Association’ and Indian People’s Theatre Association (IPTA) also contributed to radical ways of imbibing a training system and aesthetics in India (Bhargava Dharwadker 86).

The imitated and adapted versions of post-Independent theatre underwent changes from the 1980s. After RADA’s influence, works of Habib Tanvir who was trained in Bristol Old Vic Theatre School and was fascinated with Berlin Ensemble and Brecht’s works created a great impact in the Indian theatre scenario. Tanvir came back to India and worked among the tribal community and formed his group called *Naya Theatre* at Bhopal and Chattisgarh (Bhargava Dharwadker 86). His political and vernacular aesthetic worked with European theatre composition in the stage and made a radical shift in postcolonial Indian Theatre movement. Another shift came through Badal Sircar from Bengal. Sircar’s street theatre and “Third Theatre” practices developed a wide range of radical performance forms all over India (Bharucha 38). His approach was totally different from other Bengali directors like Utpal Dutt, Shambu Mitra and even now theatre groups in Bengal, Delhi and Kerala follows his aesthetics.

All these different training systems which include the institutional, group and radical aesthetics created multiple performance structures in postcolonial India. Tanvir and Sircar are radically different from the theatre directors who followed *Theatre of roots* like K.N.Pannikar and Ratan Thiyam (Bharucha 218). Tanvir and Sircar tried to break the dramatic structure of ‘fear, pity and joy’ because of their Marxist critical background and influence of Brecht. Those dramaturgical and critical approaches to the text and form did not go beyond the politics of Left in India. The public performance events were developed in parallel ways with theatre. Beyond academic or festival interests those texts or performances were alien to the regional place. The lack of conceptualisation in Indian theatre resulted in

using the frameworks of European or American concepts and Indian theatre practice deviated totally from that conceptual frameworks. Copying European aesthetics and making it as a post-dramatic theatre in India did not appeal to the public and thus the public became alienated from this 'experimental' wave of theatre aesthetics in India.

From the 1980s onwards, film and TV influenced Indian youth's aesthetic culture in immense ways. Indian theatre culture's conventional dramatic structures underwent considerable changes after the 1990s, and the performance public spaces transformed into a post-dramatic structure at that time. At that time, the focus of the public shifted to the film and TV soap operas and their dramatic episodes became popular. The performance practices in media, public culture, and technology went through a radical shift and it took the understanding of performances and their structures beyond the post-dramatic terminologies. Geeta Kapur writes in an article titled "Dismantled Norms: Apropos other Avant-gardes" on artists who interwove performance with other media like photography, video and installations. 1990s onwards in India, performance artworks emerged. Nalini Malani's work titled *Hamlet Machine* in 1999-2000, Pushpamala N's work titled *Phantom Lady or Kismat* in 1996-98, Rummana Hussain's work titled *Living on the Margins* in 1995 and artist Subodh Gupta's work titled *Untitled* in 1996 marked some of the pioneer performance artworks in India (82, 91, 94). Geeta Kapur in her talk titled "Public Address: Citing Installation and Performance Art" on the works of artist Inder Salim who has done performance art in public space, like cutting his finger and giving it to polluted Yamuna river in 2012, and the work titled *I protest* at New Delhi in 2010 made a new wave of performance works based own marginalised aesthetic and politics (20-22). Geeta Kapur writes on the historical dimension of performance in public domain thus: artistic presentation included performance and has a "transmitting urgency" and "it involves devising formal analogies to arrested speech, unspoken testimony, doubting narratives, camouflaged cues, and problematic resolutions" (2-

3). With the marginalised politics, the visual artist's performance art movement created a parallel level of activities in the public domain within the realm of performance. Indian theatre did not address the global ways of post-dramatic aesthetics and 'performance practices', while the global performance movements influenced public space activities and performances, and they were never accepted as performance activities in theatre sphere.

In 1997, 2008 and 2012 many international residencies were organised in Delhi by the autonomous, a registered society called KHOJ International Artists' Association in relation to live performances, live art festivals and art practice in India in general. In the proceedings of 'Khoj live12' they write, "It plays a central role in the development of analytical, experimental, interdisciplinary and critical contemporary art practice in India, constantly challenging the established thinking about art" (*KHOJLIVE12*). Khoj's activities are funded by international embassies and main works are exhibited among the elite artists and viewers of Indian art and culture. There is an urgent need to analyse these public performance events after globalisation in India. It is not possible to frame Indian performance practices without addressing these in public space events keeping in mind the diverse culture, language and ethnic background of India. With the baggage of colonialism, Indian nationalistic revivalism, popular forms, Indian theatre aesthetic and practices are surrounded by the boundaries of dramatics. Indian theatre pedagogy still follows this discourse of dramatics but there were many valuable interventions and shifts happened within the theatre institutions India.

The shift of 'meaning' to 'sensorial experience' in Indian theatre was vividly executed in the post-neoliberal era. Performance scholar, pedagogue and performance maker Anuradha Kapur gives emphasis to the production process in pedagogy and in students' performance making and materialisation of their concepts in NSD during her teaching tenure till 2012. The first year students who came from the different part of the country were given long class

titled 'production process' which was conceived by Anamika Haksar and later the exercise was redesigned and followed by Anuradha Kapur and Abhilash Pillai. The three months to six months oriented classes started with the modernistic thoughts of 'self' and 'experience'. The process was amalgamated with the performance making elements of acting, behaving, usages of sound and materials, breaking the conventional spaces and advanced technologies. The small duration oriented individual exercise like 'home image', 'window image', 'music image', 'happy moment', and group exercise like 'photo image', and its revised versions created a new performance making process in India contributing to new performative pedagogies. Kapur's process with the concepts and demonstration/presentation amalgamated the use of literary theories, theatre arts, visual arts, popular culture, and cognitive disciplines. Corporeality and materiality employed in the process transformed the concept of 'meaning' to experiential and which created critical sensibility. In the given period of a shared life with the engagement of student bodies in Kapur's process transformed the concept in an experiential way. The 'redo' works, 'brainstorming' group discussions, find outing 'scale and opposite' and collecting secondary data for the works transform a student body to critical and creative body. Kapur's process motivates the student body to cross the limitations and empowers student artistic expressions with articulation. Kapur used a cognitive process for her performance pedagogy. Kapur's performance production process with texts shifts the authority power of the director to a cognitive pedagogue. Kapur's production process of Ibsen's *A Doll's House* at National School of Drama, New Delhi in 2010 and *Ghosts* at Department of Theatre Arts, the University of Hyderabad in 2016 were the major example on performance making process with new approaches in India. Kapur's process on Ibsen's texts has a quality of performativity that goes beyond literature. From 'image' to 'touch', 'perspective' to 'hyperrealism' and 'real time' to 'moment' contributed a new structure that is critically opposite to Ibsen's 'well-made' structure. Breaking the conventional structure of

Ibsen's well-made structure which was followed in India via literature and Theatre, Kapur 'evolved' a structure that produces 'sensorial experience'. This way of the process contributes performativity that is new and a counter structure in the postcolonial conventional mode of Indian Theatre Pedagogy and performance making process.

3.2: Performance and Performativity in Public Space

History of modern theatre pedagogy and the evolution of theories on performance started from nineteenth-century Oxford and Cambridge English departments to drama departments to theatre departments to performing and performance departments. The concept of Theatre Studies shifted to 'Performance Studies' with the influence of Anthropology and American theatre with the contribution of Richard Schechner and Victor Turner. Put forward by Schechner, Brook, and Barba from 1980s onwards, the term 'Performance Studies' began to be discussed in Indian academic institutions also. The studies based on Schechner performance theory followed primarily Sociological and Anthropological disciplines. But connecting to Anuradha Kapur's production process and Fischer-Lichte's arguments on Schechner in *TPP* (22, 41-68), the transformations are incorporated with performer and spectator participation, interdisciplinary theories and connected to its aesthetics.

The concept, practice, and research on Performances in Public Spaces and Performance Art began to be discussed in India theatre institutions in the 1990s onwards only. From 2010 onwards the conceptual framework of the performance went through drastic changes. The concept of performance started to be understood more porously through an interdisciplinary approach rather than strictly Theatre studies or Performance Studies. This came mainly from concepts of critical engagement with performativity in public spaces by non-performance organisations. It is difficult to make a 'conclusion' for the performance because of its spectrum of wide range, Marvin Carlson writes on 'what is performance':

Performance by its nature resists conclusions, just as it resists the sort of definitions, boundaries, and limits so useful to traditional academic writing and academic structures. It may be helpful, then, to consider these observations as a sort of anti-conclusion to a study of this anti-discipline, framed in the mode of self-reflexivity- a mode that characterizes much modern (or postmodern) performative consciousness, whether one is speaking of theatrical performance, social performance, ethnographic or anthropological performance, linguistic performance, or, as in the present case, the performance of writing a scholarly study. (*Performance* 206-207)

This 'anti-discipline' and 'performative consciousness' marked a new wave in performance. The concept of 'performance' and its intervention with technology in Indian public life has to be included in the performance studies as a major field of study and enquiry.

The theatrical performance and its post-dramatic shift to 'performance' concepts were not only related to the architectural atmosphere of the theatre, but to public spaces as well. The various concepts of 'performance' were never implemented in effective ways and not well theorised in Indian theatrical spaces and institutions. 'Performance' has multiple understanding and theorisations in many disciplines. OED defines 'performance' as "The action or process of performing a task or function [mass noun]" ("Performance"). In the twentieth century, the 'performative' concept from John L Austin 1955 lecture series and Judith Butler's writings on "the performative" created the main theoretical argument on performativity in a global level. In Austin's lecture series titled "How to do Things with Words", Austin revisited "performatory" to "performative" and he argues that the idea of 'speaking always involves acting' which formed the base for the main theoretical argument on performativity. He argued that every word when uttered became *performative*. In 1988 Judith Butler writes on "performative" in her essay entitled "Performative Acts and Gender

Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory” (270-82). Butler argues that gender is not based on pre-existing ontological or biological states of the body. It is constructed from the ‘constitution of body act’ (ibid). For that, body acts are working in two ways, they are ‘dramatic’ and ‘non referential’.

Sruti Bala in her article titled “The Entangled Vocabulary of Performance”, writes that there are three main turns happening with performativity which can be termed as “inter-connected landmark”. Those are ‘cultural turn’, ‘linguistic turn’ and ‘performative turn’ (18). Here this section looks at the conceptual arguments on the ‘performative’ turn, looking at it as “a broad spectrum”(Bala 17), taking conceptual arguments from Performance Studies like Fischer-Lichte’s work, *TPP* (24-28) and Carlson's work, *Performance: A Critical Introduction*.

Fischer-Lichte explains in *TPP* that, from 1960-70s numerous theories of performance have been developed in Social Sciences and Theatre Studies. Max Reinhardt’s approaches of “specific materiality of performance” and his innovation of *Hanamichi* in German theatre are the major points of departure for spatial and performance cultures. Max Herrman’s arguments on performance, “performance, not literature, constituted theatre” (1914, 118) and “expressivity and performativity as mutual opposite” made a change in the concept of performativity. Herrmann’s concepts on performativity are different from Austin and Butler’s performativity. He argues that performance is “aesthetically to experience real bodies and real space” (qtd in Fischer-Lichte 36). The concept of performativity is not literature-oriented, because it is based on the subject, object, materials, and semiotics in the performance. Marvin Carlson explains the conceptual stability of performance in multiple disciplines. Carlson writes on anthropologist Richard Bauman’s concept of ‘doubleness’ thus:

all performance involves a consciousness of doubleness, through which the actual execution of an action is placed in mental comparison with potential, an ideal, or a remembered original model of that action. . . Performance is always a performance *for* someone, some audience that recognizes and validates it as performance even when, as is occasionally the case, that audience is the self. (*Performance 5*)

Drawing from Bauman's 'consciousness of doubleness' and performance as always being 'for someone', his ideas were significant in centralising shared experience in performance. The doubleness happens with the live interaction of performer and spectator in performance. The question of ontological existence of the 'live and mediatized' performance and 'ephemerality' in performance contributed to pushing the discussion and practice of performativity further. Philip Auslander's and Peggy Phelan's oppositional arguments opened up the discussion on performativity to a further dimension in times of the digital. The material value was altered after the emergence of digital technology and similarly, during this period, the use of digital technology in art and performance opened the inquiry to the materialistic familiarity of the discipline. From the digital era onwards, the concept and practice of performativity were transformed into new media as well. The emergence of the internet changed platforms and changed ideas of space, body, and materiality.

Time, space and body are the fundamental concepts of theatre practice. Creating multiple ephemeral spaces in a single constructive space with the performer's 'presence' is the main aesthetic practice in theatre. The 'presence' of candidate and public in the 3D holographic electoral campaign became a rare combination of mediated "co-presence". Fischer-Lichte explains in *TPP* that, "The bodily co-presence of actors and spectators enables and constitutes performance. For a performance to occur, actors and spectators must assemble to interact in a specific place for a certain period of time" (32). Taking off from here, the

arguments on bodily co-presence in 3D holographic electoral campaign mark a new point in performance cultures with its temporal aspects.

Geeta Kapur said, in her talk on “Public Address: Citing Installation and Performance Art” at New Delhi, on performative address and space with rhetorical mediation thus; “Inserted into the discourse around population and people, polity and the public; nation-state, transnational citizenry, national and diasporic public spheres; ‘public address’, as I deploy it here, is a rhetorical mediation. But, given that public address is conducted through expressivity and form; articulation and affect, it also implicates aesthetics” (11). The 3D holography via simulation was used for the construction of an organised campaign affect shaped within the ‘relationship with spectatorial reception’. The performativity in 3D holography was different from previous methods. Performativity was used in 3D Holographic electoral campaign and it affected the public. There is a need to explore the ways of performativity in the 2012 electoral techno campaign in detail which will be done in later sections.

Jawaharlal Nehru's midnight address to the public at Red Fort, New Delhi on 1947 August 14 and its radio telecast across India is marked as one of the earliest historical events of radio transmission in India. It was an example of affective performative event in the nationalistic movement and Indian Independence. Christopher Jafferlot writes in his essay “Narendra Modi and the Power of Television in Gujarat” that the former Prime Minister Indira Gandhi used the radio in the 1970s for her media activities in India. The mass media like radio is one of the main media to reach to the public. But radio cannot create an affective experience of the body of the subject beyond sound. In 1991 to 1996, former Prime Minister of India PV Narasimha Rao and his PR team used massive TV advertisements to clarify and get support from the public (Mitra). 2012 3D holographic campaign's main organiser Mani Sankar (Nair) also worked for Rao's advertisements in television. About Sankar's aesthetic

usages of Rao in advertising television video, Anjan Mitra writes in India Today article titled “Doordarshan Lavishes Finance on Producers Playing Narasimha Rao’s Achievements” thus: “the mist clears for a sunny day-to project Rao as a protector. The low-angle shots make him seem like a giant striding forward – leaving the Nehru-Gandhi dynasty conveniently out of focus” (Mitra). The public life after globalisation changed drastically in different ways which make it difficult to understand using the postcolonial narratives and concepts.

From the 1950s onwards, the electoral campaign events applied the usages of performativity in public spaces. Such performative values are used by political leaders in India in their campaigns and public functions with posters, statues, and other media. The usage of street theatre in the electoral campaign was a powerful medium for communicational impacts. Indian Peoples Theatre Association and many political organisations used street theatre for political campaigns. The playwright, theatre director and communist activist Safdar Hashmi used street theatre as a powerful medium for public campaigns and political engagements. His contribution was an important vision to Indian political performance discipline. Hashmi was attacked on 1st January 1989 in between his street theatre performance titled *Halla Bol* and he died the next day. The performance was a part of the electoral campaign in Ghaziabad Municipal election in Shahibabad, outskirts of New Delhi (*Sahmat* 20 5-15). Here the political performance’s direct experience creates a radical application of aesthetic formations in institutions which is not liberation or entertainments. Here the performative process became the “alter process” (Bala 2018) within theatre performance which criticise and not following conventional institutional theatre hierarchy with actor, director, designer dramaturge and other stage designers. Here the idea of ‘performance’ and ‘performative value’ is not used in a conventional institutional theatrical sense; the radical performances in public spheres are not performed in conventional theatre spaces. But it was changed after 1990, with the influence of neo-

liberalisation in India, with the formation of new consumer public spaces. Public gathering spaces, mainly the consumer spaces like shopping malls, product launches and family functions like marriages and birthday parties in convention centres and halls, used performative aspects for numerous purposes. In public life, the concept of performativity is conceived through repetitive ways of activities, campaigns, rallies, advertising, and product launches. Before 2000 in India the private functions like marriage were organised by family and friends and now paid agencies like event management groups are there to execute such community and institutional functions. There is a gradual shift from community-oriented services to paid agencies with the emergence of capitalism. Technological changes and public usages of digital technology contributed substantially to maintain those consumer performative activities.

In the case of Indian electoral campaigns in 2012, it breaks the conventional mode of performance practices and deliberately the rhetoric approaches as aesthetic mediation. In the 3D holographic electoral campaign and its 'rhetorical mediation' with designed 'expressivity and form; articulation and affect', the identity and experience of the candidate's body and mass were transferred via 3D holography to people through the indifferent public spaces. From 2000 onwards in the electoral campaigns, many political leaders used television for their campaigns but in varied perspectives. Development of the internet and telecommunication in the globalised context changed the world economy and data transmission. Jafferlot writes in an article titled "Narendra Modi and the Power of Television in Gujarat" that Modi "has not relied on television alone to promote his image, as evident from the use of holograms" (351). Modi not only promoted his image on television, but he also used social media and other advanced technologies. The use of hologram in the 2012 election campaign was one of the major shifts from television to new advanced medium. It is important to examine how the candidates used the advanced technological

devices mainly the 3D holograms and how the subsequent holographic simulative performativity was generated primarily in 2012 Gujarat elections. The campaign was experienced in a form which is populist (Jaffrelot 346-353) and with data exchanges.

In the twentieth-century, there has been a drastic technological explosion mainly in the domain of transportation. The information that makes the interactions of a print-dominated world seemed easily erased after the print revolution. With the advent of the mechanical and electronic revolution, we have entered into an altogether new condition of neighbourliness, even with those most distant from ourselves. Marshall McLuhan writes on the mediated world as “new electronic interdependence” in the book, *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man*. McLuhan writes on the shift of archive in the time of computer thus: “Instead of tending towards a vast Alexandrian library the world has become a computer, an electronic brain, exactly as in an infantile piece of science fiction” (32). McLuhan theorised the shift of material space and data in a computer world as a “global village”. Arjun Appadurai criticising “global village” (31) in the book titled *Modernity at Large: -Cultural Dimension of Globalization*, says,

We are now aware that with media, each time we are tempted to speak of the global village. We must be remembered that media create communities with “no sense of place” (Meyrowitz 1985). The world we live in now seems rhizomic (Deleuze and Guattari 1987) even schizophrenic, calling for theories of rootlessness, alienation, and psychological distance between individuals and groups on the one hand and fantasies (or nightmares) of electronic propinquity on the other. Here, we are close to the central problematic of cultural process in today’s world. (29)

The process of globalisation changed mainly the communication and data transferring uses of internet technology. This ‘rootlessness’ and ‘nostalgia’ with ‘electronic propinquity’ shaped the right-wing gatherings more globally, and shaped diaspora nationalism and processes of this cultural economy is affecting the democratic and public life in a rather direct way. The movements for public gathering and collective attack on sensitive issues in social media totally changed the performative concepts and practices in public life. After the proliferation of social media usage in India, words or hashtags (#) leads to created events, campaigns and public mobilisation. The right-wing ‘Hindu’ idea and its multiple social practices prepared its collective identity and immaterial bodies through the internet. An example is the “Internet Hindu” movement in social media (Mohan). Ramachandra Guha named the immaterial movements in cyberspace by Hindutva supporters as “Internet Hindu” (Guha).

From 2010 to 2014, the word and idea of “Internet Hindu” have been deployed in a massive way for transformation and it was used to support and to mobilise the Hindu supporters. The movements intended to empower the vote bank for BJP. The performative ways of utterances, memes, photos, videos, arguments, and trolls created a magnetic reflection on the “Internet Hindu” supporters. Also, it co-supported their physical and verbal action to communal violence and trauma. Sriram Mohan argues in the article titled “Locating the ‘Internet Hindu’: Political Speech and Performance in Indian Cyberspace”, on the presence of US Hindu nationalistic diaspora in the internet and their active online performance marketing worked in similar to ways how Islamophobic views were propagated by elite men within Jewish groups in United States (qtd in Mohan 342). The movement’s references are taken strongly after 9/11. Mohan writes, “Their presence and performances online serve as a test case for the ‘virtualization’ of the primordialist discourses traditionally harnessed by the Hindu right-wing in India, with the ‘Internet Hindu’ collective seeking to

cement the conception of Hinduism as cultural ethos, and not just religion” (344). Mohan argues that the diaspora is contributing to the ‘Hinduism’ for a monocultural ethos. Creating a new past and its exotic/traditional aesthetic with fascistic beauty was adding a new narrative of performativity. This technological transformation affected the performance structure and ‘Hindu’ public participated in an effective way here. This can be argued as the emergence of public participatory performativity in cyberspace.

Dr Pepper used reason and technology for a nonspiritual understanding in Victorian England. In Indian elections, technology is used in the exact opposite way to mystify reason from illusion and made it populist using performative ways centralising the concept of Hindu spirituality. It is interesting to see how the scientific modes which contested the religious superstitions are used for a reverse purpose in the twenty-first century. The campaign was a performative event different from the former campaigns which used conventional media giving two-dimensional experiences. The candidate in 2012 electoral 3D holographic campaign used a new performative presence of “body language and the visuality of politics” (Jaffrelot 05). Sruti Bala argued that the area of performance needs to be looked in a wider way in her article titled “The Entangled Vocabulary of Performance”. Bala writes, “Performativity thus does not draw a division between the theatrical and other social spheres, although it carries different implications in each case” (19). Performance is not to be understood in a general or homogenous way because performance is more complex in its sense of approach and entangled with other systems. Bala writes thus; “The entanglement of performance with concepts such as theatre, knowledge and performativity demonstrates that it is most valuable to approach the concept by asking...what it sets itself out against or distinguishes itself from” (19).

In 3D holographic electoral campaign spaces, performativity is entangled with finance, marketing concepts, technological practices, and experience. The engagement of

entangled performativity in 3D holographic electoral campaigns was designed for the virtual and face to face campaigns. In that designed campaign, the virtual performativity exhibited the candidate's 'individual body' for the performative aspect. The new aesthetics of *entangled performativity* through digital and holographic designing process affected the structure of electoral campaigns and also the conventional cultural concept of performativity in Indian performance space design. Here the concept of public performativity is entangled in a manipulated collective and organisational manner. The new ways of the concept of performativity with populism can be termed as *entangled performativity*.

3.3: Dramaturgy and Dramaturge in Public Space

The concept and practice of 'dramatic' underwent theoretical and critical transformation with its aesthetic evolution. OED defines 'dramaturgy' thus: "The theory and practice of dramatic composition" ("Dramaturgy"). The Greek word *dramturgia* means the 'composition of play'. The modernistic approach to dramaturgy came from the publication of G.E.Lessing's *Hamburg Dramaturgie* (1767-9) (Turner Cathy and Synne Behrndt K. 19). Apart from Anthropology and Social Science disciplines, the concept of dramaturgy and the dramaturge in contemporary Indian Performance Studies or Theatre Studies and theatre practice are not explored in detail. The discussion on dramaturgy in Indian Theatre Studies and arts happened in two ways of writings. First one is texts on the Sanskrit language oriented aesthetics and its practice, articulated as 'Indian dramaturges' and the second one is the post-colonial theatre practices and the analysis of the director as dramaturge. The ninth-century Sanskrit text called *Vyangyavyakhya* and fifteenth-century text called *Nadankusam* (Paulose 2015) discusses dramaturgy in ancient theatre practices. In 1912, was first translated in to English by George C.O.Haas, titled, *The Dasarupa: A Treatise on Hindu Dramaturgy*. The Indo-Iranian series edited by A.V. Williams Jackson and the book looks at Dhananjaya's aesthetics in 'Oriental' ways. Ketaki Dutta has written an essay titled "Dramaturgy in Indian

Theatre: A Closer view” in the book *Routledge Companion to Dramaturgy* and writes on the Sanskrit based ‘Hindu dramaturgy’.

In the area of performing arts, the Sanskrit theatre *Kutiyattam*, the actors follow two methodologies according to the manuals for performance. Those are instructions for the actor for their performance practice with an acting manual text called *Attaprakaram* and the way of performance making structure called *Kramadeepika*. The book called *Nadankusam* meaning ‘controlling tool for an actor’ controls for the actor in his/her self. The Sanskrit or *Kutiyattam* ‘ways of performance manual’ can be articulated as the aesthetic manual for Sanskrit performance. Paulose’s detailed study and Dutta’s essay was under the Sanskrit scholarship and *Natyasastra*, even though they discuss some of the contemporary Indian theatre performance which belonged to the realm of Sanskrit studies and the notation of ‘Hindu’.

The way dramaturgy or dramaturge in contemporary Indian theatre worked was never like in Europe because here it has a more complex relationship with directorship. The European theatre influenced theatre practitioners and academicians used dramaturgical tools in their directorial and academic ways only. Examples are performances directed by Habib Tanvir, Anuradha Kapur, Anamika Haksar, Amal Allana and Abhilash Pillai. They tried to create new dramaturgical waves into their directorial works crossing the dramatics structure in India beyond the visual arts discipline. Interestingly in Indian theatre institutions till now the position and duty for the dramaturge have never been constituted.

French critic Roland Barthes’s 1967 essay on “The Death of the Author” influenced new aesthetic expression waves in theatre. But the waves contributed to a director-oriented hierarchy in performance making process in Indian theatre, because theatre is mainly a director's and an actor's medium in India. Datta writes on dramaturge in India “in modern times, it is still a director's distant dream to have a dramaturge here on an Indian stage. The

director has to play both roles for smooth functioning of the play on stage” (98). In India, the written and performing texts are complex with the director's dramaturgical notions. Here the critical perspectives of dramaturge were lacking and the director's execution approaches get more forward. Also, in a way the author and director are the same. The international theatre festival happens in India with numerous foreign productions. Their brochures and posters can help us in tracing the role of the dramaturge. In 1999, NSD Director Ram Gopal Bajaj founded international theatre festival *Bharat Rang Mahotsav* and from then onwards, it has presented many regional and global theatre productions. Looking at the *Bharat Rang Mahotsav* brochures from 1999 onwards, there are only foreign theatre groups using the position of ‘dramaturge’ in their works. From 2000 onwards only, the position of a dramaturge in Indian theatre was visible. In 2008 when Ibsen International Festival happened at Delhi, in its 2009 and 2010 editions’ festival organising meetings, the suggestion came up about the necessity of a dramaturge in every performance. Nissar Allana, the director of *Dramatic Arts and Design Academy* which organised the Ibsen Festivals in New Delhi writes on the commissioned dramaturgical activities in 2008 and 2009 Delhi Ibsen festival thus:

I feel that the bringing together of academics and theatre practitioners is an important issue and with that in mind I commissioned one scholar to follow the production process of the Indian Ibsen productions and provide the group with dramaturgical support ...Rattan Thyam, Anuradha Kapur, Amal Allana, Neelam Mansingh, Zuleikha Chaudhari, Shantanu Bose, M.G.Joythish, Neeraj Kabi among others were the directors that were commissioned and used the dramaturges who hailed from various universities. (Allana)

From that suggestion, every commissioned performance group commissioned a dramaturge in their performances. 9 groups in 2008 (“Dec 10-20”), ten groups in 2009 (“10 Ibsen”) and six groups in 2010 (“6 Ibsen”) came with their dramaturge and used the university

academicians as dramaturge for dramaturgy. The dramaturge worked through the processing stage of the text, rehearsals and performance; later in the festival seminar, they discussed their dramaturgical process. But there was the power shift which happened with Indian directors and Indian dramaturges on the decision making on a performance. 2010 onwards the usages of the word 'dramaturgy' and 'dramaturge' was visible in the performance making framework. The position of a critic as a dramaturge in theatre amalgamated with the position of director in India. Because of the lack of critical training with text, aesthetics and performance in institutions, there is still no position of the dramaturge in institutional practices. The academic classes on dramaturgy in Indian theatre institutions never follow options like acting, direction, design and children's theatre. There are only some workshops for dramaturgy that happen in Indian theatre institutions. Using the dramaturgical practice as a discipline in theatre performance, we can argue that from the twenty-first century onwards the dramaturgical usages for the electoral campaign were happening simultaneously at the same time. From 2008 onwards, university academics became the dramaturge in the performance, in fact, using their academic critical knowledge. But in 3D holography electoral campaign, there was not an acknowledged dramaturge who worked as a critique like in theatre; but the conceptualisers' activities became dramaturgical ways of engagements. The ways of design and processes of performativity, corporeality, materiality and atmospheric aspects in the 2012 event, explored a pre-planned structural practice behind the campaign. This section will argue their uses of applied conceptual engagement which led to a dramaturgical approach in performance. The engagement's objective was product-oriented consumerist manifestation rather than academic critical thoughts and politics on the performance. In this section, I will look at how the use of structures constructs an unnamed dramaturgical process and how the 'immaterial' designers and conceptualisers worked and functioned as an unnamed dramaturge.

The virtual world games like ‘Second life’, technological events etc contributed to a new way of dramaturgy in contemporary times. The posthuman practices mark a new wave of corporeal aspects in the virtual world. Cathy Turner and Synne K.Behrndt argue in their book titled *Dramaturgy and Performance* that interactive media created a shift on the live performance combining ‘real’ and ‘virtual’ elements. They quoted Eckersall’s observations on the specialisation of performance dramaturgy: “need for creative specialists who keep track of the complicated flow of ideas, technologies, and forms associated with such work. Professional dramaturgy has therefore moved beyond literary modes of production into new fields of performance, dance and technical and production work” (201). Turner and Behrndt added the dramaturge’s need to understand new technologies to know about its structure and mediation, and its operation which has changed dramaturgy. Like theatre and performance, the public activities like games and social media and performative events became mediated and those are ‘technologies in operation’ and it is contributing to the emergence of ‘new dramaturges’. Campaigns and popular culture used ‘technologies in operation’ for the post-2010 Indian electoral campaigns and it initiated a ‘new dramaturgy’.

Image and its mass circulation via social media create a mass replica of the ideal structure. Joyojeet Pal writes about Modi campaign in social media in 2014 in “Banalities Turned Viral: Narendra Modi and the Political Tweet” that, “The campaign was coordinated and sustained through various social media outlets and was integrated into Modi’s larger election outreach campaign” (379). The social media and digital platform help for the image transformation. Pal writes about the transformation of the image of Modi from ‘khadi wearing’ Indian Nehruvian to ‘khaki shorts wearing, RSS volunteer’. In conclusion, Pal pointed out, “Modi has used pro-technological discourse to reframe his political image... The Modi social media case is as much a story about the way technology is iconised in India as it a story of a man who learned to master it” (385-386). The designer team reframed his older

image to new image with “pro-technological” (ibid) usages like social media and 3D holography. It did not form one man’s concept or idea, as Pal’s argues the candidate ‘learned it and mastered it’. It was a collective group and their visibility and presence were immaterial. In the 2012 Gujarat elections, the candidate-body had the vast input of collective intelligence from social media, advanced technologies like 3D holography etc. Above all, they were contributing as a dramaturge for the campaign. Collective intelligence mainly worked for wider agendas like branding. Agencies and populist approaches were making sub concepts for that dramaturgy.

3.3.1: Dramaturgy in Branding

Marketing services are used in many fields to attract people as consumers. For the 2012 elections, the candidate used a ‘branding exercise’ via social media and talks to make his electoral campaign a success. OED defines ‘branding’ as “the activity of giving a particular name and image to goods and services so that people will be attracted to them and want to buy them” (“Branding”). Pal writes transformation of an image with the help of social media in 2014 thus.

Prior to the election, a series of Modi photographs circulated on social media showing him with an Apple laptop, using a DSLR camera, reading Obama biography, wearing a jogging tracksuit, and wearing a cowboy hat. Such image were part of a larger branding exercise that has continued since his second term as chief minister of Gujarat (see also Kaur 2015). His brand consultants included prominent figures in advertising and heads of top agencies in India, including Piyush Pandey of Ogilvy and Mather, Prasoon Joshi of McCann, and Sam Balsara of Madison World(Pande 2014). (384)

Here the influence and decisions of the advertising agencies are used to brand the candidate. With branding, they designed new dramaturgical strategies for the campaign, especially in the case of Twitter. Twitter's creator Jack Dorsey illuminates about it being for an accurately designed "short burst of inconsequential information" (Sarno). The consultants' team used Twitter for branding information. Ravinder Kaur article titled "Good Times, Brought to You by Brand Modi" explored how a tweet became an important tool for branding the campaign. On 2014 May 16th tweet by Modi, *Bharat ki Vijay, acche din aane wale hai* contributed to rhetoric in the campaign. Kaur writes thus: "Brand Modi seeks to mediate certain qualities and effects that promise to change the lives of its consumers. In this specific case, Brand Modi promises to bring alive the middle-class dream of prosperity, opportunities, and a better standard of living, all delivered by a strong leader who does not flinch in the face of opposition" (328). The careful moulding to create value and marketing was designed and monitored. Here it was deliberately concealed from public that all these were designed by a core team. The public was made to believe it all belonged to the candidate. The collective intelligence behind the branding worked as a dramaturgical team for the campaign was rendered invisible. Lawrence Liang, in the article titled "Censorship and the Politics of Micro-Fascism" arguing "'power tony' an abbreviation of 'power of attorney'" (391) juxtaposed with people to create the brand. Liang writes, "As with any other brand, the management of Brand Modi involves both centralized as well as local power, which translates into local BJP cadres protecting it through acts of micro-fascism against neighbourhood infringements" (392). The 'centre' and 'local' became a dramaturge team of the campaign and its power involved planned and prepared branding. It constituted an involvement of dramaturgy in public space.

The 3D holographic electoral campaign venues were controlled with capital which was handled by Indian diaspora and party volunteers. Here the dramaturge's physical

presences worked in tandem with its technological immaterial virtual presence and they were the agencies. In those designed performances, the unknown virtual dramaturge exhibited a candidate's 'individual body' to the viewer.

3.3.2: Agencies as Dramaturge

2012 electoral campaign and Indian electoral campaigns used public relation (PR) agencies for the campaign. Various PR and lobbying firms came together with multinational PR companies like Worldwide along with Indian diaspora in the United States and the United Kingdom (Jaffrelot 2012, 2015), Piyush Pandey, the Indian creative director of Ogilvy Mather (Chakravartty and Roy 2015), Prasoon Joshi of McCann, and Sam Balsara of Madison World (Pal 2015), Prashant Kishor with 'Citizens for Accountable Governance' (Price 87) and Musion Pvt limited with Nchand were a part of the event. In the article titled "Narendra Modi and the Power of Television in Gujarat" by Jaffrelot writes on how the public relation (PR) agencies financially involved in the campaigns in third world countries like India. Jaffrelot wrote on 'APCO Worldwide' thus:

In August 2007, this company, 'the second largest independent PR firm in America,' charged over US\$25,000 a month to manage Modi's account, a price only slightly more than the costs they charged for also running the biennial industrial summit, 'Vibrant Gujarat' (Vishnu 2011). When the contract was signed, APCO had already worked for the Nigerian Dictator Sani Abacha; the president for life of Kazakhstan, Nursultan Nazarbayev; and the former Russian oligarch, Mikhail Khodorkovsky (Time of India 2007).

According to a Right to Information query, the contract seems to have been renegotiated in 2010 to develop a domestic version of the Friends of Gujarat, an organization based among the Indian diasporas in the United States and the

United Kingdom. For Rs .22.5 million (approximately US\$400,000) per year.

(348)

Here the data provide the evidence of the agencies and their financial involvements with electoral campaigns. The huge amounts of money spent on the electoral campaign thus were not collected only from the members of common people from India. It was funded by diasporas and companies to make sure the collective intelligence's financial stability for the election and later. Through that capital, they organised the massive event but the irony is that in a third world country like India it is very hard to collect money for an electoral campaign under the election commission rules and regulations. For the APCO and other financial involvement, the financial support organised from corporate, Hindutva diaspora and Hindu 'patriots'. Paula Chakravarty and Srirupa Roy write in an introduction titled "Mr Modi Goes to Delhi: Mediated Populism and the 2014 Indian Elections" that Piyush Pandey, Ogilvy Mather's national creative director managed "Team Modi" campaign in 2014 worked for the "tactical attacks on the media"(qtd in 315)

The management team for the campaign and its administration worked like a theatrical 'backstage activity' team, similar to the engagement of stage management in performance. Those performance making processes were not open to the public. The public had the right to use only to the performative inputs from the campaign team and public can only participate till a restricted point of the 'experience' and 'like', 'comment', or interact on social media, wear the masks or participate in the rallies. The public has shared their reactions on various social media platforms and it helped the 'team' to manipulate and updates the strategies. In the 3D holography performance, the public experienced the performance and was not engaged in the performance making process of performance. They were not exposed to what was happening on the performance as the process was not exposed. The performance making process engaged with the 'Team Modi', commissioned agencies

and volunteers only. The management and PR companies belong to the ‘team’ and their agencies were working as collective intelligence in the campaign. The capitalistic populism can be found working alongside with neoliberal advanced possibilities in such campaigns.

3.3.3: Dramaturgy in the Age of Populism

From the time of neoliberalisation in India, right-wing populist ideology has been spreading through ground level works, media, and finance. OED defines ‘populism’ as, “A political approach that strives to appeal to ordinary people who feel that their concerns are disregarded by established elite groups” (“Populism”). The populist leaders in Russia, Europe, America, Latin America and Asia also vary. Cass Mudde and Cristobal Rovira Kaltwasser define populism in their book titled *Populism: A Very Short Introduction* thus:

Populism as a thin centered ideology that considers society to be ultimately separated into two homogeneous and antagonistic camps, “the pure people” versus “the corrupt elite”, and which argues that politics should be an expression of the *volonte`ge`ne`rale* (general will) of the people... Unlike “thick-centered” or “full” ideologies (e.g., fascism, liberalism, socialism), thin-centred ideologies such as populism have a restricted morphology, which necessarily appears attached to- and some time is even as simulated into-other ideologies.(06)

Mudde and Rovira Kaltwasser write that the populism we are witnessing today started 150 years back from Tzarist Russia, from the United States of America and different parts of the globe (40). Arguments on populism are hosted on three principal concepts: ‘the people’, ‘the elite’ and ‘the general will’. These identical approaches were used for mass manipulations in contemporary times. Populist leaders are mystifying and manipulating the people’s unity for authoritarianism. Mudde and Rovira Kaltwasser repetitively write on “populist actors” (93)

and “political actors” (07) as those who operate in politics with their rhetoric communications. The populist actors’ success and failure are centred with media activities (114). Through media, the populist actor creates a messenger persona and ‘messenger’ became valuable rather than ‘message’. The writers arguing for a better democratic world urge academics and scholars need to think more about ‘populist actors’ (18).

Giampietro Mazzolent writes on the usages of the concept like ‘actor’ and ‘drama’ in populist media in the essay, “Populism and the Media”. Mazzolent argues that the transformation of political language into spectacle-oriented activity: “In contemporary society, where image is paramount, political leaders must be good ‘actors’ and master the tools of drama in order to address effectively a domestic audience that has become increasingly distracted from politics”(52). The media in news, communication and entertainment became a tool for the populist rhetoric speech. The individual leadership and its “dramatization” (53) contributed by media is the main tool for a populist actor. The communication factor of performance, drama and speeches became the main part of populist media. Mazzolent writes on the connection between populism and communication: “Populism may be seen as a communication style which is adopted by political actors seeking to display their proximity to the people. Populism appears, therefore, as a master frame, a way to wrap up all kinds” (58). Mazzolent, Mudde and Rovira Kaltwasser used performance-related concepts and words and demonstrated their connections with populism. The populist actors/ political actors use communication through a medium with performance aspects to offer ‘proximity to the public’ but remaining within their safe zone. This section will explore how the performance aspect functions in the 3D holographic populist electoral campaign.

Paula Chakravartty and Srirupa Roy look at the shift of Modi’s power from Gujarat to Delhi after 2014. Looking at the “mediated populism” (314) they discussed how a structure in India with Hindu nationalism is created ‘dramatically’ and how the mediated populist means

spread to the world of politics. They write about the objectives behind the ‘American- style mediated democracy’ in India. Quoting the definition of Ernesto Laclau’s ideas on populism, they write,

Laclau argues that the populist reason brings together disparate popular demands in critical historical conjunctures and should be seen not as a deviation of democracy, but instead as the very stuff of democratic politics. Populism is the “royal road to understanding the ontological constitution of the political as such” in his words (Laclau 2005,67). Media play a key role in such “road –building” endeavors, with single –issue “neo-populist” projects (e.g., anti-immigration, anticorruption) that are fostered and consolidated in and by media, a familiar formation in twenty-first century democracies across the world (Mazzoleni et al. 2003). (314)

The vote oriented 2012 electoral campaign in Gujarat engaged with strategies. The political strategies are designed with numerous advertising concepts and aim to design a performer-body from the candidate-body. Modi keeps his dress and hairstyles very stylistic every single day and he takes care of both of it. Jaffrelot notes in “Narendra Modi and the Power of Television in Gujarat” that Modi likes fashion from his young age” (352). His *kurta* (“Kurta”) became branded in the name of Modi *kurta*, which is a counter to the dressing styles of Gandhi and Nehru. It was put up for sale in the market and Modi supporters have bought it and worn it to ‘look like him’. Usage of hand gestures, dress codes, utterances, and movements was specially designed. Jaffrelot writes on the body language of the candidate and the visibility of politics: “Like many political leaders, Modi has adopted a body language that goes beyond a dress code. Here, his attitude can be best be described by using the Gujarati notion of *Marut*, a form of virility” (350). The argument of Jaffrelot that candidate has created a new performative presence with aggressive masculine overtones, which again is

carefully designed. The transformation from radio to television to social media changed the politician's ways of behaviour, mainly in India. The images and photographs are conveying the “nonverbal mode of political communication” (350). He writes on the choices of colours for Modi’s dress and the hand gestures which were used in his Gujarat talks:

Vivek Desai, one of the men who photographed Modi, explained that his subject was very particular about each detail, outfit, color, and pose for the potential meanings that they conveyed. For instance, he never showed the palm of his right hand because this an electoral symbol of the Congress party (Dayal 2007). Similarly, “Modi actually does not ever wear green [presumably because the color is identified with Islam] and is very careful about black also” (Mukhopadhyay 2013, 283) His favorite color is, of course, saffron. As chief minister of Gujarat, Modi has applied his sartorial sense to his own Gujarati attire as well. (Jaffrelot 350)

Unpublished PhD research by Luke Brian Berryman titled *Richard Wagner’s Die Meistersinger von Nurnberg in Nazi Propaganda* examined the technological reproduction within the field of broadcasting, which was used for racial and political mobilisation in Germany. In footnote number 390, Brian Berryman writes that during the Nazi regime in Germany, the radio “was the first device capable of instantaneously reaching individuals in the privacy of their homes” (136). Brian Berryman underlines that the sound made an imaginary body presence with radio. Thus individual homes became part of Nazi ideology’s engagements and discussions. These audio technological devices changed in contemporary times. During the time of neoliberalisation, technology is controlled by invisible capitalists and the second chapter analysed the labour which became immaterial with those processes. There is a similarity between the using advanced holographic technology and the Nazi ways of interaction using radio, but with 3D holography, there is an immaterial presence of

performative body and interactions. Here in the 3D holographic electoral campaign, the candidate makes a narcissist way of body presence.

Jaffrelot writes on how the narcissist images work as a signified in Modi's branding. The narcissist perceptions deployed in constructing the candidate's appearance was an example of the method on which how power is performed in the history of politics. The huge smiling image of the candidate in Ahmedabad made an impact among the public. In 2007 in Gujarat, the 'Modi masks' were circulated in a manner akin to American campaign methods. The use of campaign like "We are all Modi" became the motto in 2012 state election campaigns. Jaffrelot writes on these activities thus; "This technique of mediation suggests that a more sophisticated style of politics is taking shape when Modi invites his supporters to identify with him by wearing the same shirt, masking their face with his, and suggesting that he is ubiquitous" (349). The campaign politics were not only with the manifesto or ethics; it was focused on the vote bank. The design team used the technique of marketing, salesmanship, and targets to manipulate/influence/ the public to create affection for the candidate.

From the above mentioned populist techniques, it can be seen how dramaturgy works for an affective experience of performance similar to performance/theatre. These populist techniques were conceptualised for the campaigns and used a dramaturgy which can be called as *collective dramaturgy*. Here the hierarchy of the mono dramaturge method in theatre productions did not exist because the strategy companies were working as collective dramaturges functioning like the kingmakers in the campaign. The campaign is experienced in a form that is populist and an 'unpredictable form' of the candidate's "politics of communication encapsulated an unprecedented form of visual populism" (qtd in 349). But the concept of 'visual populism' has to be critically examined with the intervention of turning the public into a vote bank because the campaign affected people in a hypnotic way. The

critical or rational and logical thinking has shifted to the moment's circumstances. Opposite to this thought, the Athenian democracy concept of 'demagogue' is functioning excluding the concern of 'deliberation' in democracy and politics. OED defines the Athenian democracy concept of 'Demagogue' as "a political leader who seeks support by appealing to the desires and prejudices of ordinary people rather than by using rational argument (In ancient Greece and Rome) a leader or orator who espoused the cause of the common people" ("Demagogue"). The chief ministerial candidate has used the 'demagogue' approach to his campaign especially through his 3D holographic performance. Michael Signer writes in the book titled *Demagogue: The Fight to Save Democracy from Its Worst Enemies* thus:

At the center of this dynamics is the demagogue. The ancient Greeks first invented the word "demagogue" to describe a new class of mob leaders who quickly evolved to fill a power vacuum left by the demise of a reigning class of elite statesmen. The word meant "leader" (agogos) of the "people" (demos). Then, as now, demagogues can always emerge in a political system that grants power, even if initially a small amount, to those who connect with the people (34).

The 3D holography electoral campaign in 2012 Gujarat designed and used a dramaturgy for politics in techno-populist times which can be called as *techno-demagogue dramaturgy* in the twenty-first century -politics. The *techno-demagogue dramaturgy* contains rhetoric, illusion, technology and fashioned heritages. The approach of *techno-demagogue dramaturgy* with advanced technology was used to manipulate the public for vote bank. And the 'appeal to emotion' here in an advanced structure worked with new 'prejudice, ignorance and emotional manipulation'. The politics of 'hope' is working in an oppositional way here by the slogan of "*acche din aane wale hai*" (Kaur 323).

3.4: Entertainment in 3D Holography Campaign

Entertainment is the main emotional tool for 3D holography for creating an affective experience. In the public's interactions 'amusement or enjoyment' is one of the major affective components of entertainment. From ancient Greek time, 'rhetoric' style of political speeches was used as entertainment for persuasion. In Germany, during the Nazi period, propaganda campaigns used 'entertainment' with radio and television successfully to connect to the public.

Aswin Punathambekar writes in "Satire, Elections, and Democratic Politics in Digital India" that the campaign strategies like 'engage, occupy, absorb, and engross' are designed with 'affective dimensions of the political' structure (397-398). This followed the mode of a commercial theatrical production aiming for the experience-output for the viewer in favour of box office success. The campaign team used the technique of dramaturgy along with technology, illusion and 'nationalist spirituality' through entertainment. Here the aim was not to sell more tickets in the box office; rather it was to collect more votes. The box office money transformed to electoral votes here. Punathambekar writes on the relationship between entertainment and politics in today's digital media productions, and how popular culture functions in elections. Punathambekar also looks at the public culture in the era of globalisation and argues that "the implications of various modes of participation that digital and mobile media technologies and platforms have enabled" (qtd in 396). The massive production and uses of digital media after the introduction of neoliberal policies in India transformed into new models with global culture. It used the human affective tendencies for the consumerism. Punthambekar writes: "Elections are special because they 'transcend everyday politics' and represent a moment in which the 'normal workings of power is suspended' and in which the most lowly can become, as voters, 'sultan for a day (Gilmartin 2009, 249)'" (qtd in 398).

The ephemeral quality of performance 'time' is at work during the campaign period in the 3D holographic campaign. The strategy team's target was to reach and influence maximum votes from the constituency and get support from the global world. Here 'special time' acts like the performative 'time'. The campaign times were going beyond the day to day life and the power of the politics also functioned like a pendulum in those times. The 'special time' is used for performative engagements in the 3D holographic campaign. The media culture creates a cultural memory for reference to political campaigns. Entertainment and media are used as a tool for campaigns. Marvin Carlson writes about American theatre and entertainment in the introduction of *TPP*. Carlson writes,

In general, theatre is regarded in America as a form of entertainment, more elitist perhaps than films, but still lacking the cultural respectability of orchestral music, painting, or even such closely related forms as opera or dance. In Germany, on the other hand, theatre is a major cultural form, knowledge of theatre is considered an important part of any cultured person's experience, and the stage is regarded as a significant contributor to the public discussion of social and cultural concerns. (05)

Drawing from Carlson's argument on entertainment, it can be concluded that what we have here in the 3D holographic electoral campaign is an Indian habitat of the American model of electoral campaign lacking the 'social and cultural concerns'. Jaffrelot's observation on American model electoral campaign (348) also adds to the American creating the strategic communication process in India. It has to be observed critically how the concept and practice of 'American model' of 'entertainment' and communication in performance and political campaign were amalgamated here. The design team used the dramaturgy of 'entertainment' in the 2012 Gujarat elections and later also. This 'entertainment' oriented dramaturgy's explored a new philosophy in those campaigns.

3.5: The Purpose Behind 3D Holographic Electoral Campaign 2012

Repetition of moments is one of the main performance making processes in theatre. Repetition of action or usages of materials and its effects was to engage with an idea of the experience. This happens through the repetitive action in the theatre called rehearsals. Scholar Britta Ohm points out how Modi's 'authoritarianism' has reached elections through a rehearsed journey in the article titled "Organizing Popular Discourses with and Against the Media: Notes on the Making of Narendra Modi and Recep Tayyip Erdogan as Leaders-without-Alternative". He explores how the conventional media handled political activities in Gujarat. Ohm points to the "–truth'-of particular information" (371) making different contextual aspects. The information in the campaign used majoritarian Gujarati Hindu narratives for election. On the majoritarian unity, Ohm writes "The logic of generating a majoritarian 'people's unity' through communicative self-creation subverts the conventional, straightforward links between authoritarianism and media repression that continue to inform the arguments of many Modi-critics" (374). Majoritarianism is adapting the successful utilitarian model of other majoritarian concepts. The 2012 Gujarat campaign is derived from the American model election campaign. OED defines 'utility' as "The state of being useful, profitable, or beneficial" ("Utility"). In the fourth chapter titled "Performative Generation of Materiality" in the book *TPP* underlines that aesthetics and American Performance Studies have 'pragmatic concerns' and 'utilities'. Carlson writes on Fischer-Lichte's idea of 'specific aestheticity' as totally different from the approach of American 'utility of performance' in the introduction of the book *TPP*,

In very general and obviously oversimplified terms Fischer-Lichte's approach, based as it is on what might be called the aesthetic side of theatre and performance, seek the 'meaning' or 'purpose' of performance in what she calls its 'specific aestheticity', a concern one would be most unlikely to

encounter in an American performance theorist. American performance theory, with its close historical ties to the social sciences, to Deweyesque pragmatism, and to the tradition of rhetoric and communication, has, in general looked for the utility of performance in its ability to alter or at least alter the spectator's thinking about general and specific social situation. (06)

Carlson argues that the knowledge production oriented German aesthetic trajectories are totally different from the approaches of industrial production orientated objectives prevalent in America. Peter Schumann's Bread and Puppet Theatre in America is an example. Their performance politically criticises the war, state and equality, but not connected with the university knowledge system and against the "commercial entertainment" (273) followed by American capitalism. Of course, the performance practising groups in America like 'Broadway Theatre', other entertainment performances and the Anthropological, Social Science oriented Performance Studies looked at Performance in its utilitarian ways. Carlson writes about American utilitarian ways in performance aesthetics in *TPP* thus; "That discourse has on the whole so far been oriented distinctly, and it must be admitted, very productively toward pragmatic concerns and the use of performance to achieve certain specific social, cultural, personal, and rhetorical goals"(10). The American model performance structure functions in the electoral campaign performative structure in India for certain "goals". The concept and practice of "goals" are social, cultural, personal, and rhetorical. The 3D holographic electoral campaign aesthetic and dramaturgical structure developed with the of American agencies like APCO (Jaffrelot 2012), (Jaffrelot 2015), (Price 2015) Ogilvy and Mather, McCann, and Madison World (Pal 2015, Chakravartty and Roy 2015).

Bala distinguished performance in two paradigms in her article and those are performance as a 'process' and performance as 'goal' in the article, "The Entangled

Vocabulary of Performance”. Bala writes the “former usage is most predominant in humanities, referring to artistic, linguistic, and cultural and gender performance. The latter usage is most common when referring to economic, technical and sexual fields”(15-16). Bala described technical and business performance thus: “the manner in which a mechanism accomplishes a task, as well as the measurement of its output”(16) and the second one is “an indicator of the difference between actual results vs. desired results in a business- related activity” (ibid). In the case of the 2012 event, it was constituted as a performance “as a goal” with ‘technical and business related’ usages (15-16). Bala argues that such performance paradigms “interplay with performance as process, making performance into an all-encompassing organizing mode of life. Thus there is a dialectical entanglement between performance as goal and performance as process” (16) in a neoliberal context.

Carlson (*TPP* 10) and Bala (15-16) use the specific “goal” oriented performance with its utilitarian usages. Drawing from arguments by Carlson’s “utility” (*TPP* 6-10) with Punathambekar's “entertainment” (397-398), we could say that the 3D holographic electoral campaign event is designed as a performative medium for the particular political party, rather than ‘cultural form for knowledge’ (Pepper 1890). The “personal” and “rhetorical goals” were deployed using the concept and practice of “utility” in those performative structures (*TPP* 10) ‘through this affective’ ‘aesthetic appearance’ with counter contextual “civilizing process” (Fischer –Lichte 92,100-101). The studies on candidate-body and aesthetic and dramaturgical structure used for the electoral campaigns was in relation to the American model. The Indian techno electoral campaign’s performative and dramaturgical structure used the utilitarian purpose of the American model in the 3D holographic campaign of 2012.

3.6: Conclusion

Performativity and dramaturgy are the major areas discussed in this chapter. The first one examined how the performativity in 3D Holographic electoral campaign is entangled with capitalistic structure. And the second part examined how the mediated collective organisations act as a collective dramaturge team and their immaterial presence was used in manipulating public decisions through the populist affective media. Majority of the population came under the illusionistic *techno demagogue dramaturgy* emphasised in the 3D holographic campaign. Utilitarian ways were the main driving force behind the *techno demagogue dramaturgy*. Here I argue that in these populist times, these new manifestations of performance mediations in public spaces uses the framework of performance as an inclusive phenomenon for utilitarian purposes with its new *entangled performativity* and *techno demagogue dramaturgy*.

Conclusion

The trajectory of Indian election, the world's largest democratic practice, can be traced from the 1950s. The electoral campaign is the main influential time when the candidates and political parties influence the public with the usages of speech, rallies, street plays, publicity events, social media and communication media for vote. From 2010 onwards the Indian electoral campaigns demonstrated significant changes with the use of advanced technologies. After radio and TV, the digital becomes the main platform for communication. From then onwards social media, mobile network systems and broadcasting technologies are massively used in electoral campaigns. The 3D holographic usages in the electoral campaign in 2012 Gujarat have changed the pattern of communication in the history of the electoral campaign. The possibility of an omnipresent candidate occurs in a virtual realm in multiple places simultaneously. The candidate's corporeal aspects were rehearsed, captured with advanced cameras on a stage inside a studio and broadcasted to the temporary stages inside container trucks and from there it has been projected via 3D holographic technology. The 3D holographic campaign has used performance elements and the spectators experienced them as a performance event. The experience of the candidate body during the electoral campaign was estimated based on strategic implementation of maximum reach within a short duration after the 1990s in India. The American model of the electoral campaign has come into use here. The same strategic team in the United State worked for Indian electoral campaigns and other Indian version followed the American model of branding, marketing and usages of social networking. The discussion on the evolution of the campaign activities was studied in the discipline of Election Studies, Political Science, Sociology, Media Studies and Digital Studies. This thesis has analysed and discussed the performance aspects of the 3D

holographic electoral campaign in India. There are many studies which looked at the performance aspects in contemporary times with respect to gender, identity, protest, trauma, ecology, nationalism, new media and virtual gaming. The thesis explored the use of virtual presence in the public domain using performance aspects.

The thesis attempted to examine how the performance making processes of an electoral campaign works, in the time of globalisation in the Indian public domain. The thesis looked at the conceptual realms of the performance making processes in the contemporary 3D holographic electoral campaign in India and how it demonstrated a shift in contemporary Performance Studies. The research attempted to examine how apart from established popular, academic and experimental performance practices, electoral campaigns use performance aspects along with technology in their public engagements. The main focus of the thesis is the 3D holographic electoral campaign in Gujarat in 2012 and the thesis argues that it maintained the structure of a performance making processes throughout. In this thesis, I tried to examine the paradigm shift that took place in the Indian electoral campaigns using performance concepts. This will contribute a new dimension to Performance Studies. The use of a modified Victorian theatrical illusion called Pepper's Ghost, the designers' invisible preparatory works which belong to the realm of the performance making process were all looked into. The candidate's execution of it made the transformation of the body of the candidate into a performer body. The virtual body of the candidate became the performance-body, through the usage of an advanced version of a Victorian theatrical trick.

The thesis has discussed four new manifestations of mediative practices that involve performance and technology in the era of globalisation as a departure point for the thesis. Those new conceptual manifestations are materiality, immaterial labour which is the designer's, performativity and dramaturgy in the 3D holographic electoral campaign. The affective ways of designing 'experience' of real and illusion for political agenda became the

‘end product’ rather than communicating ‘truth’ or ‘meaning’. The simulative event questions conventional Aristotelian aesthetic of ‘time, space and body’ in performance. Those manifested a new form of aesthetic that can broadcast the corporeal and spatial aspects of materiality in performance. Here the 3D holographic designer’s team targeted to create a simulative presence deploying new design concepts of materiality in the electoral campaign. The materiality was a mixture of ‘real’ and ‘virtual’ broadcasting activities and those formed an atmosphere for the creation of the ‘end product’ in the campaign. The simulative broadcasting structures were ‘creating maximum impact’ to interact and influence voters and new design concepts of materiality emerged which included mediated corporeal and spatial aspects of materiality. The transformation of the candidate’s body to performance body was achieved with the involvement of high-tech technologies and PR agencies. 3D holography’s performance making process was working as an industry for commodity purposes. Here commodity is votes and the process and receptions have the specificity of immateriality. The ‘informal’ and ‘inter-face’ contributed to the immaterial performance making process in the event.

The collective identity of designers was used in conventional theatre and performance. But in 3D holographic performance in the electoral campaign, the designers’ identity was transformed into invisible and immaterial collectiveness. The computer-generated ultra-technological performance making process rendered the creative labour of designers/designing process immaterial. The deployment of materiality explored the performance event and the end product of experience was a counter contextual “civilizing process” (Fischer-Lichte in *TPP* 92, 100-101) in the era of globalisation. This techno electoral campaigns and the affective ‘aesthetic appearance’ used mixed materiality in the performance making process. The performance as a commodity and its politics led to the constitution of the aesthetic in the campaign. The design process affected the concept of

scale, values and entertainment in the public domain. The adaptation of a global scale in design and its socio economic forms changed the concept of materiality and performativity with the performance making process. The hierarchical connection of 3D holography event can be examined with respect to scale and “remote mental honor control” (Appadurai). That concept and application of scale became an entity with the quality of plasticity in broadcasting. The campaign in 2012 created a material value of the commodity as generating votes from the voters. There were different values given to the performer and the designers in the process because they worked as an ‘industry’. This is a mixture of “cult value” and “exhibition value” (Benjamin 26) of the candidate. The combination of materiality and immateriality in the performance making processes produced an experience which contributed market purposes. The linguistic, materialistic, temporal and spatial aspects of materiality got a new form in the 3D holographic electoral campaign through an *interweaving materiality*. The digital materiality used was an *interweaving materiality* in public performance events.

Performance in the 3D holographic electoral campaign is not to be understood in a general or homogenous way because performance is more complex in its sense of approach and entangled with other systems. Here in the event the performativity is “entangled” (Bala 19) with a combination of finance, marketing concepts, technological practices, and experience. The performativity used was *entangled performativity*.

The 3D holography electoral campaign in 2012 Gujarat used a dramaturgy which can be called as *techno-demagogue dramaturgy*. The *techno-demagogue dramaturgy* contains rhetoric, illusion, technology and fashioned heritages. This approach with advanced technology was used to manipulate the public for vote bank. And the appeal to voter’s emotion using an advanced technology worked for emotional manipulation. The *techno-demagogue dramaturgy* makes a new structure for those populist manifestations. The

electoral campaign was a combination of vernacular modes of articulation and mediated technologies and institutionalised market values for vote focusing strategies with the use of '3D virtual body'. In the 2012 campaign uses of 3D holography became a commodity-oriented activity intended for 'creating maximum impact' to interact and influence voters. Majority of the spectators came under the illusionistic dramaturgy emphasised in the 3D holographic campaign. Utilitarian ways were the main driving force behind the dramaturgy. The mediated collective organisations act as a dramaturge team and their immaterial presence was manipulating public decisions through the populist ways.

The 3D holographic electoral campaign event was designed as a performance medium for the political party rather than 'cultural form for knowledge' (Pepper 1890). In these populist times, these new manifestations of performance mediations in public spaces, using the framework of performance as an inclusive phenomenon, are for 'utilitarian' purposes with its new *entangled performativity*. The concept and practice of 'American model of entertainment' in performance and political campaign were amalgamated in the event. This 'entertainment' oriented dramaturgy's motive is based on the concept of 'utility' in those campaigns. The techno performative dramaturgy in public domain transformed un-institutionalised collectiveness to control the campaign. In the era of globalisation, populist approaches use 'utility' as the main idea for manifestation. This populist aesthetics and engagement have given back a product-oriented utilitarian consumer approach in public life. Here performance concepts worked as a hidden spine for communication, aesthetics and utility. The populist approaches and consumerist ways used designers as immaterial labour in the 3D holographic performance making process.

Propaganda became a communication strategy for public relations which are used by political parties. In the 3D holographic electoral campaign, the performative aspects are used

for creating tactics for propaganda. Campaigns use conventional theatrical performance approaches as a generic gateway to voters. Performing propaganda through virtual technology brought a change from conventional theatrical approaches. It created a performer charisma around the candidate in the virtual world. The unusual live images worked as populist tactics for salvaging the voters in 2012. The impression of familiarity of candidate's body and false proximity created a visible corporeal experience of performer body. The familiarity of evoking excitement from the candidate's charisma through the performative mediation turns into a populist aesthetic. Without using individual 3D glasses the spectators massively experienced a new hyper-reality constructed through 3D holographic technology. This high-technological material spectacle is executed through the investment of economic capital in the democratic process of India. The diasporic and corporate investments made the candidate's presence ubiquitous in a short time in simultaneously. The campaign was interwoven with the clear political motif of generating a hyper and sensational impact among the common people.

An eclectic methodology was used to create a framework for the thesis because the performance aspects needed an interdisciplinary approach. I have reworked those methodologies in many levels to restructure my research from the beginning. That changed the direction of research and through the research process, I understood the possibilities and limitations of the research problem. The PhD research project tried to produce possibilities on how performance discipline can be used as a theoretical tool to analyse the electoral campaign event. Finally, the thesis has looked at how the materiality, immaterial labour, performativity and dramaturgy in public domain engage with aesthetics in the age of populism. The affective applications of performance theory and practice changed the history of world politics without giving any reference to the broad spectrum of performance.

The intention of the PhD thesis was to explore the performance making processes in the time of globalisation. The thesis discussed the different performance aspects of the performance making process and unpacked the paradigm shift that has taken place in the public domain in detail. The performance aspects in 3D holography electoral campaign used for the construction of consumerist aesthetic affects have been examined in detail. The thesis tried to develop a new perspective on electoral campaigns and technology-oriented Performance Studies and Practices.

Bibliography

- “About Linden Lab.” *Linden Lab*, 2015, www.lindenlab.com/about. Accessed 25 May 2015.
- “About NSD.” *National School of Drama*, 2015, www.nsd.gov.in. Accessed 26 Mar. 2015.
- Abrams, M.H. and Galt Harpham, Geoffrey. *A Glossary of Literary Terms*. Cenage Learning India Private Limited, 2012.
- “Agency.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2018, Oxford.en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/agency. Accessed 22 May 2018.
- “Agora.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford.en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/agora. Accessed 04 Feb. 2016.
- Allana, Nissar. “Delhi Ibsen Seminar 2008, 2009.” *Theatre and Television Associates*, Accessed 17 June 2017.
- “Annual Report 1953-1958.” *Sangeet Natak Akademi*, New Delhi, 1958.
- Anthakrishnan, B and Jane Collins. “Against a Hierarchy of Expressive Means; Arguments for New Pedagogies in Performer Education in India and the UK.” *Studies in Theatre and Performance*.vol.39. no. 2, 2019, pp113-131. DOI: 10.1080/14682761.2018.1429758. Accessed 04 Apr. 2019.
- Appadurai, Arjun. “Design, Failure and the Globalization of Risk.” SAVVY Contemporary, Berlin, Germany, 10 January 2017.Talk.
- Appadurai, Arjun. *Modernity at Large: Cultural Dimension of Globalization*. University of Minnesota Press, 1996.
- Artaud, Antonin. *The Theatre and Its Double*. Translated by Mary Caroline Richards, Grove Press, 1958.

- Ashby, Clifford. *Classical Greek Theatre: New Views of an Old Subject*, University of Iowa Press, 1999.
- Auslander, Philip. *Liveness: Performance in a Mediatized Culture*, Routledge, 2008.
- Auslander, Philip. "Against Ontology: Making Distinctions between the Live and the Mediatized", *Routledge Performance Research*, vol.2, no. 03, 1997, pp 50-55.
- Auslander, Philip. "Music as Performance: Living in the Immaterial World." *Theatre Survey*, vo.47, no.02, 2006, pp 261-169.10.1017/S004055740600024X. Accessed 25 Mar. 2014.
- Austin, J.L. *How to Do Things with Words*. Harvard University Press, 1975.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays*. Translated by Vern W. McGee; edited by. Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. University of Texas Press, 1986.
- Bala, Sruti. "The Entangled Vocabulary of Performance." *Rupkatha Journal*, vol.05, no. 02, 2013, pp. 12-21, rupkatha.com/V5/n2/03_Vocabulary_Performance_Studies.pdf. Accessed 25 May 2017.
- Bala, Sruti. *The Gestures of Participatory Art*. Oxford University Press, 2018.
- Banerjee, Mukulika. "Sacred Elections." *Economic and Political Weekly*, vol.42, no.17, 2007, pp.1556-1562, 28 Apr.2007. www.jstor.org/stable/4419523. Accessed 10 May 2017.
- Barba Eugenio. editor. *Towards a Poor Theatre* by Jerzy Grotowski. Routledge, 2002.
- Barnett, David. "Heiner Mueller as the End of Brechtian Dramaturgy: Mueller on Brecht in Two Lesser-Known Fragments." *Theatre Research International*, vol 27, no.1, 2002, pp.49-57. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0307883302001050>. Accessed 10 Aug. 2016.
- Baudrillard, Jean. *Simulacra and Simulation*. Translated by Sheila Faria Glaser, The University of Michigan press, 2006.

- Baudrillard, Jean. *The Gulf War Did Not Take Place*. Translated by Paul Patton, Indiana University Press, 1995.
- Bell, John. "Louder Than Traffic: Bread and Puppet Parades." *Radical Street Performance: An International Anthology*, edited by Jan Cohen-Cruz, Routledge, 2013. pp. 271-281.
- Benjamin, Walter. *The Work of Art in the Age of Its Technological Reproducibility and Other Writings on Media*. edited by Michael W. Jennings, Brigid Doherty and Thomas Y. Levin. Harvard University Press, 2008.
- Benton, Stephen A and V. Michael Bove Jr. *Holographic Imaging*. Wiley-Interscience, 2008.
- Berghaus, Gunter. *Avant –garde Performance: Live Events and Electronic Technologies*. Palgrave, 2005.
- Bhargava Dharwadker, Aparna. *Theatres of Independence: Drama, Theory and Urban Performance in India Since 1947*. University of Iowa Press, 2005.
- Bharucha, Rustom. *Theatre and the World: Performance and Politics of Culture*. Routledge, 1993.
- Bhosale, B.G. "Indian Nationalism Gandhi vis-à-vis Tilak and Savarkar." *The Indian Journal of Political Science*, vol.70, no.1, 2009, pp.419-427, <https://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/42743906.pdf>, Accessed 05 Apr. 2017.
- Boehmer, Elleke, and Rosinka Chaudhuri. Editors. *The Indian Postcolonial: A Critical Reader*. Routledge, 2010.
- Booth, Wayne C., et al. *The Craft of Research*. University of Chicago Press, 2008.
- Bran Berryman, Luke. "Richard Wagner's Die Meistersinger von Nurnberg in Nazi Propaganda." *Luke Berryman*, 2014, lukeberryman.com/writing/4585898921. Accessed 12 Feb. 2018.

“Branding.” *Oxford Learner’s Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford.

oxfordlearnersdictionaries.com/definition/english/branding. Accessed 15 Nov. 2016.

“Broadcasting.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2014, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/broadcasting. Accessed 22 Jan. 2014.

Bryant, Levi R. *The Democracy of Object*. Open Humanities Press, 2011,

openhumanitiespress.org/books/download/Bryant_2011_DemocracyofObjects.pdf.c.

Accessed 11 Nov. 2014.

Butler, Judith. “Performative Acts and Gender Constitution: An Essay in Phenomenology and Feminist Theory.” *Theatre Journal*, vol.40, no.4, 1988, pp.519-531.

Butler, Judith. *Excitable Speech: A Politics of the Performative*. Routledge, 1997.

“Campaign.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/campaign. Accessed 25 May 2016.

Carlson, Marvin. *Performance: A Critical Introduction*. Routledge, 2004.

Causey, Matthew. *Theatre and Performance in Digital Culture: From Simulation to Embeddeness*. Routledge, 2006.

Chakravartty, Paula and Roy, Srirupa. “Mr. Modi Goes to Delhi: Mediated Populism and the 2014 Indian Elections.” *Television and New Media*, vol.16, no.04, 2015, pp 311-322
doi:10.1177/1527476415573957. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016

Christopher Bauge. *Theatre Performance and Technology: The Development of Scenography in the Twentieth century*. Palgrave, 2005.

Connor, Steven. *Beckett, Modernism and the Material Imagination*. Cambridge University Press, 2014.

Damodar Savarkar, Vinayak. *Hindutva*. Veer Savarkar Prakashan, 1969.

Das Gupta, G.N. *Guide to Stage Lighting*. Annapurna Dasgupta, 1986.

“Demagogue.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2017, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/demagogue. Accessed 25 Nov. 2017.

“Democracy.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2014, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/democracy. Accessed 14 Aug. 2014.

Dhananjaya. *The Dasarupa: A Treatise on Hindu Dramaturgy*. Translated by

George C.O.Haas, Columbia University Press, 1912

“Digital.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2014, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/digital. Accessed 25 Feb. 2014

Dixon, Steve. *Digital Performance a History of New Media in Theatre, Dance, Performance-art, and Installation*. The MIT Press, 2007.

“Document of the Month.” *Godrej Archives*,

www.archives.godrej.com/assets/pdf/DOM_dec09.pdf, Accessed 28 Dec.2017.

Drain, Richard. *Twentieth Century Theatre: A Sourcebook*. Routledge, 2004.

“Dramaturgy.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2018,

Oxford.en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/dramaturgy. Accessed 12 Mar. 2018.

Dutta, Ketaki. “Dramaturgy in Indian Theatre: A Closer view.” *Routledge Companion to*

Dramaturgy, edited by Magda Romanska, Routledge, 2015. pp 94-98.

Dwivedi, Rama, and Nayeem Shwkat Khan. “A Peep Into the Bioscope.” *The Hindu*, 12

March 2012, www.thehindu.com/features/cinema/a-peep-into-the-

bioscope/article2984651.ece. Accessed 05 May 2016.

“Election.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2014, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/election. Accessed 14 Aug. 2014.

“Electronic Voting Machine.” *Election Commission of India*, 2017.

eci.gov.in/faqs/evm/general-qa/electronic-voting-machine-r2/, Accessed 28 Dec. 2017

“Embodiment.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/embodiment. Accessed 02 Nov.2016.

“Entertainment.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2018, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/entertainment. Accessed 06 May. 2018.

Finocchiaro, Maurice A. editor, and translator. *The Essential Galileo*. Hackett Publishing Company,2008.

Fischer –Lichte, et al. *Politics of Interweaving Performance Culture: Beyond Post Colonialism*. Routledge, 2014.

Fischer-Lichte, Erika. *Transformative Power of Performance: A New Aesthetics*. Translated by Saskya Iris Jain. Routledge, 2008.

Ford, Matt. “Giant Hologram of Turkish Prime Minister Delivers Speech : Welcome to 21st – Century Politics.”27 Jan.2014,www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2014/01/giant-hologram-of-turkish-prime-minister-delivers-speech/283374/.Accessed 28 Oct.2016.

“Forum.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016 , Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/forum. Accessed 04 Feb. 2016.

“Fountain.” *Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Moderna e Contemporanea. Viale delle Belle Arti*, 131-00197 Roma, Italy. 27 Dec. 2016.

“French Politician Appears in Seven Places at Once.” *BBC*, 20 April

2017,www.bbc.com/news/av/technology-39646761/french-politician-appears-in-seven-places-at-once. Accessed 02 May 2017.

Gabor, Dennis. “*Holography, 1948-1971.*” Nobel Lecture, Imperial Colleges of Science and Technology, London, 11 Dec. 1971, Lecture.

www.nobelprize.org/uploads/2018/06/gabor-lecture.pdf. Accessed 16 Oct.2016.

Giannachi, Gabriella. *The Politics of the New Media Theatre*. Routledge 2007.

Gloman, Chuck and Napoli, Rob. *Scenic Design and Lighting Techniques: A Basic Guide for Theatre*. Focal Press, 2007.

Groth, Helen. “Reading Victorian Illusions: Dickens’s Haunted Man and Dr. Pepper’s “Ghost” *Victorian Studies*, vol. 50, no. 1, 2007, pp. 43-65,
muse.jhu.edu/article/233192. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016.

Guha, Ramachandra. “Who Milks This Cow?” *Outlook*, 19 Nov.2012,

www.outlookindia.com/magazine/story/who-milks-this-cow/282904. Accessed 12 Dec. 2016.

Guru, Gopal and Sundar, Sarukkai. *The Cracked Mirror: An Indian Debate on Experience and Theory*. Oxford, 2012.

Halsman, Philippe.” *Self Portrait of Mona Lisa.*” Halsman, 2015,

philippehalsman.com/?image=dali. Accessed 03 May 2016.

Hill, Leslie.,and Helen Paris. *The Gurilla Guide to Performance Art*. Continuum,2004.

“Hologram.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2015,

Oxford.en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/hologram. Accessed 18 Mar.2015.

“Homogeneous.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/homogeneous. Accessed 25 Nov. 2016.

Huckfeldt, Robert and Sprague, John. *Citizens, Politics and Social Communication:*

Information and Influence in an Election Campaign. Cambridge University Press, 1995.

“Immaterial.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2015, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/immaterial. Accessed 10 Jan.2015.

“Introducing Gimmicks and Trick Scenes.” *Surabhi Theatre*, 2011,

surabhitheatre.com/surabhi.html. Accessed 18 Jun. 2015.

Issenberg, Sasha. *The Victory Lab: The Secret Science of Winning Campaigns Crown*.

Crown Publishers, 2012.

Jaffrelot, Christopher, et al. “Gujarat Elections: The Sub-Text of Mod’s ‘Hatrick’ –High

Tech Populism and the ‘Neo –middle Class.” *Studies in Indian Politics*, vol.01, issue

01, 2013, pp.79-95. doi:10.1177/2321023013482789. 2013. Accessed 14 July. 2015.

Jaffrelot, Christopher. “Narendra Modi and the Power of Television in Gujarat.” *Television*

and New Media, vol.16, no.04, 2015, pp. 346-353. doi:10.1177/1527476415575499.

Accessed 16 Nov. 2015.

Kapur, Geeta. “Dismantled Norms: Apropos other Avantgrades.” *Art and Social Change:*

Contemporary Art in Asia and the Pacific, edited by Caroline Turner, Pandanus

Books,2005.

Kapur, Geeta. “Public Address: Citing Installation and Performance Art.” *SSS Archive*, 31

March 2014, pp.01-26. www.jnu.ac.in/sss/archive-lectures.Accessed 15 Dec. 2014.

Kasu Rajagopal Reddy (Chairman and Director). *Musion*, 2015, www.*Musion* .co.in/about-

Musion/index.html.Accessed 15 Nov. 2015.

Kaur, Ravinder. “Good Times, Brought to You by Brand Modi.” *Television and New Media*,

vol.16, no.04, 2015, pp 323-330. doi:10.1177/1527476415575492.Accessed 16

Nov.2016

KHOJLIVE12 –An Evening of Live Performance. Collateral event of The India Art Fair, Blue

Frog The Kila, New Delhi 27 Jan. 2012.Brochure.

Kittler, Friedrich. "Universities: Wet, Hard, Soft, and Harder." *Special issue, Critical Inquiry*, vol. 31, no.1, 2004, pp. 244–55.

Kolappan, B. "The Hand Behind Modi's Magic." *The Hindu*, 27 April 2014, www.thehindu.com/elections/the-hand-behind-modis-magic/article5951545.ece. Accessed 22 Nov. 2015.

Kumar, Senthil. "Cinematographer UK Senthil Kumar and Narendra Modi Photoshoot." *International Business Times*, 2 Aug.2015, www.ibtimes.co.in/photos/cinematographer-uk-senthil-kumar-narendra-modi-photoshoot-3378-slide-24963. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016.

"Kurta." *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford. en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/kurta. Accessed 16 July. 2016.

Lee, Sook- Kyung.,and Susanne Rennert. editors. *NamJunePaik*. Tate Publishing with Tate Liverpool and Museum KunstPalast, Dusseldorf, 2010.

Lama-Rewal , Stephanie Tawa."Studying Election in India: Scientific and Political Debates." *Asia Multidisciplinary Academic Journal*, 2009,10.40000/samaj.2784. Accessed 12 Dec. 2018.

Lavender, Andy. *Performance in the Twenty –First Century: Theatre of Engagement*. Routledge, 2016.

Lazzarto, Maurizio. "Immaterial Labour", *Radical Thought in Italy: A Potential Politics*, edited by Paolo Virno and Michael Hardt, University of Minnesota Press, 1996, pp. 133-147.

Liang, Lawrence. "Censorship and Politics of Micro –Fascism." *Television and New Media*, vol.16, no.04, 2015, pp 388-393. doi:10.1177/1527476415573952. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016

"Materiality." *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/materiality. Accessed 25 Nov. 2016.

Mazzolent, Giampietro. "Populism and the Media." *Twenty-First Century Populism: The Spectre of Western European Democracy*. Edited by Daniele Albertazzi and Duncan McDonnell. Palgrave Macmillan, 2008. pp 49-64

McDermott, Catherine. *Design: The Key Concepts*. Routledge, 2007.

McLuhan, Marshall. *The Gutenberg Galaxy: The Making of Typographic Man*. University of Toronto Press, 1962.

Menon, Jaya. "Jaya's Holograph Campaign Set to Zap Rural Voters." *The Times of India*, 15 March 2016, timesofindia.indiatimes.com/elections-2016/tamil-nadu-elections-2016/news/Jayas-holograph-campaign-set-to-zap-rural-voters/articleshow/51409596.cms. Accessed 08 Jun. 2016.

Mitra, Anjan. "Dooradarshan Lavishes Finance on Producers Playing Narasimha Rao's 'Achievements.'" *India Today*, 15 March 1996, indiatoday.in/magazine/indiascope/story/19960315-dooradarshan-lavishes-finance-on-producers-playing-up-narasimha-rao-achievements-833084-1996-03-15. Accessed 20 Oct. 2015.

Mohan, Sriram. "Locating the "Internet Hindu": Political Speech and Performance in Indian Cyberspace." *Television and New Media*, vol.16, no.04, 2015, pp.339-345. doi:10.1177/1527476415575491. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016.

Morgan, Nigel. *Stage Lighting for Theatre Designers*. The Herbert Press Ltd, 1996.

Mudde, Cass and Rovira Kaltwasser, Cristobal. *Populism: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford University Press, 2017.

N P, Ullekh. *War Room: The People, Tactics and Technology Behind Narendra Mod's 2014 Win*. Roli Books, 2015.

Nair, Avinash. "And Then There Were 26: Modi Scripts His Gujarat 'Victory Sequel' in 3D

Now". *Indian Express Newspaper*, 3 December 2012.

archive.indianexpress.com/news/and-then-there-were-26-modi-scripts-his-gujarat--victory-sequel--in-3d-now/1039492/. Accessed 24 Dec. 2013.

Namo Gujarat. "Hon'ble CM Shri.Narendra Modi's 3D Holographic Speech on 29th Nov, 2012." *YouTube*, 02 December 2012.

www.youtube.com/watch?v=LRpflaqQnSY. Accessed 27 Dec. 2014.

"Narendra Modi: Triumph of the Will." *Open Magazine*. vol.6, issue20, 26 May 2014.

Nelson, Dean. "'Magic' Modi Uses Hologram to Address Dozen of Rallies at Once."

Telegraph, 2 May 2014,

www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/asia/india/10803961/.html. Accessed 16 Nov. 2015.

NMF News. "Watch: Narendra Modi's Hi-Tech Election Campaign with 3D." *You Tube*. 5

May 2014, www.youtube.com/watch?v=CPN5r_89e8A. Accessed 15 Jan. 2015.

"Nomination and Campaign." *Election commission of India*, 2018, eci.gov.in/about/about-eci/the-functions-electoral-system-of-india-r2/. Accessed 20 Dec. 2018.

Oddey, Alison and Christine White. *The Potentials of Spaces: The Theory and Practice of Scenography and Performance*. Intellect Books, 2006.

Ohm, Britta. "Organizing Popular Discourse with and Against the Media: Notes on the

Making of Narendra Modi and Recep Tayyip Erdogan as Leaders-Without-

Alternative." *Television and New Media*, vol.16, no.04, 2015,pp 370-

377,doi:10.1177/1527476415575906. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016

"Ostracon." Museum of Ancient Agora. Stoa of Attalos, Aens 1055, Greece .02 Sep.

2017.

Pal, Joyojeet. "Banalities Turned Viral: Narendra Modi and the Political Tweet." *Television*

and New Media, vol.16, no.04, 2015,pp 378-387,doi:10.1177/1527476415573956.

Accessed 16 Nov. 2016

Paulose, K.G.editor. *Vyangyavyakhya: The Aesthetics of Dhvani in Theatre*. Rashtriya Sanskrit Sansthan, 2013.

Pepper, John H. *The True History of the Ghost and All About Metempsychosis*. Cassell & Company, Limited, 1890. www.scribd.com/document/626289029/The-True-History-of-Pepper-Ghost. Accessed 28 Nov. 2016.

“Performance.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2016, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/performance. Accessed 16 May.2016.

Phelan, Peggy. *Unmarked: Politics of Performance*. Routledge, 2005.

Pinto, Stanley. “Narendra Modi’s 3D Avatar to Reach Voters Pan India.” *Times of India*, 7April2014,timesofindia.indiatimes.com/articleshow/33380152.cms?&utm_source=contentfinterest&utm_medium=text&utm_campaign=cppst. Accessed 26 Nov. 2015.

“Populism.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2017, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/populism. Accessed 28 Jun. 2017.

Price, Lance. *The Modi Effect: Inside Narendra Mod’s Campaign to Transform India*. Hodder and Stoughton Ltd, 2015.

Punathambekar, Aswin. “Satire, Elections, and Democratic Politics in Digital India.”

Television and New Media, vol.16, no.04, 2015, pp 394-400,

doi:10.1177/1527476415573953. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016

Quick, Andrew. *The Wooster Group Work Book*. Routledge, 2007.

Rajeevan,B.*Vakkukalum Vasthukkalum*.DC Books,2009.

Ramnarayan, Gowri. “Theatre is Revelation.” *The Hindu*, 24 Feb. 2008,

www.thehindu.com/todays-paper/tp-features/tp-sundaymagazine/Theatre-is-revelation/article15401453.ece.Accessed 29 April 2018.

“Sahamat 20 Years 1989 2009: A Document of Activities and Statements”.

Safdar Hashmi Memorial Trust,

2009.www.sahmat.org/20years%20of%20sahmat.pdf, Accessed by 14 Feb. 2018.

Sarno, David. “Twitter Creator Jack Dorsey Illuminates the Site’s Founding Document.

Part 1.”*Los Angeles Times*, 18 Feb. 2009, latimesblogs.latimes.com/technology/2009/02/twitter-creator.html Accessed 12 Mar. 2017.

“Scale.” *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2017, Oxford.

en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/scale. Accessed 15 May. 2017.

Schechner, Richard. *Performance Studies: An Introduction*. Routledge, 2002.

Schechner, Richard. *Performance Theory*. Routledge, 2003.

Shani, Ornit. *How India Became Democratic: Citizenship and the Making of the Universal Franchise*. Cambridge University Press, 2017.

“Shri Modi’s 3D Interaction Enters Guinness World Records.” *Narendra Modi*, 2013,

www.narendramodi.in/shri-modis-3d-interaction-enters-guinness-world-records-5166. Accessed 05 July 2014.

Signer, Michel. *Demagogue: The Fight to Save Democracy from its Worst Enemies*. Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

Somasekhar, M. “Politicians go Virtual with 3-D Tech.” *The Hindu Business Line*, 14 April 2014, www.thehindubusinessline.com/news/national/Politicians-go-virtual-with-3-D-tech/article20753458.ece. Accessed 25 May 2014.

Sridharan, Eswaran. “Behind Mod’s Victory.” *Journal of Democracy*, vol. 25, no. 4, 2014, pp.20-33. doi:10.1353/jod.2014.0068. Accessed 16 Nov. 2016.

Srivastava, Sanjay. “Modi-Masculinity: Media Manhood, and ‘Traditions’ in a Time of Consumerism.” *Television and New Media*, vol.16, no. 4,331-338. 10.1177/1527476415575498. Accessed 16 Nov.2016

- Tassi, Aldo. "Modernity as the Transformation of Truth into Meaning". *International Philosophical Quarterly*, vol. 22, Issue 3, 1982. pp.185-193.
<http://www.pdcnet.org/ipq>. Accessed 28 Jan.2014.
- "Technology." *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2014,Oxford.
www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/technology. Accessed 12 Jan. 2014.
- Thakurta, Tapati Guha . *In the Name of Goddess: Durga Pujas of Contemporary Kolkata*.
 Primus Books, 2015.
- Toadvine, Ted, and Lawlor, Leonard, editors. *The Merleau-Ponty Reader*. Northwestern
 University Press, 2007.
- Turner, Cathy, and Synne K Behrndt. *Dramaturgy and Performance*. Palgrave Macmillan
 2008.
- "Utility." *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2017, Oxford.
en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/utility. Accessed 06 May 2017.
- "UweMaass (Inventor)." *Musion*, 2015, Musion.co.in/about-Musion/index.html. Accessed
 15 Oct.2015.
- V6 News TV. "Hi-Tech Election Campaign by TRS Chief KCR."14 April 2014,
[v6news.tv/hi- tech-election-campaign-by-trs-chief-kcr](http://v6news.tv/hi-tech-election-campaign-by-trs-chief-kcr). Accessed 11 Sept.2016.
- "Values." *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2017, Oxford.
en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/values. Accessed 20 Mar. 2017.
- Virno, Paolo. *A Grammar of the Multitude: For an Analysis of Contemporary Forms of Life*.
 Translated by Lsabella Bertolotti, James Cascaito, Andrea Casson, Semiotext(e),
 2004.
- "Virtual." *English Oxford Living Dictionaries*, 2015, Oxford.
en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/virtual. Accessed 15 May. 2015.

Visvanathan, Shiv "The Remaking of Narendra Modi." India Seminar.com, India 2012 a symposium on the year that was, no.641, January 2013. www.india-seminar.com/2013/641/641_shiv_visvanathan.htm, Accessed 16 Nov. 2016.

Warrier, Shobha. "Meet the man who shot Narendra Modi in 3D hologram." *Rediff.com*, 05 May.2014, www.rediff.com/news/special/ls-election-meet-the-man-who-shot-narendra-modi-in-3d/20140505.htm. Accessed 08 Jun 2016.

Williams, Raymonds. *Television Technology and Cultural Form*. Routledge, 2003.

Worthen, W.B. "Drama, Performativity and Performance." *Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*, vol.113, no.5, 1998, pp.1093-1107.

Mediating Performance through 3D Holography: Performativity in Indian Electoral Campaigns

by Abheesh S S

Submission date: 26-Apr-2019 04:11PM (UTC+0530)

Submission ID: 1119592695

File name: h_3D_Holography_Performativity_in_Indian_Electoral_Campaigns.pdf (1.15M)

Word count: 41059

Character count: 230463

Mediating Performance through 3D Holography: Performativity in Indian Electoral Campaigns

ORIGINALITY REPORT

7 %	6 %	4 %	2 %
SIMILARITY INDEX	INTERNET SOURCES	PUBLICATIONS	STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	journals.sagepub.com Internet Source	1 %
2	teatrvmomnate.org Internet Source	1 %
3	Christophe Jaffrelot. "Narendra Modi and the Power of Television in Gujarat", Television & New Media, 2015 Publication	1 %
4	archive.financialexpress.com Internet Source	<1 %
5	epdf.tips Internet Source	<1 %
6	docplayer.net Internet Source	<1 %
7	Joyojeet Pal. "Banalities Turned Viral", Television & New Media, 2015 Publication	<1 %

rupkatha.com

8	Internet Source	<1 %
9	www.generation-online.org Internet Source	<1 %
10	dajialai.org Internet Source	<1 %
11	network7research.com Internet Source	<1 %
12	archive.thedailystar.net Internet Source	<1 %
13	"Carnal Knowledge: What the Wisdom of the Body Has To Offer Psychotherapy", Journal of Humanistic Psychology, 01/01/1975 Publication	<1 %
14	optimistebooks.blogspot.com Internet Source	<1 %
15	curis.ku.dk Internet Source	<1 %
16	media.proquest.com Internet Source	<1 %
17	www.popularinquiry.com Internet Source	<1 %
18	warehouse.industries Internet Source	<1 %

19	www.maxhell.org Internet Source	<1 %
20	Liang, L.. "Censorship and the Politics of Micro-Fascism", Television & New Media, 2015. Publication	<1 %
21	www.jnu.ac.in Internet Source	<1 %
22	Submitted to Chester College of Higher Education Student Paper	<1 %
23	archive.dailypioneer.com Internet Source	<1 %
24	lawlib.shirazu.ac.ir:8080 Internet Source	<1 %
25	Submitted to Canterbury Christ Church University Student Paper	<1 %
26	Britta Ohm. "Organizing Popular Discourse with and against the Media", Television & New Media, 2015 Publication	<1 %
27	Submitted to Bath Spa University College Student Paper	<1 %
28	Submitted to Leiden University Student Paper	<1 %

29	issuu.com Internet Source	<1 %
30	www.performancephilosophy.org Internet Source	<1 %
31	Submitted to University of Newcastle upon Tyne Student Paper	<1 %
32	hyperritual.com Internet Source	<1 %
33	www.vsalr.org Internet Source	<1 %
34	vasulka.org Internet Source	<1 %
35	we.riseup.net Internet Source	<1 %
36	pure.uva.nl Internet Source	<1 %
37	www.blackwellpublishing.com Internet Source	<1 %
38	culturemachine.net Internet Source	<1 %
39	Submitted to Laureate Higher Education Group Student Paper	<1 %

Claire Maria Chambers. "Chapter 3 Intercultural

40	Performance and the Apophatics of", Springer Nature, 2017 Publication	<1%
41	Submitted to University of Kent at Canterbury Student Paper	<1%
42	books.google.co.uk Internet Source	<1%
43	M.G. Renu Cappelli. " <i>How to See a Work of Art in Total Darkness</i> . By Darby English. Cambridge: MIT Press, 2007; 384 pp.; illustrations. \$30.00 cloth", TDR/The Drama Review, 03/2009 Publication	<1%
44	"Theatre and Ghosts", Springer Nature, 2014 Publication	<1%

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches < 14 words

Exclude bibliography On